

LA JOLLA DEVELOPMENT PERMIT REVIEW COMMITTEE
LA JOLLA COMMUNITY PLANNING ASSOCIATION

AGENDA FOR TUESDAY, MAY 19, 2015
Revision 1

LA JOLLA RECREATION CENTER
615 PROSPECT STREET, RM 1
4:00 PM

1. NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

Issues not on agenda and within LJ DPR jurisdiction. Two minutes maximum per person.

2. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Meeting May 12, 2015

3. CORRECTION OR AMENDMENT OF MOTION AND MINUTES of January 13, 2015, in regards to the matter of HLJH CDP, 820 Rushville Street, Project 393983. The minutes and report follow:

PRELIMINARY REVIEW (12/9/14)

Note: Preliminary Reviews can be voted a Final Review by a unanimous DPR Committee approval.

Project Name:	HLJH CDP	Permits:	CDP
	820 Rushville Street	DPM:	John Fisher, (619) 446-5231
Project #:	393983		jsfisher@sandiego.gov
Zone:	RS-1-1	Applicant:	Dominique Houriet
			619-454-7306

LA JOLLA Coastal Development Permit (Process 2) to demolish an existing single family residence and detached accessory structure and construct a 2,607 sq ft, 2-story single family residence with an 841 sq ft attached garage at 820 Rushville St. The 0.092 acre site is in the RM-1-1 Zone, Coastal (Non-appealable) Overlay Zone within the La Jolla Community Plan Area.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION 12/09/14: (Dominique Houriet)

The proposed project was presented. The site is adjacent to an alley to the east, and the site constraints were reviewed. The landscaped area is approximately 1300 sf (30%). The proposed residence is 2607 sf: FAR = 0.65. The building will have a green roof and solar collectors. The exterior walls will be a composition of concrete masonry with wood and glass infill.

If a Sign Language Interpreter, aids for the visually impaired, or Assisted Listening Devices (ALDs) are required, please contact the City's Disability Services Coordinator at 619-321-3208 at least (5) five work days prior to the meeting date to ensure availability.

The agenda and meeting minutes are available online at www.lajollacpa.org.
For additional information please contact Paul from Alcorn & Benton Architects at paul@alcornbenton.com or 858-459-0805.

The garage is considered an accessory building that does not have to observe the required setbacks. The design appears to encroach into the setbacks including no setback at the alley. The garage is served from the alley.

DISCUSSION 12/09/14

A discussion ensued about the intensity of the proposed development. The proposal appears to maximize the allowable development of the site, including the maximum encroachment into setbacks wherever possible and the maximum amount of floor area. The addition of the green roof is a nice amenity, but it does not compensate for the intensity of development.

The proposed landscape design is not provided, but it was made clear that the applicant wishes to provide screening landscaping toward the street, as high as possible. The presenter would research what the limits are to a fence height fronting the street.

Please provide for the next presentation:

- a. Review the side yard setback for a garage approached from the alley.*
- b. Review the setbacks for an accessory building.*
- c. Please provide the justification that demonstrates that the Garage is an accessory building.*
- d. Review the heights of landscaping and fences in the front yard.*
- e. Provide a copy of the historic study about this existing home.*
- f. Provide a study of other homes in this neighborhood that reviews the density, FAR, and setbacks of those homes.*
- g. Please provide colored renderings of the proposed design, in relation to the homes in the immediate vicinity.*

APPLICANT PRESENTATION 12/16/14: (Dominique Houriet)

The proposed project was presented, with responses to the additional information requested. As to the garage setback from the alley: SDMC Diagram 131-04C shows the required setback of the driveway from Bishop's Lane. As to the other garage setbacks, per SDMC 131.0448.c and 131.0461.a.12: for lots less than 10,000 sf, the setback may be reduced for a structure that is less than 15' high, less than 30' deep, and no more than 525 sf. SDMC 142.0310.3 and Diagram 142-03A allows a fence at the front and street side yards up to 3' high that is solid, and per SDMC 142.0310.c.2.C with an upper portion that is a minimum of 75% open up to 6' high. The site is adjacent to an alley (Bishop's Lane) to the east, and the site constraints were reviewed. The front improvements include a deck that observes a reduced front yard setback on 50% of the frontage. The proposed residence is 3007 sf including the 458 sf of the garage: FAR = 0.65 where the maximum allowable FAR is 0.75. The area of the garage is reduced from 841 sf to 458 sf, and that area is included in the FAR calculations.

The exterior siding is changed to a cedar siding with the joints in a vertical pattern. The various uses of the roof and the exterior spaces were reviewed.

DISCUSSION 12/16/14

A discussion ensued about the intensity of the proposed development. The scale of the house in relation to the other houses on Rushville, as well as the facility to the east, were discussed.

A neighbor to the west described the garden walls and existing trees on the property. Stormwater control and drainage are first collected to a system that serves all exterior yards next to the house. The design of the foundation system was described, and the technique for bridging the existing sewer line, including a dedicated sewer easement across the rear yard setback.

If a Sign Language Interpreter, aids for the visually impaired, or Assisted Listening Devices (ALDs) are required, please contact the City's Disability Services Coordinator at 619-321-3208 at least (5) five work days prior to the meeting date to ensure availability.

SUBCOMMITTEE MOTION 12/16/14: Findings CAN be made for a Coastal Development Permit and Site Development Permit to demolish an existing single family residence and detached accessory structure and construct a 3,007 sq ft, 2-story single family residence with an 458 sq ft attached garage at 820 Rushville St. (Will / Collins 4-5-0)

In Favor: Collins, Mapes, Will

Oppose: Costello, Kane, Leira, Ragsdale, Welsh*, Benton (Chair)

Abstain: none

Motion Fails.

SUBCOMMITTEE MOTION 12/16/14: Findings CAN NOT be made for a Coastal Development Permit and Site Development Permit to demolish an existing single family residence and detached accessory structure and construct a 3,007 sq ft, 2-story single family residence with an 458 sq ft attached garage at 820 Rushville St. This is based upon the finding that the proposed project is not consistent with the neighborhood character, due to the scale of the openings at the exterior walls, the use of overly simple large-scale rectangular shapes at the exterior finishes such as the wood siding and the concrete masonry wall elements, the long bands of windows and openings, the flat roof and parapet, and due to the imposing nature of the exterior deck and guard rail elements.

(Costello / Kane 5-4-0)

In Favor: Costello, Kane, Leira, Ragsdale, Welsh*, Benton (Chair)

Oppose: Collins, Mapes, Will

Abstain: none

Motion Passes.

**Votes by Welsh amended in review of the Minutes on January 13, 2015.*

4. FINAL REVIEW 5/12/15 (previously reviewed 4/21/15)

Project Name: 1111 Prospect Street PDP

1111 Prospect Street

Project #: 403401

Zone: LJPDO 1

Permits: PDP, CDP & SDP

DPM: Morris Dye

mdye@san Diego.gov

Applicant:

(Process 4) Planned Development Permit to deviate from the development regulations of the La Jolla Planned District to allow 50% office use on the ground floor where a maximum of 25% office use is allowed at an existing 33,485 sf Retail/Office Building located at 1111 Prospect Street. The 0.475 acre site is in Zone 1 of the La Jolla Planned District, Coastal (Non-appealable) Overlay Zone within the La Jolla Community Plan Area.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION 4/21/15: (Marcela Escobar-Eck)

The site used to be a hotel, then a Victoria's Secret. It has been difficult to find tenants and the site has been vacant for 3 years. They seek a Process 4 deviation from the LJPDO to allow 50 percent office use on the ground floor where a maximum of 25 percent office use is allowed, and to allow greater than 25% street frontage for office. The LJPDO requires minimum of 50 percent of the ground floor be retail, 75 percent of the structures street frontage length be retail and a maximum of 25 percent of the ground floor be for office use and a maximum street frontage length restriction of 25 percent. PDO Committee voted the Project did not conform. The Applicant passed out a well written four page statement about Findings and rationale. Also presented were two pages of drawings clearly showing the site plan, dimensions, and use.

If a Sign Language Interpreter, aids for the visually impaired, or Assisted Listening Devices (ALDs) are required, please contact the City's Disability Services Coordinator at 619-321-3208 at least (5) five work days prior to the meeting date to ensure availability.

DISCUSSION:

There was a great deal of discussion by the Applicant, the DPR Members and the Public about strategies and permutations of mixes of retail/office in frontage and space. There was interest in the visitors' center. DPR Members and the Public had several suggested mixes of use.

Please Provide for FINAL REVIEW.

- a. Please return to the PDO Committee, meet 25% frontage requirement or other options.
- b. Continue to seek prospect frontage.
- c. Study office to visitor serving areas.
- d. Identify uses up and down the streets, one block each Prospect and Herschel.
- e. Provide street view renderings / visual simulation of proposed uses.

5. PRELIMINARY REVIEW 5/12/15

Note: Preliminary Reviews can be voted a Final Review by a unanimous DPR Committee approval.

Project Name:	Ngala Residence	Permits:	SCR CDP & SDP
	5612 – 5646 Rutgers Road	DPM:	John Fisher, (619) 446-5231
Project #:	395794		jsfisher@sandiego.gov
	Zone: RS-1-4	Applicant:	Mark Brencick, (858) 587-8070

La Jolla SAP No. 24005279 (Process 2) Coastal Development Permit for proposed Lot Line Adjustments of approximately 6327 sq ft from 5612 - 5646 Rutgers Rd and 1511 Copa de Oro to 1550 Via Corona. The 26,082 sq ft site is located in the La Jolla Community Plan area and the Coastal Non-Appealable Overlay zone.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION 5/19/15 (Mark Brencick)

The project location and the purpose of the application were reviewed. It was noted that the boundary adjustment was requested to resolve a dispute between owners of adjacent residential properties, with a requirement that the two affected lots will be consolidated into one lot. Lot 78 is presently substandard and will be reduced in area from 9794 sf to 8820 sf, to an FAR of 0.33. All other lots will be minimum 10,000 sf in area. The project affects the FAR of all properties in which the boundary is adjusted: the greatest resulting FAR of all properties is 0.43, which in all cases is less than the allowable FAR.

SUBCOMMITTEE MOTION 5/19/15: The Committee wishes to consider this Preliminary Presentation as sufficient to make a finding and recommendation for this project. A unanimous vote is required.

(Will / Ragsdale 3-5-2)

In Favor: Costello, Will, Ragsdale

Oppose: Collins, Costello, Kane, Mapes, Ragsdale

Abstain: Benton, as Chair, Welsh

Motion Fails for lack of a unanimous vote.

A discussion ensued about the effect of the reduction of the lot areas, and the significance of the reduction in area of Lot 78.

Please Provide for FINAL REVIEW.

- a. Please provide additional information indicating that all of the affected property owners are aware of and in concurrence with the proposed boundary adjustment.
- b. Please clarify if it is proposed that the substandard lot 78 will be reduced in size, worsening a substandard condition.

If a Sign Language Interpreter, aids for the visually impaired, or Assisted Listening Devices (ALDs) are required, please contact the City's Disability Services Coordinator at 619-321-3208 at least (5) five work days prior to the meeting date to ensure availability.

6. FINAL REVIEW 5/19/15 (Previously reviewed 5/12/15)

Project Name:	Hudson Residence	Permits:	CDP & SDP
	6435 Camino De La Costa	DPM:	Morris Dye, (619) 446-5245
Project #:	412226		mdye@sandiego.gov
Zone:	RS-1-7	Applicant:	Caitlin Kelly 858-344-2404

La Jolla (Process 3) Coastal Development permit to demolish an existing residence and construct a new 5,606 sq ft residence and pool located at 6435 Camino De La Costa. The 0.239 acre site is located in the RS-1-7 zone and Coastal Overlay Zone (Appealable) within the La Jolla Community Plan Area.

NOTE: A typographic error in the Agenda indicated the wrong address in one location: this item will not be voted upon until a later meeting.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION 5/12/15 (Caitlin Kelly, Brian Grove)

The project was presented. The site is 10,397 sf: the FAR is 0.54; LC is 0.40. The minimum side yard setbacks are 6'-5" minimum and are exceeded by providing 7' setbacks at both side yards. The project includes a 4-car garage with 2 tandem spaces. The highest point is 29'-6" above grade.

The materials sample board was presented. The roof will be barrel tile in a range of colors, smooth finish stucco, with reddish brown and brown window and trim colors.

The landscape architect presented the site development concept, with the outdoor kitchen, patio area, stone pavement, and swimming pool. The large plantings were reviewed. The landscaped area is 23% of the site.

The curb cut is 12' wide, leading to a garage that is below the main floor of the house and classified as a basement. The design is stepped into the slope.

The locations of the equipment for the air conditioners and the swimming pool and spa were reviewed.

Drawings were presented with a discussion of the location and configuration of the swimming pool, which will be at the same location. The spa will be at a higher elevation than the swimming pool. The spa is located within the rear yard setback. The height of the proposed house and the relation to the existing were discussed.

The entry gate for the driveway is set back the front yard setback distance.

Public Comment: A neighbor discussed the effect of the project on her residence, and the improvements on the property in those areas adjacent to her property.

Please Provide for FINAL REVIEW:

- Please provide a drawing that shows the relationship of the proposed to the existing.
- Please provide a drawing or photo composition showing the proposed project facing the street in relation to the neighbors on this side and the opposite side of the street, extending 3 houses on each side.
- Please provide specific locations of pool equipment, air conditioning equipment, and noise mitigation measures.
- Please provide a study of the landscape mature growth height with walls at the rear of the property.

7. FINAL REVIEW 5/19/15 (Previously reviewed 5/12/15)

Project Name:	Shahbaz Residence EOT	Permits:	CDP & SDP
	6412 Avenida Manana	DPM:	Tim Daly, (619) 446-5356
Project #:	216575		tdaly@sandiego.gov
Zone:	RS-1-5	Applicant:	Bejan Arfaa

If a Sign Language Interpreter, aids for the visually impaired, or Assisted Listening Devices (ALDs) are required, please contact the City's Disability Services Coordinator at 619-321-3208 at least (5) five work days prior to the meeting date to ensure availability.

