



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: June 12, 2024 REPORT NO. HRB-24-023

HEARING DATE: June 27, 2024

SUBJECT: **ITEM #3 – ETHEL AND SAM MODER SPEC HOUSE #1**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Mark Badria; represented by Urbana Preservation & Planning, LLC

LOCATION: 4648 Marlborough Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9, APN 440-662-2500

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Ethel and Sam Moder Spec House #1, located at 4648 Marlborough Drive, as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Ethel and Sam Moder Spec House #1, located at 4648 Marlborough Drive, as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic style architecture and retains integrity from its 1926 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical façade, stucco cladding, varied roof forms with tile roofing and little eave overhang, an arched focal window, a central tower, a stucco chimney, arched wooden entry door, and fenestration consisting mainly of wood windows in various lite patterns and operations.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource.

The property has not been identified in any historical surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Ethel and Sam Moder Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the names of Ethel and Sam Moder, who constructed the property as a speculation house.

In order to be eligible for designation and listing on the City's Register, a resource must meet one or more of the City's designation criteria as specified in the Historical Resources Guidelines of the Land Development Manual and retain integrity as it relates to the significance of the resource. Integrity is the ability of a property to convey its significance, which requires an understanding of the physical features and characteristics that existed during the resource's period of significance. The National, California, and City of San Diego Registers recognize location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association as the seven aspects of historical integrity.

Although not all seven aspects of integrity need to be present for a property to be eligible for designation, the record must demonstrate that the property retains enough physical and design characteristics to reflect and convey the significance of the property. Each resource depends on certain aspects of integrity, more than others, to express its historic significance. Determining which of the aspects are most important to a particular property requires an understanding of the property's significance and its essential physical features. The [Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria](#) provide information regarding the City's designation criteria, as well as guidance on their application and how to evaluate the integrity of a resource.

ANALYSIS

The property at 4648 Marlborough Drive is a one-story, single-family residential building constructed in 1926 in the Kensington-Talmadge Community Planning Area in the Spanish Eclectic style. Other buildings and structures present on site include a rear detached garage constructed in 1926. The property is located on the west side of Marlborough Drive between Park Place and Madison Avenue. It is in its original location.

Since its construction in 1926, the property has had several modifications: Permits show that the house was reroofed in 1976 in-kind. The iron grate was removed from the small window set into the tower. All of the six windows on the north side elevation, and two of the three windows on the south side elevation have been replaced with vinyl within their original openings; a security door was added, and a door on the north elevation and two of the three sets of rear French doors on the west elevation were replaced within their original opening. The foldable garage doors were replaced, and a new door was put in the side door frame at unspecified dates. Staff notes that while the report states that the stucco is a Spanish lace finish, staff finds that the finish is closer to a medium sand, and the house has been restuccoed at an unknown date. In 2023, the homeowners worked with Heritage Preservation staff on the restoration of four windows and a French door on the primary elevation; the project was approved consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

A Historical Resources Research Report was prepared by Urbana Preservation & Planning, LLC, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the [Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria](#), as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The resource is a one-story, single-family residence constructed in 1926 in the Spanish Eclectic Style. The house has an asymmetrical massing with varied roof forms on the primary façade with red tiles, a little eave overhang, and a flat roof with a simple parapet covering the remainder of the building. The house is clad in medium sand-finish stucco. The center features a small tower with a small arched window and a wooden arched front door. On the left of the primary façade is a projecting gable with a large inset arched wood window flanked by two ten-lite side-lites. To the right is a recessed front porch between the tower and bay, which features a wooden tripartite window with a fixed center with two double-hung 4:1 windows; the bay features a wooden French door and three wooden double-hung 4:1 windows. The south elevation features a stucco chimney, an arched wooden 6:1 double-hung window, and a set of wood ten-lite French doors. The detached garage to the northwest of the house features a stucco site wall with a gate connecting it to the rear elevation of the main house. Fenestration consists primarily of multi-lite and single-lite wood and vinyl windows of various materials, sizes, and operations.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, and unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped, and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings, and accented entries.

Of the seven aspects of integrity, design, materials, and workmanship are the most critical to the property's ability to convey significance under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style. The property, which has been modified as detailed in the beginning of the analysis section of this report, retains overall integrity of design, materials, and workmanship despite the modifications. The modifications are designed in a manner that is consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The in-kind replacement of the roof and restoration of a front window and door do not impact the resource's character-defining features. The replacement of the non-historic window with more historically appropriate wood frame and sash windows and doors reduces the impact of the modification and improves the building's integrity. Even with the eight vinyl window and wood door replacements on the secondary facades, within their original openings, the replacement of the garage doors, and the removal of the iron grate; the house retains its overall integrity of design, materials, and workmanship. The rehabilitation project approved in 2023 improved the overall integrity of the resource through the restoration of the French door and window on the front façade. Therefore, the property retains its integrity to its 1926 period of significance under HRB Criterion C.


Significance Statement: The resource continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including an asymmetrical façade, stucco cladding, varied roof forms with tile roofing and little eave overhang, an arched focal window, a central tower, stucco chimney, arched wooden entry door, and fenestration consisting mainly of wood windows in various lite patterns and operations. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Ethel and Sam Moder Spec House #1 located at 4648 Marlborough Drive be designated with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C as an example of Spanish Eclectic style architecture.



Megan Walker
Associate Planner



Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison
City Planning Department

MW/SS

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 6/27/2024

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 6/27/2024, to consider the historical designation of the (owned by Mark J Badria, 4648 Marlborough Drive, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **4648 Marlborough Drive, San Diego, CA 92116**, APN: **440-662-25-00**, further described as BLK 21 LOT 24 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including an asymmetrical façade, stucco cladding, varied roof forms with tile roofing and little eave overhang, an arched focal window, a central tower, stucco chimney, arched wooden entry door, and fenestration consisting mainly of wood windows in various lite patterns and operations. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _____
TIM HUTTER, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
Deputy City Attorney

RECORDING REQUESTED BY
CITY OF SAN DIEGO
DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
ATTN: HRB SECRETARY
1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

RESOLUTION NUMBER **N/A**

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

4648 Marlborough Drive, San Diego, CA 92116

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER **440-662-25-00**

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER **0**