

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: August 8, 2024 REPORT NO. HRB-24-030

HEARING DATE: August 22, 2024

SUBJECT: ITEM #4 - Karl and Mary Kreizinger/ Edward Depew House

RESOURCE INFO: California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link

APPLICANT: Herdell Family Trust 11-02-07; represented by Urbana Preservation &

Planning, LLC

LOCATION: 1610 Santa Barbara Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

APN 448-732-26-00 and 448-732-25-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Karl and Mary Kreizinger/ Edward Depew

House located at 1610 Santa Barbara Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Karl and Mary Kreizinger/ Edward Depew House located at 1610 Santa Barbara Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1934 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the parcel APN 448-732-25-00 and all the structures contained within it. The designation excludes the 2023 detached radio antenna. The designation includes the original 1934 three-car garage. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

- 1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Colonial Revival style and retains integrity from its 1934 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical façade, hipped and flat roofs, Spanish barrel tile roofing, cantilevered balcony with decorative wood corbels and railings, smooth stucco exterior, arched recessed entry doorway, oriel window bay, paneled solid wood entry door, and fenestration consisting of divided-lite wood casement windows, tripartite wood window sets, and a fixed picture window with decorative stucco surround.
- 2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Architect Edward Depew and retains integrity as it relates to the original 1934 design. Specifically, the resource was constructed during Depew's career when he headed the Depew Building Company where he often designed buildings in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. The resource also demonstrates the high quality of design generally associated with Depew.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource.

The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Karl and Mary Kreizinger/ Edward Depew House has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Karl and Mary Kreizinger, who constructed the house as their personal residence, and Edward Depew, a Master Architect.

In order to be eligible for designation and listing on the City's Register, a resource must meet one or more of the City's designation criteria as specified in the Historical Resources Guidelines of the Land Development Manual and retain integrity as it relates to the significance of the resource. Integrity is the ability of a property to convey its significance, which requires an understanding of the physical features and characteristics that existed during the resource's period of significance. The National, California, and City of San Diego Registers recognize location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association as the seven aspects of historical integrity.

Although not all seven aspects of integrity need to be present for a property to be eligible for designation, the record must demonstrate that the property retains enough physical and design characteristics to reflect and convey the significance of the property. Each resource depends on certain aspects of integrity, more than others, to express its historic significance. Determining which of the aspects are most important to a particular property requires an understanding of the property's significance and its essential physical features. The <u>Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria</u> provide information regarding the City's designation criteria, as well as guidance on their application and how to evaluate the integrity of a resource.

<u>ANALYSIS</u>

The property located at 1610 Santa Barbara Street is a two-story, Spanish Colonial Revival style single-family residential building constructed in 1934 in the Peninsula Community Planning Area. Other buildings and structures present on site include a 1934 detached three-car garage and a 2023 detached freestanding antenna. The property is located on a corner lot in the Point Loma Heights neighborhood. The property is in its original location.

An adjacent parcel immediately northeast of the subject property, denoted as APN 448-732-25-00, contains a detached shed that was originally used as a garage. The County Assessor estimates its construction date as 1936. The parcel also contains a post-1937 badminton court and a garden. This parcel was created by a 1961 subdivision action by previous owners Alfred and Alma Brosio.

Since its construction in 1934, the property has been modified as follows: a 1938 enclosure of the southeast elevation ground floor recessed patio, a c.1937-1958 southeast elevation second-floor cantilevered balcony enclosure, a 1958-1959 northwest elevation ground floor laundry room addition and second-floor bathroom addition, a 1961 construction of a perimeter concrete block

retaining wall including concrete steps and walkway, and a 2021 gutters addition to the second floor. In 2021, the owner applied for a building permit for a rehabilitation/restoration project to reverse the 1938 recessed patio enclosure and c.1937-1958 balcony enclosure. The project also removed the 1958-1959 second-floor bathroom addition, and all non-historic vinyl windows were either restored based on photographic evidence or replaced with compatible windows. Staff approved this permit as consistent with the Secretary of the Interiors (SOI) Standards for Rehabilitation. In 2023, the owner installed a radio antenna at the southwest rear elevation; this construction is exempted from a building permit per San Diego Municipal Code §129.0203 (a) (14), and staff did not review the project for consistency with the SOI Standards.

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Urbana Preservation & Planning, LLC, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. Staff disagrees with the report's conclusion that the property is not significant under Criterion D and finds the property to be significant under that Criterion. This determination is consistent with the <u>Guidelines</u> <u>for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria</u>, as follows.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The property was constructed in the Spanish Colonial Revival Style with a two-story form. Its roof is primarily hipped with Spanish tile covering and contains flat roof portions at the rear. The low-pitched roof has exposed rafters with little eave overhang. The building is sited above street grade with a retaining wall surrounding the perimeter of the property. The residence is clad in smooth stucco, contains an irregular floor plan, and exhibits an asymmetrical primary facade.

The southeast elevation is the primary façade, exhibiting the building's two-story massing and a projecting one-story wing. A cantilevered balcony projects from the second story, featuring wood beams, posts with corbel details, and wood railings. The entry is centered, recessed in an arched niche, and directly below a projecting covered balcony. The entry door is paneled wood. The projecting one-story wing contains a wood picture window with a raised stucco surround and a terra cotta sill. This façade also contains a ground-floor recessed patio with false beams at the ceiling. Windows along this elevation are wood casements with divided lites or tripartite casements and fixed wooden window sets. The northeast elevation is the side elevation, exhibiting the 1958 laundry room addition. This elevation features an oriel window bay, a divided-lite French door, and dividedlite casement windows. The northwest, side elevation is the rear elevation, revealing a two-story form and a one-story massing with a primary flat roof. The flat roof doubles as an open patio. On the second floor, the façade contains divided-lite French doors, a one-over-one wood sash window, and downspouts. The ground floor contains double French doors, divided lite wood casement windows, and a wood sash window. The southwest elevation is a side elevation facing toward Del Mar Avenue. This façade contains a two-story stucco-clad chimney. Windows along this elevation are divided-lite wood casement sets. A tripartite window set is along the 1958 rear addition, with a stucco grille window adjacent to it.

A detached three-car garage, built in 1934 per the Residential Building Records, is located to the southwest of the residence. This garage is oriented at street grade and features two paneled wood tilt-up garage doors, stucco cladding, and a flat roof. As this is an original accessory structure that

dates to the 1934 period of significance, staff recommends the inclusion of this building in the designation.

A c.1936 one-story shed structure, originally used as a one-car garage, is located on an adjacent parcel APN 448-732-25-00. This structure contains a sliding paneled wood garage door, wood casement windows, and a French door. Because it does not date to the 1934 period of significance, staff does not recommend the inclusion of this building in the designation.

A badminton court, dated post-1937, is located on the adjacent parcel APN 448-732-25-00. Because it does not date to the 1934 period of significance, staff does not recommend the inclusion of this structure in the designation.

Other features proposed for designation, such as the outdoor brick fireplace, Golden Chalice Vine, Carob tree, Eucalyptus trees, Lilly Pilly Hedge, and citrus trees, have been dated by the Historical Resource Research Report to "ca. 1934-1937" as they are visible in the 1937 historic photos. However, these features cannot be conclusively dated to the 1934 period of significance based on documentary or photographic evidence. Additionally, these features do not contribute to the significance under Criterion C for the Spanish Colonial Revival style or under Criterion D representative as a notable work of Master Architect Edward Depew. Thus, staff does not support extending the period of significance to "1934-1937" and does not recommend the inclusion of any of these features in the designation.

Because the adjacent parcel APN 448-732-25-00 does not contain any contributing features or structures that date to the 1934 period of significance and does not relate to the home in a significant way as it relates to designation under HRB Criterion C, staff recommends excluding this parcel from the designation.

Of the seven aspects of integrity, design, materials, and workmanship are the most critical to the property's ability to convey significance under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Colonial Revival Style. The property, which has been modified as detailed at the beginning of the analysis section of this report, retains integrity. The 1938 porch enclosure, 1937-1958 balcony enclosure, and 1958-1959 bathroom addition were restored in 2021. Site work in 1961 and 2023, including non-historic retaining walls, patio, and walkways, are minor in nature and do not detract from the Spanish Colonial Revival Style. 2021 window and door opening alterations to the building are limited to the rear façade where visibility is minimized and were approved by Heritage Preservation staff as consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The 2023 antenna is positioned at the rear elevation to minimize its visibility and detached to minimize integrity loss. Therefore, the property does retain integrity to its 1934 period of significance under HRB Criterion C.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, and unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled,

gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character-defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tiles, focal windows, arched windows and other openings, and accented entries.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Colonial Revival style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including an asymmetrical façade, hipped and flat roofs, Spanish barrel tile roofing, cantilevered balcony with decorative wood corbels and railings, smooth stucco exterior, arched recessed entry doorway, oriel window bay, paneled solid wood entry door, and fenestration consisting of divided-lite wood casement windows, tripartite wood window sets, and a fixed picture window with decorative stucco surround. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - *Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.*

Edward H. Depew, a Master Architect, designed the subject residence for the Kreizingers in 1934, as evidenced by a building permit reported by the *San Diego Union* in 1934. Depew moved to San Diego in 1921 at the age of 24. He worked as an architect for the Ideal Building Company from 1925 to 1927 and published architectural sketches in the *San Diego Union*. By 1928, Depew opened his own design-building firm named "Depew Building Company." He designed and constructed homes, apartment buildings, and offices throughout San Diego, spanning Mission Hills, Point Loma, and even Coronado. His designs were primarily in the revival styles, such as Colonial Revival, French Eclectic, Monterey Revival, and Spanish Colonial Revival. In the late 1940s, Depew sold his firm and operated the Depew Marine Center for boat repair and sales. The Historical Resource Research Report produced a listing of identified buildings attributed to Edward Depew and demonstrates that nearly all_his works between 1925-1939 were primarily in the Spanish Colonial Revival, or Spanish Eclectic, style. It appears that Depew was most adept in the Spanish Eclectic style. At least four of Depew's works have been designated in San Diego, including HRB #714 which established him as a Master Architect in 2005. A partial list of notable works is below:

- HRB #651- Dr. Harry and Beryl Faulkner House (3003 Kingsley Street), 1939
- HRB #714–David A. and Emma Loebenstein House (1087 Myrtle Way),1926 (potential architect)
- HRB #721- Ena Shapley/Edward Depew House (4252 Arista Street), 1931
- HRB #1237- Depew Building Company / Edward Depew Spec House #1 (3305 Voltaire Street), 1939
- HRB #1324- Charles and Ethel Weiss/Edward Depew House (4194 Randolph Street), 1925

The Historical Resource Research Report asserts that the property is not significant under HRB Criterion D as representative of the notable work or a Master Architect Edward Depew, because it lacks the decorative details present in his other designs, such as ironwork, decorative tiles, window grilles, and stucco/tile decorative vents. Staff disagrees with this finding. The subject property features characteristics exhibited in Depew's Spanish Colonial Revival residences designated under Criterion D, like HRB #721 and HRB #1324. Specifically, the subject property, like HRB #721 and HRB #1324, features a hipped roof design with exposed rafters, an elaborated picture window, divided-lite casement window sets, accentuated recessed entry, and an asymmetrical front façade. Additionally, the subject property features a prominent front elevation cantilevered balcony with

decorative wood railings and corbels, which is not seen in his other designated Spanish Colonial Revival residences. As such, not only does the subject resource exhibit features seen in Depew's other Criterion D designations, but it also displays custom details such as a prominent balcony and recessed front patio that further enhances the building's design to qualify this property as representative of a notable work by Master Architect Depew.

Of the seven aspects of integrity, design, materials, and workmanship are the most critical to the property's ability to convey significance under HRB Criterion D as a resource that represents the notable work of Master Architect Edward Depew. The property, which has been modified as detailed at the beginning of the analysis section of this report, continues to exhibit features attributable to Depew's original design, such as a two-story asymmetrical form, an inset arched entry, cantilevered balcony with wood details, recessed patio with false beams, and a decorative picture window. Therefore, the property does retain integrity to its 1934 period of significance under HRB Criterion D.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Architect Edward Depew and retains integrity as it relates to the original 1934 design. Specifically, the resource was constructed during Depew's career when he headed the Depew Building Company where he often designed buildings in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. The resource also demonstrates the high quality of design generally associated with Depew.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Karl and Mary Kreizinger/ Edward Depew House located at 1610 Santa Barbara Street be designated with a period of significance of 1934 under HRB Criterion C as an example of the Spanish Colonial Revival style and Criterion D as a notable work of Master Architect Edward Depew. The designation excludes the parcel APN 448-732-25-00 and all structures contained within it. The designation excludes the 2023 detached radio antenna. The designation includes the original 1934 three-car garage.

Alvin Lin

Associate Planner

City Planning Department

Suzanne Segur

Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison City Planning Department

AL/ss

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Assessor's Parcel Map
- 3. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 8/22/2024

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 8/22/2024, to consider the historical designation of the **Karl and Mary Kreizinger/ Edward Depew House** (owned by Herdell Family Trust 11-02-07, 1610 Santa Barbara Street, San Diego, CA 92107) located at **1610 Santa Barbara Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92107**, APN: **448-732-26-00**, further described as BLK 82 LOT 2 OF M4877 IN in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Karl and Mary Kreizinger/ Edward Depew House on the following findings:

- (1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Colonial Revival Style with a 1934 period of significance. Specifically, the property features an asymmetrical façade, hipped and flat roofs, Spanish barrel tile roofing, cantilevered balcony with decorative wood corbels and railings, smooth stucco exterior, arched recessed entry doorway, oriel window bay, paneled solid wood entry door, and fenestration consisting of divided-lite wood casement windows, tripartite wood window sets, and a fixed picture window with decorative stucco surround. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.
- (2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D representative as a notable work of Master Architect Edward H. Depew with a period of significant of 1934. Specifically, the resource was constructed during Depew's career when he during Depew's career when he headed the Depew Building Company where he often designed buildings in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. The resource also demonstrates the high quality of design generally associated with Depew. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.**

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall include the original 1934 three-car garage.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude parcel APN 448-732-25-00 and all structures contained within it.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 2023 detached radio antenna.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

١/	$\overline{}$	+	Δ	•
v	u	L	ᆮ	

BY:	
	TIM HUTTER, Chair
	Historical Resources Board
DV/	

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney

RECORDING REQUESTED BY CITY OF SAN DIEGO DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD ATTN: HRB SECRETARY 1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

1610 Santa Barbara Street, San Diego, CA 92107

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER 448-732-26-00

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER 0

ATTACHMENT 2

Assessor's Parcel Map Containing APN 448-732-26-00 and 448-732-25-00

Highlighted in Yellow

448-731.732

SANTA CRUZ **AVE** 1"=100' 90 N.53° 55' 55"W 44.99 NPM 7490 PAR. 1 6/29/18 AAA PAR 2 <u>3</u> 4 (5) 7 9 2 <u>6</u> 7490 <u>8</u>) 10) \odot ST ST 19 60 55 N. 53° 55' 18"W. BLK. 731 83

AVE

 1
 2
 3
 4
 5
 6
 7
 0
 9
 /0
 /1
 13
 12

 23
 21
 20
 19
 18
 17
 16
 15
 14
 13
 12

 50
 50

CORONADO

63

63

<u>4</u>) 1 (<u>5</u>) 6 /8 7 <u>8</u>) <u>12</u> /2 9 15 10 11 13 BARBARA 82(732 600 05 (ROS 4608) 458°55'W 139.67 8 (14) 1 25 **(21)** 20 16 (25) GUIZOT SANTA 2 26

607.M (ROS 4609)

THIS MAP WAS PREPARED FOR ASSESSMENT PURPOSES ONLY. NO LIABILITY IS ASSUMED FOR THE ACCURACY OF THE DATA SHOWN. ASSESSOR'S PARCELS MAY NOT COMPLY WITH LOCAL SUBDIVISION OR BUILDING ORDINANCES.

BLK OLD NEW YR CUT 24 24 \$25 79 1715 732 24 25&26 19 1033



MAP 4877 - BROSIO SUB

MAP 1106 - POINT LOMA HEIGHTS

ROS 4608

(449) 2