



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: January 9, 2014 REPORT NO. HRB-14-003

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of January 23, 2014

SUBJECT: **ITEM #9 – John and Evelyn Rice/Arthur Keyes House**

APPLICANT: Deliz Family Trust represented by Allan Hazard & Janet O'Dea

LOCATION: 3565 Third Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the John and Evelyn Rice/Arthur Keyes House located at 3565 Third Avenue as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the John and Evelyn Rice/Arthur Keyes House located at 3565 Third Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1913 under HRB Criteria C and D. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1913 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a moderate pitch gable roof form with wide eave overhang, exposed rafters and decorative triangular knee braces; combination of wood shingle siding on the second story with extensive brick cladding on the first story and exterior chimney; original brick walkways and site walls; and fenestration consisting primarily of wood double hung windows with a mixture of Chicago-style, hopper, and unique wood sliding windows.
2. The resource is representative of a notable work of proposed Master Builder Arthur Keyes and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource reflects an example of Keyes' work in the Craftsman style and demonstrates an emphasis on quality design and craftsmanship.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a two and a half story Craftsman style single family residence built in 1913 on the east side of Third Avenue just south of Brookes Avenue in the Loma Grande subdivision in the Uptown Community. The 2007-2012 Draft Uptown Survey has assigned a status code of 5S3, "Appears to be individually eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the John and Evelyn Rice/Arthur Keyes House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of John and Evelyn Rice, who constructed the house as their personal residence, and the name of Arthur Keyes, a proposed Master Builder.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Allan Hazard & Janet O'Dea, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a two and a half story Craftsman style residence built in 1913 of above standard wood frame construction on a brick and concrete foundation. The building features a medium-pitch gable roof of composite shingle with wide overhanging eaves, exposed rafter tails and decorative triangular knee braces; and a flat roofed single story portion with deck to the rear of the lot. The building's appearance is characterized by wood shingle siding on the second story, with an abundance of brick work reserved for the first story, walkways and site walls. The wood clad second story mass almost hovers above the first, supported by tapered brick pilasters and exposed floor joists. An imposing brick chimney dominates the primary façade, uniting the second floor to the first.

The main entry to the residence is accessed from the south side of the building, via a set of brick stairs and walkway leading to the pergola, entry porch and mahogany front door with sidelights. Fenestration consists primarily of 1 over 1 wood double hung windows, including a number of Chicago-style windows, a 4-lite hopper window, and sets of unique 4 over 1 wood slider windows. A brick clad detached garage is located behind the residence and accessed from the rear alley.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched,

gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

The property retains excellent integrity and the historic report lists no remarkable modifications besides benign utility upgrades. The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style by embodying the character defining features of the style including the moderate pitch gable roof form with wide eave overhang, exposed rafters and decorative triangular knee braces; combination of wood shingle siding on the second story with extensive brick cladding on the first story and exterior chimney; original brick walkways and site walls; and fenestration consisting primarily of wood double hung windows with a mixture of Chicago-style, hopper, and unique wood sliding windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Born the son of a wagon maker turned carpenter in 1877 in New York, Arthur Keyes arrived in Los Angeles by 1896 where he worked as a draftsman, carpenter and builder. By 1909, Keyes had moved to San Diego and began his local career as a building contractor. He continued to work and live in and around San Diego until his death in 1960. The report states that Keyes is established as a Master Builder by the City of San Diego; however this listing of Keyes as a Master Builder on the City's website appears to have been in error. Arthur Keyes is known to have built three houses listed on the City of San Diego's local register, but according to documents relating to their historic designation, he has not been formally recognized and established as a Master Builder by the City. Staff believes however that although not many examples of his work are presently known, Keyes' body of work is attractively diverse and maintains a level of quality of craftsmanship worthy of recognition.

Arthur Keyes is known for having built homes in a variety of styles and for prominent architects including Richard Requa, the Quayle brothers, and Gustav Hanssen (see photo attachments). Historically designated homes within the City of San Diego that were built by Keyes include the Otis Residence at 3255 Second Avenue (HRB Site #173), built in the Tudor Revival style in 1910 and designed by Gustav Hanssen; the Ralph D. Lcoe House at 430 Spruce Street (HRB Site #399), built in the Spanish Eclectic style in 1922 and designed by the Quayle brothers; and the Milton F. Heller Residence/Casa Marrero at 3107 Zola Street (HRB Site #360), built in the Italian Renaissance style in 1927 and designed by Richard Requa. He is also known to have done work in Coronado including construction of the historically designated Site #111, the D.E. Mann Residence at 1045 Loma Avenue – a Mission Revival style home designed by Richard Requa and built in 1926. All the known examples of Arthur Keyes' work demonstrate a high level of quality and attention to detail that was evidently recognized by his architect colleagues in the industry.

The subject resource was constructed by Keyes fairly early in his career in San Diego. The resource's above standard construction and high level of architectural detail effectively reveals

his penchant for quality design and craftsmanship in the context of custom home building. The house exhibits well executed Craftsman features including the triangular knee braces, rafter tails, floor joists, and meticulous brickwork throughout. Among known Keyes-built structures, the subject resource is one of the oldest and the first example of a pure Craftsman style residence. Therefore staff recommends that the Board establish Arthur Keyes as a Master Builder and designate the subject property under HRB Criterion D as a representative and notable work of Arthur Keyes.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the John and Evelyn Rice/Arthur Keyes House located at 3565 Third Avenue be designated with a period of significance of 1913 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Craftsman style, and Criterion D as a notable work of Master Builder Arthur Keyes. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Camille Pekarek
Junior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Interim Deputy Director/HRB Liaison

CP/cw

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Photo of 1910 Keyes-built residence at 3255 Second Ave (HRB Site #173)
3. Photo of 1922 Keyes-built residence at 430 Spruce St (HRB Site #399)
4. Photo of 1927 Keyes-built residence at 3107 Zola St (HRB Site #360)
5. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 1/23/2014

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/23/2014, to consider the historical designation of the **John and Evelyn Rice/Arthur Keyes House** (owned by Deliz Family Trust, 3565 Third Avenue, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **3565 Third Avenue, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **452-402-33-00**, further described as BLK 2 LOTS 1 & 2 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the John and Evelyn Rice/Arthur Keyes House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1913 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a moderate pitch gable roof form with wide eave overhang, exposed rafters and decorative triangular knee braces; combination of wood shingle siding on the second story with extensive brick cladding on the first story and exterior chimney; original brick walkways and site walls; and fenestration consisting primarily of wood double hung windows with a mixture of Chicago-style, hopper, and unique wood sliding windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Builder Arthur Keyes and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource reflects an example of Keyes' work in the Craftsman style and demonstrates an emphasis on quality design and craftsmanship. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney



Attachment 2: 1910 Keyes-built residence at 3255 Second Ave (HRB Site #173)



Attachment 3: 1922 Keyes-built residence at 430 Spruce St (HRB Site #399)



Attachment 4: 1927 Keyes-built residence at 3107 Zola St (HRB Site #360)



Subject resource: 1913 Keyes-built residence at 3565 Third Avenue