

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF July 25, 2024
PUBLIC UTILITIES DEPARTMENT
METROPOLITAN OPERATIONS COMPLEX II
9192 TOPAZ WAY
SAN DIEGO, CA 92123
HYBRID HEARING**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

Chairperson Tim Hutter called the meeting to order at 1:05p.m. Chairperson Tim Hutter adjourned the meeting at 4:38 p.m.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING:

Chairperson Tim Hutter – present
Vice-Chairperson Michael Taylor – present
2nd Vice-Chairperson Kristi Byers – absent
Boardmember Joy Miller– present- departed at 3:33pm
Boardmember Rammy Cortez – present
Boardmember Courtney Ann Coyle – absent
Boardmember Carla Farley – present- departed at 4:20 pm.
Boardmember David McCullough – present
Boardmember Mathew Winter – present
Boardmember Ann Woods – present

City Staff

Jeanne MacKinnon, Deputy City Attorney – present
Kelley Stanco, City Planning Department – present
Bernie Turgeon, City Planning Department – absent
Suzanne Segur, City Planning Department – present
Shannon Anthony, City Planning Department – present
Alvin Lin, City Planning Department – present
Megan Walker, City Planning Department – present
Kelsey Kaline, City Planning Department – present
Audrey Rains, City Planning Department – present
Martin Mendez, Development Services Department- present

Note: All decision-makers attended the meeting in person. Staff and members of the public attended both in person and virtually.

ANNOUNCEMENTS/PUBLIC COMMENT

Shona McArthur thanked the Board for their support of the La Jolla Park Coastal National Register Historic District. She discussed a conditions assessment report that was compiled about the resources within the Historic District and urged the importance of maintenance and preparation for impacts from climate change.

Diane Kane, architectural historian, spoke on behalf of the La Jolla Parks and Beaches Inc., questioned how the board interfaces with the Parks and Rec Department when it comes to rehabilitation of historic resources and urged collaboration and the creation of a Preservation component of the Master Parks Plan.

Barry Hager, on behalf of Mission Hills Heritage, spoke on the organization's previously proposed amendments to the HRB Policy 4.1 and HRB Procedures. Mr. Hager asked that the Board direct City Staff to put the proposed amendments on the next Policy Subcommittee Agenda.

Christina is a resident of the Valle Vista Terrace Historic District. She wanted to bring to the Board's attention her concerns about a three-story ADU permit that is being proposed within the district and indicated that she thought the project should disqualify the home from the Mills Act and also require CEQA review. She requests that the HRB hear the ADU project at the next meeting.

Faith Jennings is a homeowner within the Valle Vista Terrace Historic District and echoes Christina's views. Jennings also thinks that CEQA is the appropriate next step and reinforced that the project does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Kim Martinez is a resident within the Valle Vista Historic District and commented that she does not think we should be setting a precedent with a three-story ADU in the Valle Vista neighborhood.

John Ford is a resident within the Valle Vista Historic District and is opposed to the City approving a permit for the previously proposed three-story ADU project. Ford commented that the homeowners in this community supported the Historic District and support conditions to keep the integrity of the District intact.

Janene Christopher is a resident of Panorama Drive within the Valle Vista Historic District fears that the previously mentioned three-story ADU is not keeping with the historic character of the neighborhood.

In response to the public comment, Chairperson Hutter asked Staff to put the Valle Vista Historic District ADU be put on the agenda as an informational item in the future.

BOARDMEMBERS COMMENT

Chairperson Hutter welcomed Joy Miller as a new Boardmember and thanked Dr. Cheng for her contributions to the Board.

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Boardmember McCullough needs to recuse from Item 1 due to potential bias.

EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

Boardmember Woods shared that they were approached by the homeowner of Item 7 -3204 Goldsmith Street, but that will not influence their decision.

FAILURE TO

VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

Boardmember Miller was not able to view the entirety of the site for Item 1, 7960 La Jota Way.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WINTER TO INVOKE THE WAIVER FOR THE SITE VISIT REQUIREMENT PURSUANT TO FACTOR 2 FOR BOARDMEMBER MILLER FOR ITEM 1 - 7960 LA JOTA WAY Seconded by Boardmember Farley. The motion passed by a vote of 6-0-1 with Boardmembers Miller, Farley, Hutter, Woods, Cortez, Winter

and Vice-Chair Taylor, voting yea, Boardmember McCullough abstaining, and Boardmembers Byers and Coyle absent.

Boardmember Farley and Chairperson Hutter was not able to make the interior site visit for Item 7 but no waiver needs to be invoked per the Board Procedures.

REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE CONTINUED AND/OR WITHDRAWN

Kiley Wallace, on behalf of the property owners, requested a 30-day continuance for Item 5 –2265 Juan Street to August 22, 2024 in order to document Criterion B significance.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER FARLEY TO CONTINUE TO A DATE CERTAIN OF AUGUST 22, 2024. Seconded by Boardmember McCullough. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Winter, Cortez, Woods, McCullough, Farley, Vice-Chair Taylor and Chair Hutter voting yea with Boardmembers Byers and Coyle absent.

REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON THE CONSENT AGENDA

Item 6- Alice and George Kiewit House at 4414 Ampudia Street

Item 7- Ethel and John West House at 3204 Goldsmith Street

Boardmember Woods requested Item 2, 6110 Camino de la Costa be removed from the Consent agenda for discussion.

Chair Hutter requested Item 3, Ethel and Sam Moder Spec House #1 at 4648 Marlborough Drive be removed from the Consent agenda for discussion.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCCULLOUGH FOR ITEM 6 – ALICE AND GEORGE KIEWIT HOUSE LOCATED AT 4414 AMPUDIA STREET AND ITEM 7, THE ETHEL AND JOHN WEST HOUSE AT 3204 GOLDSMITH STREET TO BE DESIGNATED PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION ON THE CONSENT AGENDA. Seconded by Boardmember Winter. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Winter, Cortez, Woods, McCullough, Farley, Miller, Vice-Chair Taylor and Chair Hutter voting yea with Boardmembers Byers and Coyle absent.

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Item 2- 6110 Camino de la Costa Coastal Development Permit/Site Development Permit/ Neighborhood Development Permit

Item 4 – Heart of Banker's Hill Historic District National Register Nomination

Item 1- 7960 La Jota Way

Item 3- Ethel and Sam Moder Spec House #1 at 4648 Marlborough Drive

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR HUTTER TO HEAR ITEMS 2, 4, 1, AND 3 IN THAT ORDER. Seconded by Boardmember Farley to the approval of the agenda. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Winter, Cortez, Woods, McCullough, Farley, Miller, Vice-Chair Taylor and Chair Hutter voting yea with Boardmembers Byers and Coyle absent.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FOR APRIL 25, 2024

Chair Hutter noted that in the Non-Agenda Public Comment from the May meeting, Valle Vista terrace is misspelled as Valley Vista and asked Staff to amend that.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER FARLEY TO APPROVE THE MINUTES. Seconded by Vice-Chair Taylor. The motion passed by a vote of 7-0-1 with Boardmembers Winter, Cortez, McCullough, Farley, Miller, Vice-Chair Taylor and Chair Hutter voting yea, Boardmember Woods abstaining, with Boardmembers Byers and Coyle absent.

STAFF REPORT

Suzanne Segur, Senior Planner from the Planning Department, thanked former Boardmember Cheng for her contributions to the Board and wished her well in future endeavors. Ms. Segur welcomed Joy Miller to the Board. Ms. Miller fills the HRB's required Historian seat recently vacated by Dr. Cheng. Ms. Miller is a doctoral student in history at the University of California, San Diego. She received her Master's in History with a Digital History Concentration and a Bachelor's degree in History from California State University, San Marcos.

Ms. Segur indicated that the new fees are in effect beginning on July 1st, 2024, and directed people to the City's website for more information.

Ms. Segur informed the Board that Caroline Garcia, the HRB's Legislative Recorder, has moved on to a new position in the Offices of District 1. Caroline was with the HRB for 3 years and will be missed.

Ms. Segur informed the Board that City Staff member Alvin Lin has been promoted to Associate Planner in the Heritage Preservation Section of the City Planning Department.

The next meeting of the Policy Subcommittee will be held on Monday, August 12th at 3 p.m in the large conference room on the 5th floor of the City Administration Building.

More information regarding the Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee can be found on the City's Planning Department website.

The next meeting of the Design Assistance Subcommittee scheduled to be held on Wednesday August 7th at 4 p.m. in the large conference room on the 5th floor of the City Administration Building.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

ITEM-1 *Continued from May 23, 2024*

7960 LA JOTA WAY

Note: This item was heard as the third discussion item

Applicant/Owner: Daniel and Carrie Aisen represented by IS Architecture

Staff: Alvin Lin

Consider the designation of the property located at 7960 La Jota Way, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1, as a historical resource. Report Number: HRB-24-018

PROPOSED ACTION

Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

Staff Report by Alvin Lin

Correspondence Received

In Favor: Received from Barry Hager, Bruce Coons, Lauren Lockhart, Diane Kane, Elizabeth Courtier

In Opposition: Received from Ricardo Flores

Testimony Received

In Favor: Organized Preservation received from Scott Moomjiam, Lone Stiegler (ceded time from Peter Kempson, Joseph Troia, Carrie Aisen, Daniel Aisen). Testimony from Diane Kane, and Bruce Coons

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CORTEZ TO DESIGNATE THE NINA BOWDEN/ ROBERT MOSHER AND ROY DREW HOUSE UNDER HRB CRITERION D AS A NOTABLE WORK OF MASTER ARCHITECTS ROBERT MOSHER AND ROY DREW DURING THEIR PARTNERSHIP TOGETHER. SPECIFICALLY, THE RESOURCE, AS RESTORED AND REHABILITATED IN A MANNER CONSISTENT WITH THE SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S STANDARDS, IS A NOTABLE EXAMPLE WHICH ILLUSTRATES NUMEROUS TECHNIQUES EMPLOYED BY MOSHER AND DREW IN A STRONG MODERN CUSTOM RANCH AESTHETIC, INCLUDING WOODEN SHINGLE MOTIFS, AND A BOLD HORIZONTAL DESIGN WHICH CENTERS AROUND A COURTYARD WITH INTERIOR/EXTERIOR CONNECTIONS, REFLECTING THE ARCHITECTS' EARLY WORK AT THE START OF THEIR COLLABORATION. THE RESOURCE RETAINS INTEGRITY RELATED TO ITS 1952 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE AND SERVES AS A NOTABLE EXAMPLE OF MOSHER AND DREW'S EARLY RESIDENTIAL WORK, SHOWCASING A COMBINATION "U"-SHAPED BUILDING FOOTPRINT, WHICH CAPTURES PRIVATE EXTERNAL VIEWS THROUGH SITE ORIENTATION, AND A TYPICAL BLEND OF EXTERIOR MATERIALS USED BY THE FIRM AT THE TIME PRIOR TO MOSHER'S SABBATICAL IN 1955. THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES LATER WORKS BY OTHER ARCHITECTS INCLUDING THE 1998 TWO-STORY ADDITION AND ADDITION BEHIND THE GARAGE. Seconded by Boardmember Farley. The motion passed by a vote of 6-0-0 with Boardmembers Cortez, Farley, Taylor, Winter, Woods, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmembers Coyle, McCullough, Miller, and Vice-Chair Byers absent.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER FARLEY TO DESIGNATE THE PROPERTY UNDER HRB CRITERION C FOR ITS DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF MODERN CUSTOM RANCH ARCHITECTURE AND RETAINS INTEGRITY FROM ITS 1952 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. SPECIFICALLY, THE RESOURCE, AS RESTORED AND REHABILITATED IN A MANNER CONSISTENT WITH THE SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S STANDARDS, FEATURES HORIZONTAL MASSING; SINGLE-STORY FORM; CUSTOM DETAILING, INCLUDING LARGE WOOD WINDOWS, LARGE BRICK CHIMNEY, AND LOW-SLOPED CROSS-GABLED AND HIPPED ROOF WITH MODEST TO DEEP OVERHANGS; SPRAWLING, IRREGULARLY "U"-SHAPED FLOOR PLAN; LARGE TWO-CAR GARAGE; AND WOOD SHINGLES. THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES LATER WORKS BY OTHER ARCHITECTS INCLUDING THE 1998 TWO-STORY ADDITION AND ADDITION BEHIND THE GARAGE. Seconded by Boardmember Winter. The motion failed by a vote of 4-2-0 with Boardmembers Farley, Taylor, Winter and Chair Hutter voting yea, Boardmembers Cortez and Woods voting no, and with Boardmembers Coyle, McCullough, Miller, and Vice-Chair Byers absent.

Break: 4:15 P.M - 4:20 P.M

ITEM-2

Trailed from June 26, 2024

6110 CAMINO DE LA COSTA COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT/ SITE DEVELOPMENT PERMIT/ NEIGHBORHOOD DEVELOPMENT PERMIT

Note: This item was heard as the first discussion item

Applicant/Owner: JMan at the Q LP Represented by Matthew Segal and Chandra Slaven

Staff: Martin Mendez/ Suzanne Segur

Review and make a recommendation to the appropriate decision-making authority on those aspects of the development permit pertaining to the Herbert York/ Herbert Palmer House/ La Casa de Los Amigos (HRB#1481) located at 6110 Camino de la Costa, La Jolla Community, Council District 1. Report Number: HRB-24-015

PROPOSED ACTION

Recommend to the Planning Commission approval of the historical resources section, recommendations, findings, and mitigation measures of the environmental document and findings associated with the Site Development Permit as presented or recommend inclusion of additional permit conditions related to the designated historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Recommend to the Planning Commission approval of the historical resources section, recommendations, findings, and mitigation measures of the environmental document and findings associated with the Site Development Permit related to the designated resource located at 6110 Camino de la Costa (HRB #1481, the Herbert York/ Herbert Palmer House/ La Casa de Los Amigos) as presented.

Staff Report by Martin Mendez and Suzanne Segur

Correspondence Received

None

Testimony Received

In Favor: Matthew Segal,

In Opposition: Diane Kane

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CORTEZ TO MOVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION. Seconded by Vice-Chair Taylor. The motion passed by a vote of 6-2-0 with Boardmembers Winter, Cortez, McCullough, Miller, Vice-Chair Taylor and Chair Hutter voting yea with Boardmembers Woods and Farley voting no, and Boardmembers Byers and Coyle absent.

ITEM-3***Trailed from June 26, 2024*****ETHEL AND SAM MODER SPEC HOUSE #1**

Note: This item was heard as the last discussion item

Applicant/Owner: Mark J Badria represented by Urbana Preservation & Planning, LLC

Staff: Megan Walker

Consider the designation of the property located at 4648 Marlborough Drive, 92116, Kensington Talmadge Community, Council District 9, as a historical resource. Report Number: HRB-24-023

PROPOSED ACTION

Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Ethel and Sam Moder Spec House #1, located at 4648 Marlborough Drive, as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C.

Staff Report by Megan Walker**Correspondence Received**

None

Testimony Received

In Support: Organized Presentation from John Hyche of Urbana Preservation

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR HUTTER TO MOVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION. Seconded by Boardmember Cortez. The motion passed by a vote of 6-0-0 with Boardmembers McCullough, Woods, Cortez, Winter, Chair Hutter, and Vice-Chair Taylor voting yea and Boardmembers Farley, Miller, Coyle, and Byers absent. Motion carries.

ITEM-4**HEART OF BANKER'S HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION**

Note: This item was heard as the second discussion item

Applicant: Heart of Bankers Hill Inc. represented by Architectural Resources Group

Staff: Bernie Turgeon, Kelsey Kaline

Heart of Bankers Hill Historic District National Register nomination, Uptown Community, Bankers Hill Neighborhood, Council District 3. Report Number: HRB-24-024

PROPOSED ACTION

Review the Heart of Bankers Hill Historic District National Register of Historic Places nomination for the purpose of making a recommendation to the California State Office of Historic Preservation

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Recommend to the California State Office of Historic Preservation the listing of the Heart of Bankers Hill Historic District with a period of significance of 1905-1961 at a local level of significance under National Register Criterion C and that the nomination be amended to provide additional justification for extending the period of significance beyond 1940 and potentially change the classification status of the 8 properties shown in Tables 1 and 2 of the staff report with a caveat that the proposed classifications of all contributing and non-contributing resources may not be adequately confirmed by staff due to the limited property-specific information and documentation requirements for National Register nominations.

Staff Report by Kelsey Kaline

Correspondence Received

In Support: Received from Joseph Kilrain, Karen Dalton-Koch, Andrew Goodrich, Nancy Moors (Bankers Hill Community Group), Ann Garwood (Hillcrest History Guild)
In Opposition: Received from Wesley Morgan

Testimony Received

In Support: Brent Gutekunst, Ann Kilrain, Donna Garcia, Ione Stiegler, Diane Kane
In Opposition: Sharon Gehl, Wesley Morgan, Frank Elliot

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCCULLOUGH TO MOVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION. Seconded by Boardmember Woods. The motion passed by a vote of 6-2-0 with Boardmembers Miller, Farley, McCullough, Woods, Winter, and Vice-Chair Taylor voting yea, Boardmember Cortez and Chair Hutter voting no, and Boardmembers Coyle and Byers absent. Motion carries.

Break: 2:50 p.m. – 3:00 p.m.

ITEM-5 2265 JUAN STREET

Applicant/Owner: Lee Family Living Trust represented by Landmark Historic Preservation
Staff: Alvin Lin

Consider the designation of the property located at 2265 Juan Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3, as a historical resource. Report Number: HRB-24-028

PROPOSED ACTION

Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 2265 Juan Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Staff Report by Alvin Lin

Correspondence Received

None

Testimony Received

In Support: None
In Opposition: Kiley Wallace, Sinjin Lee

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER FARLEY TO CONTINUE TO A DATE CERTAIN OF AUGUST 22, 2024. Seconded by Boardmember McCullough. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Winter, Cortez, Woods, McCullough, Farley, Vice-Chair Taylor and Chair Hutter voting yea with Boardmembers Byers and Coyle absent.

ITEM-6

ALICE AND GEORGE KIEWIT HOUSE

Applicant/Owner: Sauls Trust 12-28-98 represented by Nexus Planning & Research

Staff: Audrey Rains and Shannon Anthony

Consider the designation of the property located at 4414 Ampudia Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3, as a historical resource. Report Number: HRB-24-025

PROPOSED ACTION

Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Alice and George Kiewit House located at 4414 Ampudia Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 2007 rear addition built outside the period of significance.

Staff Report by Audrey Rains and Shannon Anthony

Correspondence Received

None

Testimony Received

In Support: Jennifer Ayala

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCCULLOUGH TO DESIGNATE ON CONSENT PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION. Seconded by Boardmember Winter. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Winter, Cortez, Woods, McCullough, Farley, Miller, Vice-Chair Taylor and Chair Hutter voting yea with Boardmembers Byers and Coyle absent.

ITEM-7

ETHEL AND JOHN WEST HOUSE

Applicant/Owner: Sullivan John & Marta Family Trust 02-08-12 represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Staff: Alvin Lin

Consider the designation of the property located at 3204 Goldsmith Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2, as a historical resource. Report Number: HRB-24-027

PROPOSED ACTION

Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Ethel and John West House located at 3204 Goldsmith Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1914 under HRB Criterion C. The designation includes the original detached garage. The interior features included in the designation are the gumwood coffered ceiling in the living room, brick fireplace with two flanking gumwood benches, and wainscoting and window and door surrounds at the entry, living room, and dining room.

Staff Report by Alvin Lin

Correspondence Received

None

Testimony Received

In Support: None

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCCULLOUGH TO DESIGNATE ON CONSENT PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION. Seconded by Boardmember Winter. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Winter, Cortez, Woods, McCullough, Farley, Miller, Vice-Chair Taylor and Chair Hutter voting yea with Boardmembers Byers and Coyle absent.

DRAFT