



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: September 12, 2024 REPORT NO. HRB-24-034

HEARING DATE: September 26, 2024

SUBJECT: **ITEM #6 – Fox-Gaynes Realty Investment Company House**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Lars Bell Trust and Charlotte Randolph; represented by IS Architecture

LOCATION: 305 West Olive Street, Uptown Community, Council District 3
APN 452-707-1100

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Fox-Gaynes Realty Investment Company House located at 305 West Olive Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Fox-Gaynes Realty Investment Company House located at 305 West Olive Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1932 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1937 rear porch enclosure and addition, 1978 garage extension and the 1951 patio shade structure constructed outside of the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Monterey style and retains integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a two-story form, side gable roof with little eave overhang, full width second story balcony with wood railing covered by the resource's principal roof, stucco and board and batten exterior, multi-lite wood windows, decorative shutters and clay pipe attic vents.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource.

The property was identified in the 2016 *Uptown Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey Report* and given a Status Code of 5S3, "Appears to be individually eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the Fox-Gaynes Realty Investment Company House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the Fox-Gaynes Realty Investment Company, who constructed the house as a personal residence for business owners Samuel and Pauline Fox.

In order to be eligible for designation and listing on the City's Register, a resource must meet one or more of the City's designation criteria as specified in the Historical Resources Guidelines of the Land Development Manual and retain integrity as it relates to the significance of the resource. Integrity is the ability of a property to convey its significance, which requires an understanding of the physical features and characteristics that existed during the resource's period of significance. The National, California, and City of San Diego Registers recognize location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association as the seven aspects of historical integrity.

Although not all seven aspects of integrity need to be present for a property to be eligible for designation, the record must demonstrate that the property retains enough physical and design characteristics to reflect and convey the significance of the property. Each resource depends on certain aspects of integrity, more than others, to express its historic significance. Determining which of the aspects are most important to a particular property requires an understanding of the property's significance and its essential physical features. The [Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria](#) provide information regarding the City's designation criteria, as well as guidance on their application and how to evaluate the integrity of a resource.

ANALYSIS

The property located at 305 West Olive Street is a two-story, Monterey style single-family residential building constructed in 1932 in the Uptown Community Planning Area. Other buildings and structures present on site include a rear patio shade structure. The property is located on a corner lot at the intersection of West Olive Street, Barnson Place and Albatross Street on the edge of Maple Canyon. The property is in its original location.

Since its construction in 1932 the property has been modified as follows: in 1937, a rear one-story porch was enclosed and an addition was constructed on the canyon side of the house. A balcony was added to the rear addition in 1951 and was changed to include a glass railing sometime between 1987 and 2010. Also in 1951, a rear shade structure was constructed and the flagstone hardscaping at the front and rear were installed. The stone sitewall was constructed on Barnson Place sometime between 1970 and 1987. In 1978 an extension was added to the garage in order to accommodate larger sized cars. A historically inappropriate garage door replaced the original garage door circa 2016. Heritage Preservation staff worked with the applicant to restore the garage door consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards. Other modifications include the addition of a decorative screen door to the primary entrance circa 1970-1987 and the addition of a floral design window within the original opening on the second floor of the south façade circa 1987-2007

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by IS Architecture, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource was originally constructed in 1932 in the Monterey style. The two-story house features a low-pitched, side gable roof with little eave overhang. A garage with shed roof projects from the eastern side of the primary north façade. The primary entrance with transom window is centrally located on the north façade and is flanked by two multi-lite wood windows of different sizes. The large windows on the street facing north and west facades are accented by decorative wood shutters. The exterior is clad in stucco except for the second floor of the north façade and both sides of the garage which are clad in board and batten siding. A full width, cantilevered balcony is located on the south façade of the two-story portion of the house. The balcony features wood railing and is covered by the house's principal roof structure. Two French doors give access to the balcony from the second story and a decorative floral window is located in the center of the façade. A one-story wing projects from the southeast corner of the house towards Maple Canyon. Other character defining features present on the resource include multi-lite wood windows in various sizes and clay pipe attic vents.

The resource's backyard features a rear patio shade structure and attached uncovered patio with glass railing overlooking Maple Canyon. Hardscaping includes flagstone at the front entrance and rear courtyard. A stone site wall runs along Barson Place. Solar panels are located on the southern slope of the two-story portion of the house and are not easily visible from the ground.

The Monterey style is one of California's few indigenous architectural styles and was popular during the first half of the twentieth century. The style blended old Spanish building characteristics with the Anglo-influenced architectural language that was brought to California from New England. However, the characteristic full width, cantilevered balcony was derived from house forms built in the southeastern United States, the Caribbean, and the Bahamas. Character defining features of this style include low-pitched gabled or hipped roofs, and cantilevered second floor balconies with wood railings covered by the principal roof. It is not uncommon to have wood railings replaced with decorative iron railings in the Creole French variant. Roofs are usually covered in wood shingle or tile, and walls are typically clad in stucco, brick or wood. Door and window surrounds sometimes mimic the Territorial examples of the Spanish Colonial prototypes; paired windows and false shutters are common architectural details

Of the seven aspects of integrity, design, materials, and workmanship are the most critical to the property's ability to convey significance under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Monterey style. The property, which has been modified as detailed in the beginning of the analysis section of this report, has not been modified to the extent that it no longer retains its significance as a Monterey style residence. The 1937 rear porch enclosure and addition do not impact any of the resource's character defining features. The 1978 garage extension is differentiated from the original portion of the garage and is designed compatible with the historic structure. The rear shade structure is detached and does not detract from the main residence. Other modifications, such as the decorative screen door, flagstone hardscaping, stone site wall, floral window and solar panels are minor and do not have a negative impact on the resource's character defining features. Therefore, the property does retain integrity to its 1932 period of significance under HRB Criterion C.

Significance Statement: The resource continues to convey the historic significance of the Monterey style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a two-story form, side gable roof with little eave overhang, full width second story balcony with wood railing covered by the resource's principal roof, stucco and board and batten exterior, multi-lite wood windows, decorative shutters and clay pipe attic vents. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Fox-Gaynes Realty Investment Company House located at 305 West Olive Street be designated with a period of significance of 1932 under HRB Criterion C as an example of the Monterey style. The designation excludes the 1937 rear porch enclosure and addition, 1978 garage extension and the 1951 patio shade structure constructed outside of the period of significance.



Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison
City Planning Department

ss/SS

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 9/26/2024

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 9/26/2024, to consider the historical designation of the **Fox-Gaynes Realty Investment Company House** (owned by Lars Bell Trust 11-04-21 & Charlotte Randolph, 305 W. Olive Street, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **305 W. Olive Street, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **452-707-11-00**, further described as LOTS A & L ST CLSD ADJ & in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Fox-Gaynes Realty Investment Company House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics of the Monterey style and retains integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a two-story form, side gable roof with little eave overhang, full width second story balcony with wood railing covered by the resource's principal roof, stucco and board and batten exterior, multi-lite wood windows, decorative shutters and clay pipe attic vents. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 1937 rear porch enclosure and addition, 1978 garage extension and the 1951 patio shade structure constructed outside of the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _____
TIM HUTTER, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
Deputy City Attorney