

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF OCTOBER 24, 2024
PUBLIC UTILITIES DEPARTMENT
METROPOLITAN OPERATIONS COMPLEX II
9192 TOPAZ WAY
SAN DIEGO, CA 92123
HYBRID HEARING**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

Chairperson Hutter called the meeting to order at 1:09p.m. Chairperson Hutter adjourned the meeting at 1:57 p.m.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING:

Chairperson Tim Hutter – present
Vice-Chairperson Michael Taylor – present
2nd Vice-Chairperson Kristi Byers – present
Boardmember Joy Miller– absent
Boardmember Rammy Cortez – present
Boardmember Courtney Ann Coyle – present
Boardmember Carla Farley – present
Boardmember David McCullough – present
Boardmember Mathew Winter – present
Boardmember Ann Woods – present

City Staff

Lindsey Sebastian, Deputy City Attorney – present
Kelley Stanco, City Planning Department – present
Suzanne Segur, City Planning Department – present
Shannon Anthony, City Planning Department – present
Bernie Turgeon, City Planning Department – present
Alvin Lin, City Planning Department – present
Megan Walker, City Planning Department – present
Kelsey Kaline, City Planning Department – present
Audrey Rains, City Planning Department – present

Note: All decision-makers attended the meeting in person. Staff and members of the public attended both in person and virtually.

ANNOUNCEMENTS/PUBLIC COMMENT

Laura Henson, President of the Talmadge Historical Society, announced that on October 18, Talmadge Park Historical Society submitted the Talmadge Park Estates National Register Historic District to the planning department with the intent of going through the local district designation process. Laura Henson requested that the HRB request this to be heard on the November agenda.

Faith Jennings, a resident in the Valle Vista Historic District, requested a follow up about the ADU in their historic district.

Susan Dean, a Mission Hills resident, voiced support for bringing the Talmadge Park Estates Historic District forward to the board and also requested that the HRB Policy Subcommittee review a potential streamlined process for designating National Register historic districts on the local register.

BOARDMEMBERS COMMENT

Boardmember Coyle indicated interest in discussing district processing at a Policy Subcommittee meeting.

Boardmember Coyle also commented that the La Jolla Park Coastal Historic District will be having a celebration on Thursday, November 7 from 4-6:30pm at the La Jolla Cove Hotel and Suites Rooftop. The public is invited and can contact La Jolla Historical Society for tickets.

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

None.

EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

2nd Vice-Chair Byers had a brief interaction with the homeowners at 1735 Pentucket but it will not influence any decision making.

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None.

REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE CONTINUED AND/OR WITHDRAWN

None.

REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON THE CONSENT AGENDA

Item 2: Lucy C. Warner/ F.E Young Spec House located at 1735 Pentucket Avenue

Item 3: Garret and Esther Bradt/William B. Melhorn Spec. House #1 located at 1115 Alberta Place

Item 4: James and Mary Cambron House located at 4545 Rhode Island Street

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY SECOND-VICE CHAIRPERSON BYERS FOR ITEM 2 – THE LUCY C. WARNER/ F.E. YOUNG SPEC HOUSE LOCATED AT 1735 PENTUCKETT AVENUE, ITEM 3- THE GARRET AND ESTHER BRADT/ WILLIAM B. MELHORN SPEC HOUSE #1 LOCATED AT 1115 ALBERTA PLACE AND ITEM 4- THE JAMES AND MARY CAMBRON HOUSE LOCATED AT 4545 RHODE ISLAND STREET TO BE DESIGNATED PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION ON THE CONSENT AGENDA. Seconded by Boardmember Farley. The motion passed by a vote of 9-0-0 all Boardmembers voting yes and Boardmember Miller being absent.

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Item 1: 637 Arenas Street

No motion needed.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FOR SEPTEMBER 26, 2024.

MOTION BY VICE CHAIR TAYLOR TO APPROVE THE MINUTES. Seconded by 2nd Vice Chair Byers. The motion passed by a vote of 9-0-0 with all Boardmembers voting yea, with Boardmember Miller being absent.

STAFF REPORT

City Planning Department Report

Kelley Stanco, Deputy Director

I wanted to take a moment to acknowledge the passing of Allen Hazard, a long-time advocate of historic preservation in the Mission Hills community and throughout the City of San Diego. I worked with Allen and his wife Janet on many occasions, most notably on the nomination of the Mission Hills Historic District, which they led and submitted. His passing will be deeply felt within the preservation community, and our thoughts go out to his wife Janet, his family, friends, and all who loved him.

Suzanne Segur, Senior Planner

Introduced Audrey Rains as the Heritage Preservation Section's newest Assistant Planner!

Subcommittee Report Out

POLICY & ARCHAEOLOGICAL AND TRIBAL CULTURAL RESOURCES

The next meeting of the Policy Subcommittee will be held on Monday, November 18 at 3 p.m. in the large conference room on the 5th floor of the City Administration Building.

More information regarding Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee can be found on the Development Services website.

DESIGN ASSISTANCE

The next meeting of the Design Assistance Subcommittee scheduled to be held on Wednesday November 6 at 4 p.m. in the large conference room on the 5th floor of the City Administration Building.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

ITEM-1

Trailed from September 26, 2024 Hearing

637 ARENAS STREET

Applicant/Owner: Donald and Shelline Bennett represented by by Urbana Preservation & Planning, LLC

Staff: Megan Walker

Consider the designation of the property located at 637 Arenas Street, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1, as a historical resource. Report Number: HRB-24-032

PROPOSED ACTION

Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 637 Arenas Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Staff Report by Megan Walker

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: John Hyche of Urbana Preservation

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO DESIGNATE THE RESOURCE UNDER CRITERION C FOR DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE COLONIAL REVIVAL STYLE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1928, SPECIFICALLY THE RESOURCE HAS THE CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES OF A SIDE GABLED ROOF, FRONT PORTICO, DORIC COLUMNS, HORIZONTAL CHanneled WOOD SIDING, EXTERIOR

GABLE END CHIMNEY AND GROOVED DOUBLE HUNG WOOD SASH WINDOWS. EXCLUDING THE REAR LAUNDRY ADDITION ADDED OUTSIDE THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. Seconded by Boardmember Cortez. The motion failed by a vote of 5-4-0 with Boardmember Cortez, Boardmember Coyle, Boardmember McCullough, Boardmember Winter, and Vice Chair Taylor voting yea, Chair Hutter, 2nd Vice Chair Byers, Boardmember Farley, and Boardmember Woods voting no and Boardmember Miller being absent.

ITEM-2 LUCY C. WARNER/ F.E YOUNG SPEC HOUSE

Applicant/Owner: Kendell C Klein and Paul T Appicelli represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Staff: Kelsey Kaline

Consider the designation of the property located at 1735 Pentucket Avenue, 92104, North Park Community, Council District 3, as a historical resource. Report Number: HRB-24-036

PROPOSED ACTION

Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Lucy C. Warner/ F.E Spec House located at 1735 Pentucket Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the 1968 swimming pool and deck, 1990s pergola and shed, and 2019 second-story bedroom addition all constructed outside the period of significance. The designation includes the adze-struck open ceiling in the living room, the primary staircase with wrought-iron metal railings, and Moorish style parabolic firebox.

Testimony Received:

None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY SECOND-VICE CHAIRPERSON BYERS TO DESIGNATE ON CONSENT PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION. Seconded by Boardmember Farley. The motion passed by a vote of 9-0-0 with all Boardmembers voting yes and Boardmember Miller being absent.

ITEM-3 GARRET AND ESTHER BRADT/WILLIAM B. MELHORN SPEC. HOUSE #1

Applicant/Owner: James and Rebecca Smith 2008 Rev. Living Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Staff: Audrey Rains/Shannon Anthony

Consider the designation of the property located at 1115 Alberta Place, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3, as a historical resource. Report Number: HRB-24-037

PROPOSED ACTION

Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Garret and Esther Bradt/William B. Melhorn Spec. House #1 located at 1115 Alberta Place as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C and D. The designation excludes the rear detached cabana constructed outside the period of significance.

Testimony Received:

None.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY SECOND-VICE CHAIRPERSON BYERS TO DESIGNATE ON CONSENT PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION. Seconded by Boardmember Farley. The motion passed by a vote of 9-0-0 with all Boardmembers voting yes and Boardmember Miller being absent.

ITEM-4

JAMES AND MARY CAMBRON HOUSE

Applicant/Owner: James Gutierrez and Charles Murin represented by IS Architecture

Staff: Megan Walker/Shannon Anthony

Consider the designation of the property located at 4545 Rhode Island Street, 92116, Uptown Community, Council District 3, as a historical resource. Report Number: HRB-24-038

PROPOSED ACTION

Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the James and Mary Cambron House located at 4545 Rhode Island Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1907 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear porch enclosure, rear dormer addition, detached garage, and rear shed structure constructed outside of the period of significance.

Testimony Received:

None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY SECOND-VICE CHAIRPERSON BYERS TO DESIGNATE ON CONSENT PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION. Seconded by Boardmember Farley. The motion passed by a vote of 9-0-0 with all Boardmembers voting yes and Boardmember Miller being absent.