



City of San Diego
Parks and Recreation Board Meeting Minutes
Thursday, September 19, 2024

“TO PROVIDE HEALTHY, SUSTAINABLE, AND ENRICHING ENVIRONMENTS FOR ALL”

Meeting Held by In Person and Teleconference:

This meeting was held at the Balboa Park Club Santa Fe Room and remotely using the Zoom Webinar platform and was streamed online. The public was invited to join the meeting by phone or computer, as well as invited to submit “Public Comments” in writing via a webform. The form was made available on the Parks and Recreation website at <https://www.sandiego.gov/park-and-recreation/general-info/boards>.

NOTE: Both verbal and written communication were used by Board Members, City staff, and presenters during the meeting. City staff also used the screen-share function to allow viewers to view content shared by the speaker which included PowerPoint presentations and websites.

Before the meeting was called to order, City staff read instructions to the public regarding technical procedures for making live public comment during the webinar.

Members Present	Members Absent	City Staff Present
Nick Anastasopoulos (Virtual) Martin Armstrong Marcella Bothwell Dr. Andrea Dooley Shaina Gross Rick Gulley Daniele Laman Dr. Judith Munoz Allison Soares Agatha Wein	Evelyn Smith	Michelle Abella-Shon Ryan Barbrick Mark Berninger Karen Dennison (Virtual) Gina Dulay Andy Field Ilisa Goldman (Virtual) Salome Martinez (Virtual) Nicole McNeil Louis Merlin Elvi Ricafort Andre Smith Gabriela Verendia

CALL TO ORDER – The meeting was called to order by Chair Marcella Bothwell at 2:05 p.m.

APPROVAL OF BOARD MEMBER ANASTASOPOULOS REMOTELY PARTICIPATING IN THE MEETING

MOTION/SECONDED:

Ms. Bothwell/Mr. Gulley

September 19, 2024

Parks and Recreation Board Minutes – **DRAFT**

Page 2

Before the roll call, a motion was made by Chair Bothwell to approve the remote participation of Mr. Anastasopoulos, who participated from Kansas City. Motion was approved 6-0-2 and passed unanimously with the following vote: Yea: Shaina Gross, Rick Gulley, Daniele Laman, Dr. Judith Munoz, Allison Soares, and Agatha Wein. Recused: None. Abstained: Nick Anastasopoulos and Marcella Bothwell. Not Present: Martin Armstrong, Dr. Andrea Dooley, and Evelyn Smith.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF JULY 18, 2024

MOTION/SECONDED:

Ms. Laman/Mr. Gulley

A motion was made by Ms. Laman to approve the minutes with several corrections for the non-agenda public comment and board comments sections. This motion was seconded by Mr. Gulley. The motion was approved 8-0-1 and passed unanimously with the following vote: Yea: Nick Anastasopoulos, Martin Armstrong, Marcella Bothwell, Shaina Gross, Rick Gulley, Daniele Laman, Allison Soares, and Agatha Wein. Recused: None. Abstained: Dr. Judith Munoz. Not Present: Dr. Andrea Dooley and Evelyn Smith.

Public Comments:

No public comments on the meeting minutes.

Board Comments: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT:

Anne Fege presented a survey of trees in neighborhood parks that highlighted inequities in parks located in historically disadvantaged communities. Her written comments are attached to the minutes. She highlighted a need for a tree inventory for all parks.

David Moty from the Kensington-Talmadge community discussed the concerns related to the recreation value points scoring for the ongoing community plan update for Mid-City Communities. He provided a system diagram, which is attached to the minutes.

Juan Cruz from the Mount Hope community spoke about the community event coming on October 12, 2024, at 10 a.m., at Dennis V. Allen Park and invited Board members to attend.

REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCE: None.

COMMITTEE REPORTS:

- Balboa Park Committee – Ms. Soares reported that there was a relatively short meeting last month. A significant topic at the meeting was the connections report linking San Diego High School to Balboa Park.
- Mission Bay Park Committee – Dr. Munoz reported that funding was allocated toward playgrounds, parking lots, and restrooms. She also reported updates on SeaWorld fireworks, beach fires, and a general development plan amendment for South Shores.

September 19, 2024

Parks and Recreation Board Minutes – **DRAFT**

Page 3

- Mission Trails Regional Park Citizens' Advisory Committee – Mr. Gulley reported the last meeting was September 3, 2024, a joint meeting between the Task Force and Citizens' Advisory Committee to reallocate funds between projects (West Sycamore Staging Area and Old Mission Dam Dredging). Topics included the Pure Water project, East Elliott land acquisition, and the proposed Max Lenail Bridge.
- San Diego Parks Foundation – Chair Bothwell reported on fall fund raising for the Foundation, including an experiential opportunity to learn more about the conditions of parks in historically disadvantaged communities. The walk in the park event is on November 1, 2024, from 6:00 p.m. to 9:00 p.m. Details are in the following flyer.

You are invited!

San Diego Parks Foundation
A Walk in the Park *Creating Connections
Cultivating Memories*

Did you know...
Many of our parks richest in San Diego history and significance are also in the greatest need of our help.
Experience "A Walk in the Park" and discover eight of San Diego's historic parks while enjoying park themed activities, cuisine, and beverages, uncovering what makes these eight parks part of such a vibrant community. Your attendance and funds raised throughout the evening will support our mission in making parks accessible, healthy and fun for all San Diegans.

Date: Friday, November 1st, 2024 | VIP Reception 5:30pm | General Reception 6pm
Location: University Club atop Symphony Towers
Register: \$150/person SanDiegoParksFoundation.org/walkinthepark
Dress: "Parks" Cocktail Attire - bring your best green!
Parking: Complimentary valet parking

Event Contact: Kayla@SanDiegoParksFoundation.org | Tax ID: 83-2553368

CHAIR COMMENTS:

Chair Bothwell had no additional comments after providing the San Diego Parks Foundation update.

BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS:

Ms. Laman noted that in reference to the Mid-City Communities Plan Update, she is looking forward to a Recreation Value Points tutorial at a future Area Committee meeting and would like to receive tutorial training for the future parks master plan updates. Ms. Laman is looking forward to hearing updates on aquatics and pool scheduling. She noted that Crawford High School students can take water safety classes, which will eventually qualify them for the junior lifeguards program from October to December at the Colina del Sol Pool. At the Mid-City Gymnasium, badminton is being offered on Thursday afternoons. She also invited everyone to the Hispanic Heritage month celebration at the Dennis V. Allen Park on October 12, 2004 from 10:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m.

DIRECTORS REPORT: Director Field provided the Board with the following updates:

Area Committee:

The consolidated area committee has met twice over the past two months, on August 14 and September 4. The next meeting is on October 9, 2024. Agendas, minutes, and reports can be found at <https://www.sandiego.gov/park-and-recreation/general-info/boards/cp1ac> or <https://www.sandiego.gov/park-and-recreation/general-info/boards/cp2ac>.

Balboa Park Update:

- **Botanical Building:** The first phase of work is rapidly nearing completion. The prime construction contractor will transfer the building back to the Department in October 2024, and the hope is to open the building for San Diegans to enjoy in early December 2024, hopefully in time for December Nights. As the opening date and grand opening celebration becomes known, staff will provide this information to the Board. A second phase is underway currently, and that will include garden restoration in the area around the building.
- **Pershing Bikeway along Balboa Park:** The Pershing Bikeway project is complete and now open to the public for use. Find more information here: <https://www.sandag.org/news/sandag-celebrates-opening-of-pershing-bikeway-2024-07-27>.
- **Starlight Bowl Requests for Proposal (RFP):** The City of San Diego is looking for organizations or individuals interested in bringing the historic and famed Starlight Bowl in Balboa Park back to life. The request for proposal can be accessed through the City’s website: <https://www.sandiego.gov/insidesd/city-san-diego-seeking-rehabilitate-and-reopen-starlight-bowl>. Proposals must be submitted by 4 p.m. on November 14, 2024.
- **State of Balboa Park:** On August 8, 2024, Mayor Gloria presented his State of Balboa Park Address at the San Diego Natural History Museum. Click on the following link for more info and a video: <https://www.sandiego.gov/insidesd/mayor-gloria-highlights-power-partnerships-second-annual-state-balboa-park-address>.
- **World Design Capital Exchange Pavilion:** The World Design Experience Opening Celebration, is happening at the Exchange Pavilion on September 19, 2024, from 6:00 p.m. to 9:00 p.m.
- **Haunted Trails** is coming soon to the West Mesa of Balboa Park. Haunted Trail will be operating between September 27 and November 2, 2024. Webpage link: <https://hauntedtrail.net/>.
- **Balboa Park Committee:** The next scheduled meeting will occur on Thursday, October 3, 2024, from 4:00 p.m. to 6:00 p.m. Find more information here: <https://www.sandiego.gov/park-and-recreation/general-info/boards/bpc>.
- **Balboa Park Events Calendar:** City of San Diego staff will soon be adding a link to Balboa Park’s webpage to display a calendar of events that are permitted in the park. The calendar will not be for every activity in the park; however, it will display larger activities/events with 100 or more people in attendance. Look for this addition in October.

Budget Update:

- Director Field provided an update on the Fiscal Year 2024 Year-End Financial Performance Report:
 - October 9, 2024 – Department of Finance releases report

- October 16, 2024 – Budget and Government Efficiency Committee reviews
- October 28, 2024 – City Council reviews the report
- **Five-Year Financial Outlook (Fiscal Year 2026 through 2030):** The Department is preparing its initial submission for this effort, which will be released publicly later this fall.
- **Fiscal Year 2025 First Quarter Budget Monitoring:** The reporting period ends on September 30, 2024, so the Department will prepare its submission in October for a report that will be released before the end of the calendar year.

Childcare Updates: No new updates since last month. The latest information on cultivating a care-friendly city can be found at <https://www.sandiego.gov/child-youth-success/early-learning>. Resources for initiating a childcare business can be found on this landing page.

City Parks in the News:

- **Beyer Community Park Groundbreaking:** Construction of this new park in San Ysidro/Otay Mesa began the week of August 20, 2024. On September 5, 2024, the community celebrated a groundbreaking of this new park at 8:00 a.m. Both Mayor Todd Gloria and Councilmember Vivian Moreno attended, along with guests from various agencies and nonprofits that have supported this park through several grant awards and partnerships. The first phase of this project is anticipated to be completed in spring 2026.

Link: <https://www.nbcsandiego.com/news/local/after-50-years-city-to-begin-construction-on-beyer-park-in-san-ysidro/3602865/>
- **“Bubble Pirate” Cited for Littering:** A park ranger cited a performer for littering prohibited fluids at La Jolla Cove on August 24, 2024. The Department values the rights of community members to engage in expressive activity in City parks, including artistic expression. This requires those engaging in these activities to do so in accordance with other City codes and regulations, including those related to littering and disposal of waste.

Link: <https://fox5sandiego.com/news/local-news/bubble-pirate-cited-for-littering-during-public-performance/>
- **Clairemont Family Day:** On September 14, 2024, South Clairemont Community Park and Clairemont Pool hosted the 35th Annual Clairemont Family Day, with AquaFest, a classic car show, food, games, and a variety of vendors available for attendees. Director Field helped to open the event.

Link: <https://www.clairemontfamilyday.com/>
- **Grape Street Park Renaming Ceremony on September 14, 2024:** Two San Diego police officers who died in the line of duty back in 1984 are being honored 40 years later. September 14, 2024, marked 40 years since San Diego Police Officers Kimberly Tonahill and Timothy Ruopp were both fatally shot by an armed suspect while issuing

a citation at Grape Street Park. To honor their bravery, Grape Street Park in San Diego's South Park neighborhood at 28th Street and Grape Street was officially renamed as to "Officer Tonahill and Officer Ruopp Memorial Park" during a public ceremony at 10:00 a.m. on September 14, 2024.

Link: <https://fox5sandiego.com/news/local-news/san-diego-park-to-be-renamed-in-honor-of-officers-killed-40-years-ago/>

- **“Inside San Diego” Launches:** San Diegans can obtain daily news and updates from the City via email or text. Subscribe to Inside San Diego at <https://public.govdelivery.com/accounts/CASANDIEGO/signup/39972> or <http://sandiego.gov/insidesd> to receive the latest from the City. In addition, Mayor Gloria's weekly newsletters are available at <https://app.indigov.com/pub/b2625fa8-465a-43e8-a11b-26b72dcb31c8/subscriptions/new>.
- **Mira Mesa Community Park Phase 2 Expansion:** The official groundbreaking ceremony is scheduled for Wednesday, September 25th at 10:15 a.m. to celebrate the recently started construction of the renovations at Mira Mesa Community Park, including upgrades to the Gil Johnson Recreation Center. Board members and members of the public are welcome to attend this event, which will feature Mayor Todd Gloria and Councilmember Kent Lee.

With the start of construction at this park, an opinion piece from the Times of San Diego on August 29, 2024, noted that the project will remove numerous mature trees and questioned why the project design required so many tree removals. To accommodate the proposed improvements at the site, 68 trees will be removed, and four trees will be relocated to a different area of the park. To offset the tree removals, 75 new trees will be planted throughout the park, increasing the total number of trees. There are also 81 trees that will remain in place, untouched.

Link: <https://timesofsandiego.com/opinion/2024/08/29/why-must-improving-mira-mesa-community-park-require-removal-of-mature-trees/>.

- **Ocean Beach Pier Will Not Reopen:** On August 23, 2024, the City indicated it will no longer work toward repairing the existing Ocean Beach Pier. The 58-year-old pier (built in 1966) has been closed since it was damaged by high surf in October 2023. The City has spent at least \$1.7 million on temporary fixes over the past five years, and the pier's been closed about 30% of the time since early 2019. Further damage occurred last December when a support bracket broke off and fell into the ocean. A report by Moffatt and Nichol provides a detailed analysis of the pier; it can be found at https://www.sandiego.gov/sites/default/files/2024-08/08-22-24-final-ob-pier-2024-stabilization-concepts-memo-3_r3-compiled.pdf.

Efforts are focused on replacement options. Information on the proposed replacement is available at <https://www.sandiego.gov/cip/ocean-beach-pier-renewal>. A State grant in the amount of \$8.4 million is funding initial design work on the replacement pier.

Links: <https://www.nbcsandiego.com/news/local/ocean-beach-pier-wont-reopen-replacement-repairs/3604980/> and <https://www.axios.com/local/san-diego/2024/08/23/ocean-beach-pier-closed-storm-damage-new-structure>.

- **Olive Grove Community Park Improvements:** On September 12, 2024, Mayor Todd Gloria, Clairemont leaders, nearby residents, and local students from nearby Lafayette Elementary School celebrated the groundbreaking of Olive Grove Community Park. This small ceremony initiates a project that will be under construction through Fall 2025. Improvements will include new playground, upgraded restroom, field and court renovations, and accessibility improvements. Additional project information is available on the project webpage, which can be reached at: <https://cipapp.sandiego.gov/CIPDetail.aspx?ID=S15028>.

Link: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1LkcMvT13xA>

- **Rancho Bernardo Dog Park:** Recently CBS 8 ran a piece on planned improvements at Rancho Bernardo Dog Off Leash Area with concerns of the time taken to bring the project to completion.

The Rancho Bernardo Dog Park scope of work includes designing and constructing new sidewalks within the park and sidewalk along West Bernardo Drive, numerous accessibility improvements throughout the park and parking spaces in the parking lot. Within the dog park, the project will add an eight to ten-foot-wide strip of synthetic turf, new drinking fountains, and new site furnishings. Cost increases are related to community-requested amenities such as shade structures, improvements within the dog parks, and additional shade trees.

Currently, the project is in the Final Design stage, which is expected to be completed by the fall of 2024. The advertising and awarding processes are estimated to occur from winter 2024 through spring 2025, and construction is anticipated to begin in summer 2025, contingent on funding availability.

Current funding sources are General Fund 100012 and Antenna lease funds, Impact Fees Funds 400099 and 400892, and a Grant Fund of \$157k.

- Funding to Date: \$2.8 million
- Total Project Cost: \$5.15 million
- Funding need: \$2.3 million

The Department is examining all avenues to bridge the funding gap. That includes allocations of the Citywide Park Development Impact Fees (DIF), local DIF, and general fund allocations. This includes looking comprehensively at the Citywide DIF and will propose shifting funds between projects using cash flow principles to help this project become fully funded by mid-year.

Link: <https://www.cbs8.com/video/news/local/working-for-you/whats-going-on-with-the-rancho-bernardo-dog-park-repairs/509-d6a348fc-f807-4e33-9e60-da08eb52c114>

- **Swan Canyon Mural:** In City Heights, near the intersection of Quince Street and 45th Street, Senior Park Ranger Erika Weikel partnered with Canyonlands, the Office of Council President Sean Elo-Rivera, and local artist Shayne Osequera to paint a mural on a frequently graffitied retaining wall in Swan Canyon in City Heights. In August and September 2024, Mr. Osequera sketched the artwork on the wall and is working alongside park rangers and volunteers to paint it. Murals often get tagged, which is why Mr. Osequera has offered to provide continued maintenance on the mural and work with the community on other art projects. Once the mural is completed, staff can provide Board members with a photo of the finished product.

Link: ABC 10 News provided a minute and a half report on the mural's ongoing progress. See <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wyopUN38LSU> for more.

- **World Design Capital Exchange Pavilion in Balboa Park Opens:** On August 14, 2024, the new Exchange Pavilion opened in the Plaza de Panama in Balboa Park, next to the San Diego Museum of Art. Part of the World Design Capital designation shared by San Diego and Tijuana, this pavilion consists of a curving orange wall held by a white metal structure that mimics the border wall, with a gap at the bottom that lets people enter the pavilion. Lectures and other activations are planned through the fall, including "Envision Balboa Park" on Thursday October 3, 2024, at 1:00 p.m. The Exchange Pavilion will remain in place until around Thanksgiving.

Link: <https://www.kpbs.org/news/local/2024/08/14/pavilion-in-balboa-park-celebrates-san-diego-tijuana-as-world-design-capital>

Community Recreation Groups and Council Policy 700-42 Reform:

Preparations for an update to Council Policy 700-42 for Community Recreation Groups is still under development. Public input on the draft policy would include a workshop here at the Parks and Recreation Board and at the Area Committee, with the possibility of an ad-hoc committee for additional review and comment as needed.

Employees of the Quarter:

- **Employees of the Year:** The Department is proud to announce seven (7) employees of the year for Fiscal Year 2024, which ended on June 30, 2024:
 - Fabian Alvarez, Swimming Pool Manager I, Bud Kearns Pool
 - Ulises Alvarez, Tree Trimmer, Citywide Park Forestry Unit
 - Adolfo Herrera, Recreation Center Director III, Cabrillo Recreation Center
 - Rosa Moore, Senior Management Analyst, Golf Division
 - Tan Nguyen, Utility Worker II, Citywide Playground Repair Unit

- Steven Smith, Senior Park Ranger, Tri Canyon Open Space (Tecolote Canyon, Rose Canyon, and Marian Bear)
- Maria Villegas, Senior Clerk Typist, Permit Center for Regional Parks

Their recognition is posted at <https://www.sandiego.gov/park-and-recreation/general-info/employee-of-the-quarter>.

- **Heart of Service Award:** The Department is considering a recommendation from the Area Committee to create an application process for members of the community to nominate a City employee for good customer service in a manner similar to employee of the quarter. This is currently under development.

Parks Master Plan and City Planning Updates:

- **City Planning Work Plan:** The City Planning Department Fiscal Year 2025 Work Program includes all the major planning initiatives and year-round planning work underway, along with estimated completion dates and implementation status.

The work program includes ongoing work and as well as new planning initiatives that provide an actionable roadmap toward our mission to plan for an equitable and sustainable future with affordable homes, good jobs, infrastructure, and public spaces for the people of San Diego.

The work plan is available on the City’s webpage at

<https://www.sandiego.gov/sites/default/files/planning-work-programs.pdf> or <https://www.sandiego.gov/planning/work/working-on>.

- **Chollas Creek Watershed Regional Park Master Plan Update:** Information on the development of the master plan is available at <https://www.sandiego.gov/planning/chollas-creek-master-plan>.
- **Community Plan Updates:** The latest information can be found on the City Planning Department’s webpage at <https://www.sandiego.gov/planning/community-plans/updates>.
 - Mid-City Communities Plan Update
 - College Area Community Plan Update
 - Clairemont Community Plan Update
- **Parks Master Plan:** As noted at the July meeting, Parks and Recreation Department staff is preparing a Status Update of Parks Master Plan Policies and Recommendations for fall 2024. This update will provide the status of responding to the following 142 policies and recommendations (sorted by category):
 - Access: 6 recommendations
 - Activation: 7 recommendations
 - Arts and Culture: 14 recommendations

- Co-Benefits: 9 recommendations
- Community Building: 8 recommendations
- Conservation, Sustainability, and Resilience: 31 recommendations
- Equity : 11 recommendations
- Funding: 16 recommendations
- Mobility as Recreation: 4 recommendations
- Operations and Maintenance: 11 recommendations
- Parks and Programming: 14 recommendations
- Partnerships : 4 recommendations
- Regional Parks: 7 recommendations

The Parks Master Plan and related documents can be found at the Parks for All of Us webpage (<https://www.sandiego.gov/parks-for-all-of-us>) or <https://www.sandiego.gov/planning/parks-master-plan>.

- **Recreation Value Points (RVP):** The City Planning Department is finalizing calculations and will load all RVP calculations onto the City webpage. Once this occurs, staff will provide a link.
- **Trails Master Plan:** No update. The latest information can be found at <https://www.sandiego.gov/planning/citywide-trails-master-plan>.

Recreation Programs: Summer programming ended with the completion of Parks After Dark, summer camps, and a variety of other programs. School is now back in session.

- **Fall Festivals:** For information on fall programming, visit the recreation center webpages (<https://www.sandiego.gov/park-and-recreation/centers>), including the Department’s Fall Event List at <https://www.sandiego.gov/sites/default/files/2024-08/2024-fall-events-flyer.pdf>. This includes events centered around the upcoming Halloween events around the City.
- **Event Calendar:** <https://www.sandiego.gov/park-and-recreation/event-calendar>.
- **Permits:** <https://www.sandiego.gov/park-and-recreation/parks/permits> (information on permits, events, and special use permits)

Recruitment Update: The Department currently has a 21% vacancy rate and is hiring. Each department must submit a “request to fill” for each position hired, which has slowed hiring. Interviews are being conducted currently for several roles, including entry-level positions.

Here are some jobs currently open for application. Please pass this information along to interested parties/prospective applicants:

Position	Salary	Closing date
Aquatics Technician II	\$26.41 – \$31.46/hr	9/9/2024

Position	Salary	Closing date
Electrician	\$34.63 - \$41.57/hr	Continuous
Grounds Maintenance Worker II	\$22.28 - \$26.52/hr	Continuous
Heavy Truck Driver I	\$24.20 - \$28.85/hr	9/3/2024
Irrigation Specialist	\$25.92 - \$31.00/hr	9/16/2024
Management Trainee	\$26.14 - \$31.54/hr	9/9/2024
Pesticide Applicator	\$27.03 - \$32.24/hr	Continuous
Pool Guard I	\$18.51 - \$22.29/hr	Continuous
Pool Guard II	\$20.31 - \$24.47/hr	Continuous
Recreation Aide	\$18.70/hr	Continuous
Recreation Center Director I	\$24.95 - \$30.05/hr	9/3/2024
Recreation Center Director II	\$26.82 - \$32.26/hr	9/3/2024
Recreation Leader I	\$17.64 - \$19.29/hr	Continuous
Recreation Leader II	\$18.47 - \$22.25/hr	Continuous
Senior Management Analyst	\$42.03 - \$50.82/hr	9/16/2024
Senior Planner	\$48.51 - \$58.66/hr	9/3/2024
Seven-Gang Mower Operator	\$25.19 - \$30.17/hr	9/16/2024
Supervising Aquatics Recreation Specialist	\$34.77 - \$42.13/hr	9/16/2024
Supervising Management Analyst	\$45.06 - \$54.59/hr	9/16/2024
Swimming Pool Manager I	\$23.34 - \$28.07/hr	Continuous
Swimming Pool Manager II	\$27.30 - \$32.98/hr	Continuous
Swimming Pool Manager III	\$30.06 - \$36.29/hr	Continuous
Water Safety Instructor	\$18.51 - \$22.29/hr	Continuous

Two management-level unclassified positions are also open for recruitment:

- **Mission Bay Shoreline Deputy Director:** This position oversees, plans, and directs the maintenance and operations of parks located in Mission Bay and along the San Diego Shoreline.
- **Land Acquisition Program Coordinator:** This new position will develop a program to acquire parkland by identifying funding for and priority areas for building new parks and securing land rights, easements, and land contracts to build more parks.

Senior Affairs Advisory Board: Created in 2000, SDMC Section 26.15 authorizes the Senior Affairs Advisory Board to serve in an advisory capacity to the Mayor and City Council on policy and issues relating to transportation, security at home, improved intergenerational interaction, meal delivery, housing, improved City-County cooperation, and other related issues.

The Board will make recommendations for improving communications between seniors and City government; review City employment policies for seniors; perform studies and surveys as requested by the Mayor and Council; advise on relevant issues and formation of laws, policies, or procedures which may affect seniors; and report annually to the Mayor and Council on the "State of the Seniors" within the City.

September 19, 2024

Parks and Recreation Board Minutes – DRAFT

Page 12

Recently, the Board was constituted with new members and plans to meet later this fall. Information on the Board can be found at <https://www.sandiego.gov/city-clerk/boards-commissions/senioraffairs>.

Torrey Pines Golf Course Clubhouse Project: Over the past few months, the Golf Division has been working with the Engineering and Capital Projects (E&CP) Department to procure a design consultant for the Torrey Pines Golf Course Facility Master Plan and Phase I project.

Currently, E&CP has received proposals, conducted interviews, and identified the most qualified architectural consultant, prioritizing their specialized experience and engineering knowledge in renowned golf course facilities.

Under the agreement, the consultant's scope of work can be summarized by two primary deliverables:

1. Prepare and build a comprehensive master plan for the Torrey Pines Golf Course Facilities and its ancillary structures.
2. Prepare bridging documents (30% design plans and permit packages) for the construction of a proposed Phase I of this master plan, which will include a new clubhouse and maintenance facility.

Prior to kicking off the scope of work, City project staff would like to meet with interested stakeholders, including Board members, to familiarize everyone with the project and hear concerns and priorities regarding the improvements to the overall facility. The goal is to ensure the project team can work collaboratively on the master plan components for the Torrey Pines campus and develop an agenda and roadmap for a successful project. On August 30, 2024, Director Field provided a copy of the RFP to the Board members.

Examples of the items for upcoming meeting agendas are, but not limited to, the following:

- Coordination and collaboration in design and construction
- Design Criteria
- Access and views
- Phasing schedules
- Timing of construction

The first meeting has not yet been scheduled and a project webpage has not yet been created, but once the meeting date is known and webpage created, staff will provide that information to Board members.

Webpage Updates: Please visit <https://www.sandiego.gov/parks-and-recreation> for all the latest information on the Department.

Retirement and Thank You to Kelly Wood: Director Field shared that Ms. Kelly Wood recently retired as the Area Manager serving parks in the Navajo community. Director Field shared that Ms. Wood has done fantastic work, and he acknowledged her as one of the Parks and Recreation Department's outstanding employees.

Aquatics Update: Director Field invited Ms. McNeil to share her thoughts on Ms. Laman's questions about the scheduling of pools around holidays. Ms. McNeil informed the Board

that City pools are closed on holidays because staff members must take the day off. She shared that there is a plan to open pools on holidays utilizing hourly staff, most likely starting with the Memorial Day holiday. Director Field also added that due to the department's budget challenges, they don't have the ability to pay overtime to permitting staff to work on holidays.

Other Topics for Discussion:

Mr. Anastasopoulos asked about the Crystal Pier. Director Field responded that the Crystal Pier is owned partially by the City and partially by the Crystal Pier Hotel, a private property owner. Roughly one-third of the pier is owned privately, and the remaining two-thirds are owned by the City. The middle third of the pier is currently leased to the private property owner that operates the Crystal Pier Hotel. The hotel operates the first two-thirds of the pier, which is the widest section closest to the shoreline and farthest from the surf. The last third of the pier was heavily damaged during the same king tide that severely damaged the Ocean Beach Pier. An emergency project is planned to repair Crystal Pier where the piles and braces that hold up the pier have fallen into the ocean. As a result of the damage, Crystal Pier has been closed for public access. Staff anticipates that the emergency project is going to construction later this year. Work will begin once a permit is obtained from the California Coastal Commission.

REQUEST FOR CONTINUANCE: None

CONSENT ITEMS: None

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

101. City of San Diego Park Board Chair's "Community Hero Award"

Chair Bothwell recommended presenting the first-ever Community Hero Award to Gary Blume from the Total Altruism Project. Mr. Blume remarked on his efforts to provide trash removal equipment in various parks and looks forward to expanding the program.

MOTION/SECONDED:

Ms. Laman/Ms. Gross

A motion was made by Ms. Gross to approve award of Community Hero Award to Gary Blume and seconded by Ms. Laman. The motion was approved 9-0-0 and passed unanimously with the following vote: Yea: Nick Anastasopoulos, Martin Armstrong, Marcella Bothwell, Shaina Gross, Rick Gulley, Daniele Laman, Dr. Judith Munoz Allison Soares, and Agatha Wein. Recused: None. Abstained: None. Not Present: Dr. Andrea Dooley and Evelyn Smith.

Public Comments:

No public comments were received on this item.

Board Comments:

No board comments were received on this item.

INFORMATION ITEMS

201. San Diego Human Society Update

Ms. Juliana Tetlow and Chief Jace Huggins presented a status update on the animal services program managed by the San Diego Humane Society (SDHS).

Public Comments:

No public comments were received on this item.

Board Comments:

Dr. Munoz asked what percentage of the costs are covered by the SDHS contract with the City. Ms. Tetlow responded it was around 60 to 70%.

Ms. Wein recently adopted an animal who otherwise would have gone to the SDHS shelter. She expressed gratitude with the process to adopt and noted the value of the work of SDHS. She asked about the partnership with homelessness efforts in the City. Ms. Tetlow described the outreach program associated with people experiencing homelessness including assistance for their pets.

Ms. Gross asked about off leash enforcement and whether maintenance staff or other staff could provide enforcement. Director Field responded that most onsite staff are neither trained nor empowered to provide enforcement roles; park rangers and SDHS officers are among the few in the Department assigned enforcement roles. SDHS Chief Huggins noted his team's efforts in outreach and working with off leash dogs is challenging and requires special skills.

Dr. Munoz asked if off leash enforcement can be trained to the Department's staff. Director Field indicated it could not since it is not a job duty and is unsafe. Park rangers are the official enforcement arm of the Department, along with the contract with SDHS.

Ms. Soares commented that she loved the logo. She thinks it is cool and trendy to wear on a T-shirt and would be good for volunteers at the park as a friendly reminder for the public. Ms. Tetlow noted SDHS is considering the evolution of the program. The initial idea of the volunteer program was a face-to-face education campaign which is not advisable at this time.

Ms. Laman asked if SDHS is partnering with San Diego Unified School District (SDUSD) and whether there is a top ten list of worst offending joint use locations with off leash dogs, including joint use sites that may have seen reduced public hours during the week due to extensive off leash use. Ms. Tetlow noted that the program has shifted to focus on a variety of enforcement measures and stated that SDHS is working toward a more equitable approach to addressing enforcement on a Council District by Council District basis. Director Field further noted that it is true that some SDUSD joint use locations have had public hours reduced or restricted due to dog off leash issues that have not been resolved through enforcement via San Diego Humane Society. Ms. Laman asked for more financial information to be included in the next annual presentation. Ms. Tetlow agreed.

September 19, 2024

Parks and Recreation Board Minutes - **DRAFT**

Page 15

Chair Bothwell asked for a copy of the list of joint use locations with curtailed hours due to extensive off leash activity. Director Field indicated he would provide that information to the Board.

202. Habitat Restoration on the Del Mar Mesa Preserve

Natural Resources Manager Mark Berninger introduced David Hogan from the Chaparral Lands Conservancy to discuss restoration activities at Del Mar Mesa Preserve

Public Comments:

Anne Fege indicated there is a need for trail user education and enforcement as resources become available. She is concerned about the plan and hopes lessons learned can be shared from projects such as this one.

Shital Parikh from Friends of Del Mar Mesa, a nonprofit organization, why Mr. Hogan did not approach the nonprofit and the planning group to share the project particulars.

Board Comments:

Mr. Gulley noted that he is the president of Torrey Pines Conservancy, which has funded work in Los Penasquitos in the past.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 4:10 p.m.

Copies of the reports, attachments, PowerPoint presentations, and audio-video recordings can be found on the Parks and Recreation Department website at <http://www.sandiego.gov/parkandrecboard/reports>.

Next Calendared Meeting: October 17, 2024 at 2:00 p.m.

Submitted by,

Andy Field
Director
Parks and Recreation Department

Survey of Trees in Neighborhood Parks:

Differences in Low- and High-equity Parks the City of San Diego

September 16, 2024 Draft Report

Anu Sethuraman, Jason Sheu (students), Keith Pezzoli
(professor) and Anne Fege (urban forester)

UC San Diego



in

Abstract

A tree inventory was completed for fourteen (14) neighborhood parks in the City of San Diego, by urban planning students at the University of California, San Diego. These parks were located in census tracts that have both low and high Climate Equity Index (CEI) scores. Students organized the project, collected tree inventories, analyzed the data, and directly observed differences among communities. The tree inventory showed that there were larger trees, more trees, and more trees per acre in parks located in high CEI areas.

Introduction

Trees are the dominant nature in most neighborhood parks, appreciated for their shade, local nature, beauty, and more. The City of San Diego (City) revised its [Parks Master Plan](#) in 2021,¹ and identified two tree-related benefits, that people are much likelier to visit a park if the path to the park is shaded by large trees (p. 97), and that trees and shady parks reduce heat, serving as natural cooling centers for residents (p. 111).

Yet parks, trees, green space, and urban nature are often far fewer and less accessible in neighborhoods with greater inequity. The City has census tracts with different Climate Equity Index (CEI) levels, and the project was intended to assess differences in the trees in neighborhood parks in census tracts with both low and high CEI scores.

These park trees were mapped in 2022 by students at the University of California, San Diego (UCSD). Students were participating informally in “citizen science” (or civic science), which is public engagement in the study, management, and care of urban trees. Civic science has been increasing in urban forestry, as volunteers are engaged in tree inventories and monitoring.²

Methodology

This tree mapping and inventory project was conducted in a class at the University of California, San Diego, “Urban Studies and Planning 2: Urban World System.” Students inventoried the trees in 14 parks in the City, all “neighborhood parks,” which are defined to serve a population of 5,000 people and be accessible by walking or biking within roughly one mile.³

¹ General Plan, Recreation Element, Table RE-2 Parks Guidelines, page 30,

<https://www.sandiego.gov/sites/default/files/legacy/planning/genplan/pdf/generalplan/adoptedrecelem.pdf>

² Roman, Lara A.; Scharenbroch, Bryant C.; Ostberg, Johan P.A.; Mueller, Lee S.; Henning, Jason G.; Koeser, Andrew K.; Sanders, Jessica R.; Betz, Daniel R.; Jordan, Rebecca C. 2017. Data quality in citizen science urban tree inventories. *Urban Forestry & Urban Greening*. 22: 124-135.

https://www.fs.usda.gov/nrs/pubs/jrnl/2017/nrs_2017_roman_001.pdf

³ City of San Diego, Recreation Element of the General Plan, page 13,

<https://www.sandiego.gov/sites/default/files/legacy/planning/genplan/pdf/generalplan/adoptedrecelem.pdf>

Parks were chosen to represent a gradient of socioeconomic status, decided by analyzing the Climate Equity Index (CEI).⁴ The Climate Equity Index is a metric created by the City of San Diego that combines a variety of environmental, mobility, health, socioeconomic (from the 2020 census), and housing indicators to assign a value to each census tract relating to its potential climate change impact (cite).

For this project, to sample across a gradient of climate equity, parks were chosen that were geographically located in census tracts designated at different CEI levels. Parks with a CEI score of under 70 were designated as having a low CEI score, and parks with a CEI score over 65 were designated as having a high CEI score.

A student team provided the leadership for this project, including survey design, selection of neighborhood parks, field survey methodology and validation, instructions and support to students, data management, and analysis of results. Informal surveys were conducted at the beginning and end of the class. Survey content analysis was completed by a San Diego State University (SDSU) student, who was serving as an intern with Kate Sessions Commitment.

Students were allowed to choose which park they wished to sample through an online sign-up sheet, with multiple teams assigned to larger parks. Students were expected to be familiar with the methods and watch the training video (developed by an SDSU intern) before traveling to their assigned park site.

Students collected field data on their smartphones using the LimeSurvey platform to record data. They were required to upload four photos of each tree and record the GPS coordinates (using OpenStreetMap). Students measured the circumference with a tape measure, to later calculate dbh (diameter at breast height), estimated the tree height, and identified the species. Students could consult a guide with information about common local urban trees, but species are not included in the results as there was no professional verification of their identity.

The student team managed the collected data, prepared a final dataset with 643 trees, summarized the data, and evaluated the statistical significance of trees in neighborhood parks, in census tracts that had low or high Climate Equity scores.

Results

There were larger trees, more trees, and more trees per acre in high CEI score parks when compared with low CEI score parks, as shown in Table 1. On average, high CEI parks had larger and more numerous trees and larger park spaces in general. On average, trees in high CEI areas had diameters 6 inches larger than those found in low CEI parks.

A two-sample T-test was conducted on the data to determine the effect of CEI score on tree diameter and size, with a null hypothesis being that CEI score would not affect tree height and diameter. For tree height, the T-test score was 4.195, with a p-value of 3.247e-05. For tree diameter, the T-test score was 7.153, with a p-value of 2.6737e-12. With such low p-values, we reject both null hypotheses and find that the CEI score does result in different tree qualities. Furthermore, since tree diameter can be used to infer the amount of foliage a tree has, the difference in diameters supports the claim that populations in low CEI areas experience “tree inequity,” where their trees provide less shade, leading to a multitude of challenges for families in low CEI areas.

Since the project was student-run, class members were able to openly ask questions and impact the data-collection process. When surveyed about their experiences in the project, 35% of students stated that the ‘data’ aspect of the assignment, including entry and technology, etc., was the most memorable

⁴ San Diego's Climate Equity Index Report, https://www.sandiego.gov/sites/default/files/2019_climate_equity_index_report.pdf

component. Additionally, 36% of students cited ‘teamwork’ as a main takeaway from the project. Direct student involvement in data collection allowed for a less rigid student-student and student-faculty relationship and encouraged more collaboration and student empowerment.

Table 1: Comparison of tree numbers and size, in selected parks, in the City of San Diego

Neighborhood Park	CEI Score	# Trees	dbh	Height	Acres	Trees / Acre	Community
Dorothy Petway	25	36	9.8	27	2.7	13.2	SE San Diego
John F Kennedy	30	30	4.2	35	3.6	8.3	Encanto
Mountain View	34	60	9.8	22	14.3	4.2	SE San Diego 3
Grant Hill Park	43	21	33.3	36	1.9	10.8	SE San Diego 2
Cherokee Point	50	40	9.3	25	1.5	27.0	City Heights
Teralta	54	10	6.0	12	5.1	2.0	City Heights
Averages- low CEI	39.3	32.8	12.1	26.2	4.9	10.9	
Silver Wing	64	26	20.0	51	13.0	2.0	Otay Mesa/Nestor
Mesa Viking	67	40	21.0	77	6.6	6.0	Mira Mesa
Gershwin	68	111	19.1	39	5.5	20.4	Claremont Mesa
Edward Tyler Cramer	71	32	7.8	21	3.0	10.7	Linda Vista Miramar Ranch
Miramar Overlook	80	24	13.4	28	6.1	3.9	No.
Mission Hills	80	85	27.8	33	11.4	7.5	Uptown
Collier	83	36	14.5	22	5.7	6.3	Peninsula
Villa La Jolla	87	91	25.9	52	5.8	15.7	University
Averages—high CEI	75.0	55.6	18.7	40.2	7.1	10.8	

Discussion

There are clear differences in tree metrics between parks with high and low CEI scores. Parks in high CEI census tracts have more and larger trees, and therefore more shade and community benefits. In the City, the parks in low-CEI score areas have fewer trees, trees per acre, and smaller trees, illustrating that underserved communities in the City have “tree inequity.”

This project provided students with exposure to the concept of tree inequity, participation in data collection, and invitation to think critically about equity and climate action. Additionally, this kind of project allowed students to possibly envision potential future careers in urban planning and sustainable design, potentially influencing their passions and undergraduate goals.

Application of tree canopy mapping (with US TreeMap data) can add information about land cover types to the assessment (tree canopy, shrubs, grass, soil, and impervious area) of these and other neighborhood parks in the City. Full tree inventories of all neighborhood parks have not been made, but would provide meaningful information for park management, community benefits, and investments that advance tree equity.

Questions? Contact Anne Fege, Urban and Community Forester
anne@katestrees.org, 858-472-1293

SAN DIEGO PARK POINTS SYSTEM DIAGRAM

September 19, 2024

ALL COMMUNITY PLANNING AREA PARK SPACE						
REGIONAL PARKS	OPEN SPACE TRAILS & SHORELINE	YOUR COMMON CITY PARK (various sizes)				
7 pts For every ½ mile segment adjacent to planning area (Must have community entrance to count for community park points)	7 pts For every ½ mile of official trail or shoreline	PARK SIZE	PARK AMENITIES			
		7 pts Per acre	AMENITIES & RECREATION*			ACCESS & CONNECTIVITY
	0.875 Point increments for every 1/8 acre	Health & Fitness	Social Spaces	Site Amenities	(Fake Points) 77 Point Cap	(Uncommon) 42 Point Cap
	0.875	Grassy turf	Dog park	Restrooms	Near Transit	Trails (by water or thru habitat)
	1.750	Child play area	Food Concessions	Shade covers	Near Stores	Urban forestry
	2.625	Sports fields	Performance space	Amphitheater	Co-located w/ school/library	Programmed activity space
	3.500	Hardcourt games	Community garden	Public Art		
4.875...	7 pts For every access point (trails only)					

*Smaller parks (<3 acres) are required to have 14 points worth of amenities in 2 of the 3 A&R categories (3 pink columns above). Larger parks (>3 acres) are required to have 14 points worth of amenities in all 3 categories in order to create balanced, functional parks. If this requirement is not met, the Amenity & Recreation points are zeroed out, and 3.5 points are added back (Appendix D, pg 21).