



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: October 9, 2014 REPORT NO. HRB-14-065

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of October 23, 2014

SUBJECT: **ITEM #12 – Eva Hill and Pantages, Mills & Shreve Company
Spec House #1**

APPLICANT: Lawrence Katz and Carolina Finch represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 1007 Cordova Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Eva Hill and Pantages, Mills & Shreve Company Spec House #1 located at 1007 Cordova Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Eva Hill and Pantages, Mills & Shreve Company Spec House #1 located at 1007 Cordova Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criteria A and C. The designation excludes the 425 square foot rear addition and the 1,096 square foot detached garage with guest quarters above. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource is a special element of Sunset Cliffs' historical, cultural and architectural development and retains integrity. Specifically, the resource is one of the oldest remaining Spanish Eclectic styled single-family homes still in existence which exemplifies the Sunset Cliffs vision or ideal for subdivision development.
2. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits gable roofs with clay tile, overhanging eaves and exposed rafter tails; moderately textured stucco over wood frame construction; a tapered, rounded chimney in the gable end finished with arched openings and clay tile roofing; a second floor wood balcony; a main entry recessed behind three stucco arched openings and accessed via a large, arched staircase; and fenestration consisting primarily of paired 8-lite wood frame and sash casement windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is located on APN 531-020-13-00 on a large, prominent corner lot in the residential subdivision of Sunset Cliffs. The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Eva Hill and Pantages, Mills & Shreve Company Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the individuals who jointly constructed the house as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A and C, and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The roots of the Sunset Cliffs subdivision lie in the land formerly owned by Albert Goodwill Spalding, the wealthy sporting goods magnate; however, Spalding's death in 1915 forced his family to sell the property. Between 1915 and 1924, the Sunset Cliffs area was largely left neglected and was "beginning to deteriorate" until John Mills arrived in San Diego. Mills was business partners with Alexander Pantages and Jesse Shreve. Together, they formed the Pantages, Mills & Shreve Company. Mills' vision for Sunset Cliffs was the creation of an elegant residential subdivision designed in the Spanish Eclectic style, with gracefully winding streets and ornamental lamp posts. In March 1926, the Pantages, Mills & Shreve Company put up lots for sale within the subdivision. Unfortunately, the stock market crash of late 1927 crushed the Mills organization and the company was forced to surrender its remaining properties in the wake of the Great Depression.

Eva Hill purchased the subject property in 1927 and developed it that same year in conjunction with the Pantages, Mills & Shreve Company as a speculative or "Spec" house. Glen Funcheon, who designed and built several of the earliest homes in Sunset Cliffs, served as the architect and builder. The home was designed in the Spanish style, in keeping with the subdivision's conditions, restrictions and reservations. The subject property possesses special elements of development which are distinct among other homes in the Sunset Cliffs subdivision and surpass the usual in significance. The home was built as an impressive Spanish Eclectic style home in order to draw prospective buyers to the Sunset Cliffs subdivision. The building's 1927 date of construction; strategic key location at the corner of Cordova and Hill Streets; its siting on a large double lot; light-color Spanish style exterior; red tile roof; and easily recognizable affiliation to

the Sunset Cliffs community are all key characteristics which surpass other homes built thereafter in the neighborhood. The characteristics are special “hallmark” elements of early model-home subdivision development.

Significance Statement: Historical research into the development of the Sunset Cliffs subdivision indicates that the subject property is one of the oldest remaining Spanish Eclectic styled single-family homes still in existence which exemplifies the Sunset Cliffs vision or ideal for subdivision development. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion A as a special element of Sunset Cliffs’ historical, cultural and architectural development.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Historical research indicates that San Diego Mayor Percy J. Benbough lived at the subject property from 1928-1932. Benbough had a long history of service to San Diego beginning with his election to the San Diego City Council in 1913, a position he held until 1917. He also served as Chief of the Fire Department as well and was active in many civic and community organizations during his life in San Diego. He served as Chief of Police for the San Diego Police Department in 1931 and as Mayor of San Diego from 1935-1942. In July 2006, the HRB Designated the *Percy Benbough/William Wheeler House* at 2174 Guy Street, in part under HRB Criterion B for an association with Benbough who lived in that residence from 1938-1942. The HRB found that this period of occupancy corresponded to Benbough’s period of significance as a historically significant individual. As such, because Benbough lived at the subject property proper to his acknowledged period of significance, and the HRB has previously determined that the 2174 Guy Street property best illustrates Benbough’s historic achievements, the subject property does not derive significance from an association with him. None of the other persons identified with the property performed any activities, achievements or contributions which were demonstrably important within the City, state or nation. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property located at 1007 Cordova Street was constructed in 1927 and features a long, irregular floorplan sited prominently to the street; two story sections at the north and south ends connected by a one story section through the center; gable roofs with clay tile, overhanging eaves and exposed rafter tails; moderately textured stucco over wood frame construction; and a concrete foundation. To the far north end is a two story front-gable element with a tapered, rounded chimney in the gable end finished with arched openings and clay tile roofing, resembling a lite house. The chimney is flanked by pairs of 8-lite wood frame and sash casement windows. To the left is a second floor wood balcony, which has been enclosed with glass. To the right of the two story element is the one main entry, recessed behind three stucco arched openings and accessed via a large, arched staircase. Paired 8-lite wood frame and sash casement windows are found across the main façade. At the far south end is another two story front-gable element, which originally included a second floor over an attached garage.

The house has undergone a number of modifications over the years, including the aforementioned balcony enclosure at the north end (date unknown); construction of a one story, front-gable addition to the front of the garage sometime prior to 1953; the removal of the original concrete walkway to accommodate a new circular driveway sometime between 1964 and 1972; a 425 square foot rear addition in 2001-2003; conversion of the garage to habitable space and construction of a balcony above between 2002 and 2004 (which also resulted in the second floor windows being changed to doors); construction of a covered porch down the side of the former garage in 2004; construction of a site wall in 2005; and construction of a detached two story guest quarters over a garage in 2008. Although some are visible, the alterations do not significantly detract from this large home's ability to convey its significance as a Spanish Eclectic style structure.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including gable roofs with clay tile, overhanging eaves and exposed rafter tails; moderately textured stucco over wood frame construction; a tapered, rounded chimney in the gable end finished with arched openings and clay tile roofing; a second floor wood balcony; a main entry recessed behind three stucco arched openings and accessed via a large, arched staircase; and fenestration consisting primarily of paired 8-lite wood frame and sash casement windows. Despite the alterations, the house retains overall integrity of design, materials, workmanship and feeling. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property at 1007 Cordova Street was designed and built by Glen Funcheon, who designed and built several homes within the Sunset Cliffs subdivision. Funcheon has not been established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Architect, Designer or Builder, and there is insufficient information to designate him as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 1007 Cordova Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 1007 Cordova Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Eva Hill and Pantages, Mills & Shreve Company Spec House #1 located at 1007 Cordova Street be designated with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion A as a resource that reflects special elements of Sunset Cliffs' historical, cultural and architectural development; and Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style. The designation excludes the 425 square foot rear addition and the 1,096 square foot detached garage with guest quarters above. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Deputy Director/HRB Liaison

KS/cw

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Historic Aerials for 1007 Cordova Street
3. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 10/23/2014

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 10/23/2014, to consider the historical designation of the **Eva Hill and Pantages, Mills & Shreve Company Spec House #1** (owned by Lawrence Katz and Carolina Finch, 1007 Cordova Street, San Diego, CA 92107) located at **1007 Cordova Street, San Diego, CA 92007**, APN: **531-020-13-00**, further described as BLK 25 LOTS 14 & 15 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Eva Hill and Pantages, Mills & Shreve Company Spec House #1 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION A as a resource that reflects a special element of Sunset Cliffs' historical, cultural and architectural development and retains integrity to its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource is one of the oldest remaining Spanish Eclectic styled single-family homes still in existence which exemplifies the Sunset Cliffs vision or ideal for subdivision development. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits gable roofs with clay tile, overhanging eaves and exposed rafter tails; moderately textured stucco over wood frame construction; a tapered, rounding chimney in the gable end finished with arched openings and clay tile roofing; a second floor wood balcony; a main entry recessed behind three stucco arched openings and accessed via a large, arched staircase; and fenestration consisting primarily of paired 8-lite wood frame and sash casement windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 425 square foot rear addition and the 1,096 square foot detached garage with guest quarters above.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney

1007 CORDOVA STREET AERIALS



1953



1964



1972



2002



2004