

COMMISSION ON POLICE PRACTICES

Wednesday, March 5, 2025

5:00pm-8:00pm

**REGULAR BUSINESS MEETING
AGENDA**

Southeastern Live Well San Diego

**5101 Market Street,
San Diego, CA 92114**

PURPOSE OF THE COMMISSION ON POLICE PRACTICES

The purpose of the Commission on Police Practices (CPP or Commission) is to provide independent community oversight of SDPD, directed at increasing community trust in SDPD & increasing safety for community and officers. The purpose of the Commission is also to perform independent investigations of officer-involved shootings, in-custody deaths and other significant incidents, and an unbiased evaluation of all complaints against members of SDPD and its personnel in a process that will be transparent and accountable to the community. Lastly, the Commission also evaluates the review of all SDPD policies, practices, trainings, and protocols and represents the community in making recommendations for changes.

The Commission on Police Practices (Commission) meetings will be conducted pursuant to the provisions of California Government Code Section 54953 (a), as amended by Assembly Bill 2249.

The Commission business meetings will be in person and the meeting will be open for in-person testimony. Additionally, we are continuing to provide alternatives to in-person attendance for participating in our meetings. In lieu of in-person attendance, members of the public may also participate via telephone/Zoom.

The link to join the meeting by computer, tablet, or smartphone at 5:00pm is:

<https://sandiego.zoomgov.com/j/1610950576>

Meeting ID: 161 095 0576

In-Person Public Comment on an Agenda Item: If you wish to address the Commission on an item on today's agenda, please complete and submit a speaker slip before the Commission hears the agenda item. You will be called at the time the item is heard. Each speaker must file a speaker slip with the Executive Director at the meeting at which the speaker wishes to speak indicating which item they

wish to speak on. Speaker slips may not be turned in prior to the day of the meeting or after completion of in-person testimony. In-person public comment will conclude before virtual testimony begins. Each speaker who wishes to address the Commission must state who they are representing if they represent an organization or another person.

For discussion and information items each speaker may speak up to three (3) minutes, subject to the Chair's determination of the time available for meeting management purposes, in addition to any time ceded by other members of the public who are present at the meeting and have submitted a speaker slip ceding their time. These speaker slips should be submitted together at one time to the Executive Director. The Chair may also limit organized group presentations of five or more people to 15 minutes or less.

In-Person Public Comment on Matters Not on the Agenda: You may address the Commission on any matter not listed on today's agenda. Please complete and submit a speaker slip. However, California's open meeting laws do not permit the Commission to discuss or take any action on the matter at today's meeting. At its discretion, the Commission may add the item to a future meeting agenda or refer the matter to staff or committee. Public comments are limited to three minutes per speaker. At the discretion of the Chair, if a large number of people wish to speak on the same item, comments may be limited to a set period of time per item to appropriately manage the meeting and ensure the Commission has time to consider all the agenda items. A member of the public may only make one Non-Agenda Public Comment per meeting. In-person public comment on items not on the agenda will conclude before virtual testimony begins.

Virtual Platform Public Comment to a Particular Item or Matters Not on the Agenda: When the Chair introduces the item you would like to comment on (or indicates it is time for Non-Agenda Public Comment), raise your hand by either tapping the "Raise Your Hand" button on your computer, tablet, or Smartphone, or by dialing *9 on your phone. You will be taken in the order in which you raised your hand. You may only make one Non-Agenda Public Comment per meeting. When the Chair indicates it is your turn to speak, click the unmute prompt that will appear on your computer, tablet or Smartphone, or dial *6 on your phone. The virtual queue will close when the last virtual speaker finishes speaking or 5 minutes after in-person testimony ends, whichever happens first.

Written Comment through Webform: Comment on agenda items and non-agenda public comment may also be submitted using the [webform](#). If using the webform, indicate the agenda item number you wish to submit a comment for. All webform comments are limited to 200 words. On the [webform](#), members of the public should select Commission on Police Practices (even if the public comment is for a Commission on Police Practices Committee meeting).

The public may attend a meeting when scheduled by following the attendee meeting link provided above. To view a meeting archive video, click [here](#). Video footage of each Commission meeting is posted online [here](#) within 24-48 hours of the conclusion of the meeting.

Comments received no later than 11 am the day of the meeting will be distributed to the Commission on Police Practices. Comments received after the deadline described above but before the item is called will be submitted into the written record for the relevant item.

Written Materials: You may alternatively submit via U.S. Mail to Attn: Office of the Commission on Police Practices, 525 B Street, Suite 1725, San Diego, CA 92101. Materials submitted via U.S. Mail must be received the business day prior to the meeting to be distributed to the Commission on Police Practices.

If you attach any documents to your comment, they will be distributed to the Commission or Committee in accordance with the deadlines described above.

- I. CALL TO ORDER/WELCOME (Chair Doug Case)
- II. ROLL CALL (Executive Assistant Alina Conde)
- III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - Action Item
 1. Regular Business Meeting – February 5, 2025
 2. Regular Business Meeting – February 19, 2025
- IV. NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT (Community Outreach Coordinator Yasmeen Obeid)
- V. RECOGNITION OF FORMER COMMISSION MEMBERS AND OFFICERS
- VI. CHAIR REPORT (Chair Doug Case) – Informational Item
- VII. STAFF REPORT – Informational Items
- VIII. EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT (Chair Doug Case) Informational Item
- IX. CPP RESPONSE TO ACTION TAKEN BY THE CITY COUNCIL’S PUBLIC SAFETY COMMITTEE ON FEBRUARY 12, 2025
(Motion by Chair von Wilpert to request that the city attorney’s office work with CPP counsel and Council District 5 staff to draft amendments to the San Diego Municipal Code Article 6, Division 11: Commission on Police Practices and bring them forward to the Public Safety Committee before full City Council for consideration.)
 - A. Introduction of Key Issues (Chair Doug Case)
 1. Proposal to Change the Size and Structure of the Commission
 2. Proposal to Change or Clarify the Process for Evaluation and Termination of the Executive Director
 3. Clarification of the Respective Roles of the Executive Director, Commission Chair, and the Commission
 - B. Community Forum (Public Comment)
 - C. Motion(s) Regarding the Commission's Positions on the Key Issues Stated Above (Action Item)

X. NEW BUSINESS- NONE

XI. STANDING COMMITTEE REPORTS - Informational Item

1. Rules Committee
2. Community Outreach Committee
3. Training and Continuing Education Committee

XII. AD HOC COMMITTEE REPORTS - Informational Item

4. Operating Procedures Committee
5. Police Pursuits Committee
6. Pretext Stops Committee
7. Personnel Committee

XIII. NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT (Community Outreach Coordinator Yasmeeen Obeid)

XIV. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

Materials Provided:

Access for People with Disabilities: As required by the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), requests for agenda information to be made available in alternative formats, and any requests for disability-related modifications or accommodations required to facilitate meeting participation, including requests for alternatives to observing meetings and offering public comment as noted above, may be made by contacting the Commission at (619) 533-5304 or commissiononpolicepractices@sandiego.gov.

Requests for disability-related modifications or accommodations required to facilitate meeting participation, including requests for auxiliary aids, services, or interpreters, require different lead times, ranging from five business days to two weeks. Please keep this in mind and provide as much advance notice as possible to ensure availability. The city is committed to resolving accessibility requests swiftly.

**COMMISSION ON POLICE PRACTICES
REGULAR BUSINESS MEETING
Wednesday, February 5, 2024
4:30pm-7:30pm**

**Southeastern Live Well San Diego
5101 Market St.
San Diego, CA 92114**

Click https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gmbXRTko_Ko to view this meeting on YouTube.

CPP Commissioners Present:

Chair Doug Case

1st Vice Chair Ada Rodriguez

2nd Vice Chair Clovis Honoré

John Armantrout

Bonnie Benitez

Alec Beyer

Cheryl Canson (arrived at 4:50pm)

Stephen Chatzky

Lupe Diaz (arrived at 4:50pm)

Jessica Dockstader

Armando Flores (arrived at 4:53pm)

Dwayne Harvey (left at 5:25pm)

Darlanne Mulmat

Imani Robinson

Gonzalo Rocha-Vazquez (arrived at 4:45pm)

Excused:

Dan Lawton

Absent:

Christopher Kennison

CPP Staff Present:

Olga Golub, Chief Investigator

Ching-Yun Li, Investigator

Ethan Waterman, Investigator

Aaron Burgess, Policy Manager

Alina Conde, Executive Assistant

Yasmeen Obeid, Community Engagement Coordinator

Jon'Nae McFarland, Administrative Assistant

- I. CALL TO ORDER/WELCOME: Chair Doug Case called the meeting to order at 4:35 pm.
- II. ROLL CALL: Executive Assistant Alina Conde conducted the roll call for the Commission and established quorum.
- III. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES
 1. CPP Regular Meeting Minutes of January 8, 2025
 1. **Motion:** Commissioner Bonnie Benitez moved for approval of the amended CPP Regular Meeting Minutes of January 8, 2025. 2nd Vice Chair Clovis Honoré seconded the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 9-0-1.
Yeas: 1st Vice Chair Rodriguez, 2nd Vice Chair Honoré, Armantrout, Benitez, Beyer, Chatzky, Dockstader, Harvey, and Mulmat
Nays: None
Abstained: Robinson
 2. CPP Regular Meeting Minutes of January 22, 2025
 1. **Motion:** Commissioner Bonnie Benitez moved for approval of the CPP Regular Meeting Minutes of January 22, 2025. 2nd Vice Chair Clovis Honoré seconded the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 9-0-1.
Yeas: 1st Vice Chair Rodriguez, 2nd Vice Chair Honoré, Armantrout, Benitez, Beyer, Chatzky, Dockstader, Harvey, and Mulmat
Nays: None
Abstained: Robinson
 3. CPP Hearing Meeting Minutes of January 25, 2025
 1. **Motion:** Commissioner Bonnie Benitez moved for approval of the CPP Hearing Meeting Minutes of January 25, 2025. 2nd Vice Chair Clovis Honoré seconded the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 9-0-1.
Yeas: 1st Vice Chair Rodriguez, 2nd Vice Chair Honoré, Armantrout, Benitez, Beyer, Chatzky, Dockstader, Harvey, and Mulmat
Nays: None
Abstained: Robinson

IV. NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

In Person Public Comment: “Andrea St. Julian” (*Timestamp 5:38*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding the exit memos from former Executive Director Paul Parker and former Outside Counsel Duane Bennett.

In Person Public Comment: “Francine Maxwell” (*Timestamp 8:26*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding the exit memos from former Executive Director Paul Parker and former Outside Counsel Duane Bennett.

Virtual Public Comment: “Darwin Fishman” (*Timestamp 11:16*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding an incident that happened with SDPD.

Virtual Public Comment: “Lori Saldaña” (*Timestamp 13:56*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding an incident that involved sexual assault but after reporting to SDPD, the department did not give the case the attention that was deserved.

Virtual Public Comment: “Life with Dorothy” (*Timestamp 17:13*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding transparency and the work of the CPP. She expressed her frustration regarding her brother’s case.

Virtual Public Comment: “John Doe” (*Timestamp 20:30*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding frustrations about SDPD.

Virtual Public Comment: “Patricia De Arman” (*Timestamp 21:35*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding the case of that involves SDPD and her brother.

Virtual Public Comment: “Defund LAPD” (*Timestamp 24:52*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding the work of the Commission.

V. CHAIR REPORT

1. Commissioner Status:
 - Resignation of Jessica Dockstader as of February 6th. February 5th will be her last meeting with the CPP. (*Timestamp 26:12*)

VI. STAFF REPORT

1. Introduction of General Counsel, Bart Miesfeld (*Timestamp 26:55*)
2. Recent Outreach Activities (*Timestamp 29:46*) – Community Engagement Coordinator presented the work that her and her team have done for the Commission and addresses plans for future outreach.
3. Other Staff Announcements - None

VII. EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT

1. Update on Appointment of Interim Executive Director and Recruitment for New Executive Director – Chair Doug Case stated that the City Council will be moving forward with the Personnel Committee next week on appointing an interim Executive Director.
2. Update on Filling Commission Vacancies – Chair Doug Case stated that the City Councilmember von Wilpert has put a hold on filling vacancies until they looked at some of the issues that the Commission is facing. Two specific issues to review are the size of the Commission and the Commission’s ability to hire/fire of the Executive Director. No proposals have been made. The search for an interim Executive Director may stay pending until the City Counsel amends the ordinance.
3. Budget Update – The City is in the process of reducing the current fiscal year budget and the next fiscal year due to failure of Measure E. Each City department is to reduce current budget by 20%. The CPP is negotiating budget with the city. One proposal that has been made is to not proceed with the Performance Auditor position to save cost. The CPP does not support in eliminating positions but is willing to suspend hiring until budget issues get better.
4. SDPD Response to Police Pursuit – Next Steps (February 19 Presentation) – SDPD will come to the next meeting to go over responses and give more in depth explanation of each response. The Ad Hoc Police Pursuit Committee will be meeting on Tuesday, February 11th at 6:00pm.
5. Proposal by City Councilmember Marni von Wilpert to amend the CPP implementation ordinance. – City Attorney’s office is currently still working on this, and it won’t be available by the deadline to post for the CPP meeting agenda.
6. Update on Operating Procedures – General Counsel Bart Miesfeld and CPP Chair Doug Case will be working on providing the operating procedures completed and will bring it back to the full commission before sending the standard operating procedures to the Public Safety Committee.
7. Update on Audio/Visual Contract – Audio/Visual team contract is currently on hold. MEA would like to wait until CPP has an interim executive director to make decision to move forward with meet and confer process.
8. Recognition of Departed Commissioners and Staff – Recognition will be made next month for departed commissioners and staff to express appreciation for time served.

In Person Public Comment: “Francine Maxwell” (*Timestamp 56:25*) – Spoke on item 1.

In Person Public Comment: “Andrea St. Julian” (*Timestamp 59:32*) – Spoke on item 1 and item 5.

In Person Public Comment: “Kate Yavenditti” (*Timestamp 1:03:42*) – Spoke on item 2.

Virtual Public Comment: “Lori Saldana” (*Timestamp 1:06:58*) – Spoke on item 2 and item 4.

Virtual Public Comment: “Patricia De Arman” (*Timestamp 1:10:53*) – Spoke on item 1 and item 2.

VIII. NEW BUSINESS

1. Motion to approve a three-month trial of a case review process where staff investigators will take the lead on reviewing the IA case file, drafting the review report and presenting to the Commission.

MOTION: 1st Vice Chair Clovis Honoré moved to approve a three-month trial of a case review process where staff investigators will take the lead on reviewing the IA case file, drafting the review report and presenting to the Commission. Commissioner Steve Chatzky seconded the amended motion. The motion failed with a vote of 2-11-0.

Yeas: 2nd Vice Chair Honoré, Beyer

Nays: 1st Vice Chair Rodriguez, Armantrout, Benitez, Canson, Chatzky, Diaz, Dockstader, Flores, Mulmat, Robinson, Rocha-Vazquez

Abstained: None

Motion to approve a six-month trial (through July 2025) of a case review process where staff investigators will take the lead on reviewing the IA case file, drafting the review report and presenting to the Commission.

MOTION: Commissioner Bonnie Benitez moved to approve a six-month trial (through July 2025) of a case review process where staff investigators will take the lead on reviewing the IA case file, drafting the review report and presenting to the Commission. 1st Vice Chair Ada Rodriguez seconded the amended motion. The motion passed with a vote of 9-2-2.

Yeas: 1st Vice Chair Rodriguez, Benitez, Canson, Diaz, Dockstader, Flores, Mulmat, Robinson, Rocha-Vazquez

Nays: Beyer, Chatzky

Abstained: Armantrout, 2nd Vice Chair Honoré

In Person Public Comment: “Francine Maxwell” (*Timestamp 1:22:16*) – Spoke on opposition of CLERB model and having staff do the work on cases.

2. Motion to request the City Council Public Safety Committee delay any action on proposed amendments to the CPP implementation ordinance until the Commission and the community have sufficient time to review the proposals and provide input.

MOTION: Commissioner John Armantrout moved to request the City Council Public Safety Committee delay any action on proposed amendments to the CPP implementation ordinance until the Commission and the community have sufficient time to review the proposals and provide input. Commissioner Bonnie Benitez seconded the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 11-0-2.

Yeas: 2nd Vice Chair Honoré, Armantrout, Benitez, Beyer, Canson, Chatzky, Diaz, Dockstader, Flores, Mulmat, Rocha-Vazquez

Nays: None

Abstained: 1st Vice Chair Rodriguez, Robinson

In Person Public Comment: “Andrea St. Julian” (*Timestamp 2:18:11*) – Spoke on her opposition for any amendments to be made by City Council – regarding item 2.

In Person Public Comment: “Kate Yavenditti” (*Timestamp 2:21:26*) – Spoke on her opposition for any amendments to be made by City Council – regarding item 2.

Virtual Public Comment: “Patricia De Arman” (*Timestamp 2:24:38*) – Spoke on her opinions regarding what the Commission can do with cases.

IX. COMMITTEE REPORTS

1. Community Outreach Committee -Tabled

X. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS - None

XI. ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 7:15 pm.

**COMMISSION ON POLICE PRACTICES
REGULAR BUSINESS MEETING
Wednesday, February 19, 2024
4:30pm-7:30pm**

**Southeastern Live Well San Diego
5101 Market St.
San Diego, CA 92114**

Click https://youtu.be/OxMgWamk_i4 to view this meeting on YouTube.

CPP Commissioners Present:

Chair Doug Case
1st Vice Chair Ada Rodriguez
2nd Vice Chair Clovis Honoré
Bonnie Benitez
Alec Beyer
Cheryl Canson (arrived at 5:11pm)

Stephen Chatzky
Lupe Diaz
Armando Flores
Dwayne Harvey
Darlanne Mulmat
Imani Robinson

Excused:

John Armantrout
Dan Lawton

Absent:

Christopher Kennison
Gonzalo Rocha-Vazquez

CPP Staff Present:

Bart Miesfeld, General Counsel
Olga Golub, Chief Investigator
Ching-Yun Li, Investigator
Ethan Waterman, Investigator
Aaron Burgess, Policy Manager
Alina Conde, Executive Assistant
Yasmeen Obeid, Community Engagement Coordinator
Jon’Nae McFarland, Administrative Assistant

- I. CALL TO ORDER/WELCOME: Chair Doug Case called the meeting to order at 4:42 pm.
- II. ROLL CALL: Executive Assistant Alina Conde conducted the roll call for the Commission and established quorum.
- III. NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT
 - In Person Public Comment:** “Francine Maxwell” (*Timestamp 1:42*) – Requested correction of facility names on the agenda moving forward. She also has requested for the CPP to investigate the history of the CPP and look at what former Executive Director Sharmaine Moseley was able to do for the Commission.
 - Virtual Public Comment:** “John” (*Timestamp 3:48*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding an incident that happened with SDPD.
- IV. CHAIR REPORT
 - SDPD will be presenting their response to Pursuit Policy recommendations.
 - March 5th Commission on Police Practices Regular Business Meeting will start at 5pm. The CPP will discuss the issues brought up during the City Council’s Public Safety Committee Meeting. The CPP will be making official statement regarding the SDPD response. The Police Pursuit Committee will be meeting next week to draft the official response/statement.
 - Resignation of Jessica Dockstader as of February 6th. February 5th will be her last meeting with the CPP.
- V. STAFF REPORT – None
- VI. SDPD Response to Vehicle Pursuits Policy Recommendations
 - A. Presentation by SDPD (Chief Scott Wahl) – Captain Jeffrey Jordon stated that the SDPD adopted six out of nine recommendations. (*Timestamp 11:26*)
 - B. Public Comment
 - In Person Public Comment:** “Patricia De Arman” (*Timestamp 35:33*) – Spoke on the police pursuit involving her brother and SDPD.
 - In Person Public Comment:** “David Rico” (*Timestamp 38:30*) – Spoke on the safety of the community in different areas in San Diego stating that not all areas are safe from the police.
 - Virtual Public Comment:** “Sukhbir Gill” (*Timestamp 42:21*) – Spoke on the data and research that is available and the data that SDPD still needs to gather and shared with the public.
 - Virtual Public Comment:** “John” (*Timestamp 44:50*) – Spoke on data and research that SDPF will need to gather and shared with the public.
 - Virtual Public Comment:** “Darwin Fishman” (*Timestamp 57:57*) – Spoke on data and research that SDPF will need to gather and shared with the public.
 - Virtual Public Comment:** “Tasha Williamson” (*Timestamp 51:18*) – Spoke on response from SDPD.
 - C. Commissioner Comments and Questions (*Timestamp 52:52*)
- VII. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS – None
- VIII. CLOSED SESSION (NOT OPEN TO THE PUBLIC)
 - A. Chair Doug Case led CPP into Closed Session
 - B. Public Comment

Virtual Public Comment: “Patricia De Arman” (Timestamp 1:25:40) – Spoke regarding her case that has been given to the CPP.

Virtual Public Comment: “Darwin Fishman” (Timestamp 1:30:46) – Spoke regarding the cases being reviewed by CPP and which allegations are becoming a pattern (racial profiling, pursuits, etc.).

C. PUBLIC EMPLOYEE DISCIPLINE/DISMISSAL/RELEASE

Discussion & Consideration of Complaints & Reports: Pursuant to Government Code Section 54957 to discuss complaints, charges, investigations, and discipline (unless the employee requests an open public session) involving San Diego Police Department employees, and information deemed confidential under Penal Code Sections 832.5-832.8 and Evidence Code Section 1040. Reportable actions for the Closed Session items on the agenda will be posted on the Commission’s website at www.sandiego.gov/cpp or stated at the beginning of the Open Session meeting if the meeting is held on the same day.

- | | |
|-------|---|
| I. | San Diego Police Department Feedback on Case Specific Matters (0) |
| II. | Shooting Review Board Reports (0) |
| III. | Officer Involved Shooting (2) |
| IV. | Discipline Reports (3) |
| V. | In-Custody Death (0) |
| VI. | Case Review Group Reports (4) |
| VII. | Case-Specific Recommendations to the Mayor/Chief (0) |
| VIII. | Referrals to other governmental agencies authorized to investigate activities of a law enforcement agency (0) |
| IX. | Legal Opinion(s) Request & Response (0) |
| X. | Report on case-related issues discussed during IA meeting (0) |

II. REPORT OUT FROM CLOSED SESSION (7:39 pm): General Counsel Bart Miesfeld reported that there was no reportable action.

IX. ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 7:40 pm.