



**COMMISSION ON POLICE PRACTICES
REGULAR BUSINESS MEETING**

Wednesday, January 8, 2024

4:30pm-7:30pm

Procopio Towers

525 B St

San Diego, CA 92101

Click <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=MpfubRTgw4k> to view this meeting on YouTube.

CPP Commissioners Present:

Chair Doug Case

1st Vice Chair Ada Rodriguez

2nd Vice Chair Clovis Honoré

John Armantrout

Bonnie Benitez

Alec Beyer

Stephen Chatzky

Lupe Diaz (arrived at 4:50pm)

Jessica Dockstader

Armando Flores (arrived at 5:01pm)

Dwayne Harvey (arrived at 4:47pm)

Christopher Kennison

Dan Lawton

Darlanne Mulmat

Excused:

Gonzalo Rocha-Vazquez

Absent:

Cheryl Canson

Imani Robinson

CPP Staff Present:

Olga Golub, Chief Investigator

Ching-Yun Li, Investigator

Ethan Waterman, Investigator

Aaron Burgess, Policy Manager

Alina Conde, Executive Assistant (Virtual)

Yasmeen Obeid, Community Engagement Coordinator

Jon’Nae McFarland, Administrative Assistant

- I. CALL TO ORDER/WELCOME: Chair Doug Case called the meeting to order at 4:35 pm.
- II. ROLL CALL: Executive Assistant Alina Conde conducted the roll call for the Commission and established quorum.
- III. PURPOSE OF THE COMMISSION ON POLICE PRACTICES: The purpose of the Commission on Police Practices (CPP or Commission) is to provide independent community oversight of SDPD, directed at increasing community trust in SDPD & increasing safety for community and officers. The purpose of the Commission is also to perform independent investigations of officer-involved shootings, in-custody deaths and other significant incidents, and an unbiased evaluation of all complaints against members of SDPD and its personnel in a process that will be transparent and accountable to the community. Lastly, the Commission also evaluates the review of all SDPD policies, practices, trainings, and protocols and represents the community in making recommendations for changes.
- IV. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES
 - A. CPP Regular Meeting Minutes of December 4, 2024
 1. **Motion:** Chair Doug Case entertained the motion for approval of the amended CPP Regular Meeting Minutes of December 4, 2024. Commissioner Stephen Chatzky seconded the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 11-0-0. Yeas: Chair Case, Armantrout, Benitez, Beyer, Chatzky, Dockstader, Honoré, Kennison, Lawton, Mulmat, Rodriguez
Nays: None
Abstained: None
 - B. CPP Regular Meeting Minutes of December 11, 2024
 1. **Motion:** Chair Doug Case entertained the motion for approval of the amended CPP Regular Meeting Minutes of December 11, 2024. Commissioner Darlanne Mulmat seconded the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 11-0-0. Yeas: Chair Case, Armantrout, Benitez, Beyer, Chatzky, Dockstader, Honoré, Kennison, Lawton, Mulmat, Rodriguez
Nays: None
Abstained: None
- V. NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

In Person Public Comment: “Andrea St. Julian” (*Timestamp 4:15*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding the work of the commission and gave 10 suggestions for moving forward.

Virtual Public Comment: “Ilka Weston” (*Timestamp 7:53*) – Requested more information on how to apply to be a commissioner.

Virtual Public Comment: “Darwin Fishman” (*Timestamp 10:13*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding support of Andrea St. Julian’s comment. Darwin Fishman gave some suggestions for the commission to consider (i.e. meetings to be held around the city, have town halls, follow up on policy recommendations, and possibly later start time for community participation).

Virtual Public Comment: “Yusef Miller” (*Timestamp 13:29*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding support with the De Arman incident. Yusef Miller highlighted the SDPD presentation on canine use.

Virtual Public Comment: “Evie Kosower” (*Timestamp 15:16*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding minutes and audio-visual issues.

Written Public Comment: “Patricia De Arman” – Attached public comment to the meeting minutes.

VI. CHAIR REPORT

1. Commissioner Status:
 - Resignations of Gloria Tran, Brandon Hilpert and Viviana Ortega
 - There are currently 8 vacancies to be filled. There are (2) Low-to-moderate and (1) at-large to be filled January 13th. Districts 3, 5, 7, at-large, and youth seats are currently open.
 - Welcomed Commissioner Christopher Kennison who has replaced James Justus.
 - Exit Letters from Executive Director and Outside Counsel
2. Hiring:
 - Executive Director: There is a new applicant tracking system which will streamline the process.
 - Reconstitute the Ad Hoc Committee
 - Best case scenario is to recruit in January, screen candidates in February, interview process in March, and hire by the end of March.
3. General Counsel:
 - New General Counsel was selected, accepted, starts Jan. 15 or when background check is complete.
4. Interim Executive Director: Ad Hoc Personnel Committee will be making a recommendation to the City Council. A potential candidate has been identified, and it could be placed on the City Council agenda later this month. Chair Doug Case reached out to the Council President and the Chair of the Public Safety Committee, and they are prepared to move forward expeditiously.
5. Deputy Executive Director
 - Former Executive Director Paul Parker felt that the new ED should select their Deputy ED.
 - HR will get the top 5 candidates and keep them “warm” so that when the new ED is hired, the hiring of the Deputy could hopefully go quickly.
6. Performance Auditor:

Currently pending. Departments are being asked to do a budget cut of 20% for this fiscal year. OCPP Senior Management Analysis Jaime Jacinto is currently negotiating with the mayor’s office.
7. Contract for Outside Counsel (Jerry Threet) – currently in process.
8. 12/18 Meeting with Chief Wahl (Former Chair Tran and Chair Case)
 - The response to the CPP Police Vehicle Pursuit Recommendations will be sent by January 18. The Chief will come to the February 5 CPP meeting to explain the decision and answer questions.
 - Responses will be sent soon to the CPP memos regarding the inadequacy of a case investigation and the memo regarding access to OIS homicide files.
 - The Chief will contact the Sheriff to discuss CPP access to Sheriff Office BWC’s. Chair Doug Case mentioned that this issue stems from the lack of consultation with the CPP before SDPD signing the MOU with San

Diego County law enforcement departments regarding investigations of officer-involved shootings.

- Regarding the OIS Case, timed out before it was reported to the CPP, IA has implemented an internal monitoring system to prevent this from happening again.
 - Chair Doug Case discussed that all deviations from the discipline matrix should be explained in the discipline memos sent to the CPP.
 - The Chief concurs with the recommendation to have IA conduct investigations of Category II complaints, rather the Division of the subject officer(s). This will require additional IA staff and must also go through a meet and confer with the POA.
 - The Chief agreed to come to a future CPP meeting to present the SDPD complaint process.
 - Chair Doug Case discussed ways to best facilitate police interactions with the community and the Commission during meetings or hearings on controversial issues.
 - Chair Doug Case discussed upcoming CPP transitions.
9. Audio Visual Contract Status
GovTV contract renewal on hold – meet and confer with MEA. Funded by the Public, Educational and Government Communications Fund from cable company fees.
10. Operating Procedures:
Previous plan. Former Executive Director Paul Parker and Former Outside Counsel Duane Bennett met with Employee Relations negotiators, in consultation with Olga were going to present a revised version to the Ad Hoc Operating Procedures Committee, with CPP consideration in January then forwarding to City Council Public Safety Committee. Due to various circumstances, the preparation of the proposed revised version was delayed. Paul provided his working draft. He recommended that the new General Counsel and ED prepare the final recommendation since they are the ones who will be participating in the meet and confer. This will be one of the first tasks assigned to the General Counsel, in consultation with our Chief Investigator who was the staff liaison to the ad hoc committee.

VII. STAFF REPORT – Chief Investigator Olga Golub updated the new OCPP Investigators have completed their first phase of training and will be ready to assist in case review soon.

VIII. 1st & 2nd VICE CHAIR ELECTIONS

A. 1st Vice Chair

a. Nominations

- Commissioner Bonnie Benitez nominated Commissioner Ada Rodriguez (accepted)
- Commissioner Alec Beyer nominated Commissioner Bonnie Benitez (declined)

b. Public Comment – None

c. Discussion (*Timestamp 44:40*)

d. Action: Vote on 1st Vice Chair

MOTION: Commissioner Alec Beyer moved to defer the Chair Elections until legal presentation is present during a following CPP Regular Business Meeting.

Commissioner Stephen Chatzky seconded the motion. The motion failed with a vote of 1-11-2.

Yeas: Beyer

Nays: Chair Case, Armantrout, Benitez, Dockstader, Flores, Harvey, Honoré, Kennison, Lawton, Mulmat, and Rodriguez

Abstained: Chatzky and Diaz

MOTION: Chair Doug Case entertained the motion to elect of Commissioner Ada Rodriguez to be 1st Vice Chair. By a majority vote, Commissioner Ada Rodriguez was elected as 1st Vice Chair through June 30, 2025. The vote passed 13-0-1.

Yeas: Chair Case, Armantrout, Benitez, Chatzky, Diaz, Dockstader, Flores, Harvey, Honoré, Kennison, Lawton, Mulmat, Rodriguez

Nays: None

Abstentions: Beyer

B. 2nd Vice Chair

a. Nominations

- 1st Vice Chair Ada Rodriguez nominated Commissioner Bonnie Benitez (accepted)
- Commissioner Dwayne Harvey nominated Commissioner Clovis Honoré (accepted)

b. Public Comment - None

c. Discussion (*Timestamp 47:42*)

d. Action: Vote on 2nd Vice Chair

MOTION: Chair Doug Case conducted roll call for Commissioners to cast their vote for 2nd Vice Chair. By a majority vote, Commissioner Clovis Honoré was elected as the Commission's 2nd Vice Chair through June 30, 2025.

Commissioner Bonnie Benitez (The vote failed 4-8-2)- Chair Case, Benitez, Diaz, Mulmat

Commissioner Clovis Honoré (The vote passed 8-4-2)- 1st Vice Chair Rodriguez, Armantrout, Chatzky, Dockstader, Flores, Harvey, Honoré, Kennison

Abstentions - Beyer, Lawton

IX. EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT

A. CPP Meetings Update – Executive Committee Votes

- a. CPP Business Meetings – (*Timestamp 57:52*) 1st Vice Chair Ada Rodriguez stated that the CPP will continue to have meetings on the first and third Wednesday of the month. The **first** meeting will be a full agenda open meeting.
- b. CPP Case Review Meetings – (*Timestamp 57:52*) 1st Vice Chair Ada Rodriguez stated that the CPP will continue to have meetings on the first and third Wednesday of the month. The **second** meeting will include a closed meeting primarily for case review.

B. Community Hearings Delay

a. Public Comment

In Person Public Comment: “Andrea St. Julian” (*Timestamp 1:06:51*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding concerns about delaying community hearings.

Virtual Public Comment: “Ilka Weston” (*Timestamp 1:10:35*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding concerns about visual issues. Additionally, spoke regarding the need of CPP recommendations to the SDPD.

- Virtual Public Comment:** “Dave De Arman” (*Timestamp 1:13:40*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding the case involving SDPD and his son.
- b. Discussion - (*Timestamp 1:02:23*)
 - c. Action – Vote to delay Community Hearings due to lack of staff.
MOTION: Chair Doug Case entertained the motion to delay the current Community Hearings schedule and have the Executive Committee come back with a proposed revised schedule and wait until the onboarding of new Commissioners and the Executive Director. Commissioner Darlann Mulmat seconded the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 7-5-2.
 Yeas: 1st Vice Chair Rodriguez, Armantrout, Benitez, Dockstader, Flores, Harvey, and Lawton
 Nays: 2nd Vice Chair Honoré, Beyer, Chatzky, Diaz, and Mulmat
 Abstentions: Ex officio Chair Doug Case, Kennison
- C. Standing Committee Updates
- a. Commissioner Darlann Mulmat shared that the Executive Committee voted to pause Standing Committee meetings, except Executive Committee, Outreach Committee, and Rules Committee until staff is hired.
 - b. Public Comment - None
 - c. Discussion (*Timestamp 1:31:29*)
MOTION: Chair Case entertained the motion to pause Standing Committee meetings, except Executive Committee, Rules Committee, and Outreach Committee until staff is hired. The motion passed 9-1-4.
 Yeas: 1st Vice Chair Rodriguez, Armantrout, Benitez, Diaz, Dockstader, Flores, Harvey, Lawton, and Mulmat
 Nays: Beyer
 Abstained: Ex officio Chair Case, 2nd Vice Chair Honoré, Chatzky, and Kennison
- D. CPP Meeting Calendar 2025
- a. Public Comment - None
 - b. Discussion (*Timestamp 1:33:29*)
 - c. Action – Vote to approve 2025 CPP Meeting Calendar – No action taken. Chair Doug Case requested to take the calendar back to the Executive Committee for full review of the year. The Executive Committee would further check current reservations and for meeting location availability out in the community while having audio visual needs in mind.
- E. Case Review Changes
- a. Investigators lead Case Review - (*Timestamp 1:44:47*) Commissioner Bonnie Benitez updates the Commission on the decision made in the Executive Committee Meeting regarding case review. It was decided to have new OCPP Investigators Ching-Yun Li and Ethan Waterman to conduct case review moving forward.
 - b. Public Comment
In Person Public Comment: “Andrea St. Julian” (*Timestamp 1:56:41*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding decision to let the investigators lead the case review.
Virtual Public Comment: “Dave De Arman” (*Timestamp 2:00:14*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding investigation of his son and SDPD.
Virtual Public Comment: “Yusef Miller” (*Timestamp 2:00:44*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding the decision to let the investigators lead the case review.

c. Discussion – Chief Investigator Olga Golub shared that the investigators would take the lead on case review and draft the reports for cases. They will then present the cases to the commission. Commissioners will not be doing case review during this time, but Commissioners will have access to the case files for review before the case is presented to them during closed session. There was consensus to try the new approach on a trial basis for six months, which will be formalized at the next business meeting. (*Timestamp 2:01:59*)

F. Policy Priority Proposal

a. Policy Manager Aaron Burgess will present at Retreat

b. Public Comment – None

c. Discussion (*Timestamp 2:10:13*) Commissioner Bonnie Benitez updates that Policy Manager Aaron Burgess will put together a strategic plan (for the next year or two) for policy review and will bring it to the commission.

X. RETREAT DATE(S) & AGENDA(S)

Presentation – Chair Doug Case breaks down the purpose of the retreat, which is primarily for relationship building, developing community agreements, strong and healthy communication. The second portion of the retreat will be for strategic planning for proposals. Chair Doug Case explains the options of postponing the retreat until (late spring) the position of Executive Director is filled, proceed as planned for January 25th, or do a mini retreat on January 25th and postpone the retreat later.

A. Public Comment – None

B. Discussion (*Timestamp 2:15:29*)

C. Action

MOTION: Commissioner Armantrout moved to proceed with a relationship building (mini) retreat on January 25, 2025, and host a more comprehensive later in the year after the Executive Director position is filled. Commissioner Bonnie Benitez seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with a vote of 14-0-0.

Yeas: Chair Case, 1st Vice Chair Rodriguez, 2nd Vice Chair Honoré, Armantrout, Benitez, Beyer, Chatzky, Diaz, Dockstader, Flores, Harvey, Kennison, Lawton, Mulmat

Nays: None

Abstained: None

XI. APPOINTMENT OF AD HOC PERSONNEL COMMITTEE

A. Presentation – The members of the committee interview and make recommendations to the City Council for a permanent Executive Director. The committee would also make recommendations for an Interim Executive director. They would also do an annual evaluation of the Executive Director.

B. Public Comment – None

C. Discussion (*Timestamp 2:21:29*)

D. Action

MOTION: Chair Doug Case entertained the motion to reconstitute the Ad Hoc Personnel Committee with the three charges to interview and make recommendations to the City Council for permanent Executive Director and interim Executive Director, and to hold annual evaluation of the permanent Executive Director. The motion passed unanimously with a vote of 14-0-0.

Appointment: 1st Vice Chair Ada Rodriguez, 2nd Vice Chair Clovis Honoré,

Commissioner Bonnie Benitez, and Commissioner Darlanne Mulmat
Yeas: Chair Case, 1st Vice Chair Rodriguez, 2nd Vice Chair Honoré, Armantrout,
Benitez, Beyer, Chatzky, Diaz, Dockstader, Flores, Harvey, Kennison, Lawton,
Mulmat
Nays: None
Abstained: None

XII. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

- Commissioner Alec Beyer requested memos shared by former Executive Director and former Outside Counsel Duane Bennett to be added to an agenda for a future meeting. (*Timestamp 2:25:24*)
- Commissioner Darlanne Mulmat asked about how CPP can make A/V issues better. Also requested for more input and updates to be made regarding outreach that the CPP is doing to be added to the agenda. This includes more info on how to apply to be on the commission for people in the community to have more information. (*Timestamp 2:26:13*)
- Commissioner Stephen Chatzky seconded Commission Beyers comment regarding discussion more in depth the memos shared by former Executive Director and former Outside Counsel Duane Bennett. (*Timestamp 2:27:37*)
- 2nd Vice Chair Clovis Honoré agrees with Commission Beyer and Commissioner Chatzky's comments regarding adding the memos shared by former Executive Director and former Outside Counsel Duane Bennett on the agenda. (*Timestamp 2:28:17*)
- 1st Vice Chair Ada Rodriguez brought up thoughts on having city provided laptops to help with A/V issues. (*Timestamp 2:28:56*)

XIII. ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 7:12 pm.