****

SUSTAINABLE ENERGY ADVISORY BOARD (SEAB)

**Minutes**

**Meeting #148**

**Thursday, November 8, 2018**

**Sustainability Department**

9601 Ridgehaven Ct., San Diego, CA 92123

First Floor Auditorium

10:00 a.m.

1. Call to Order

Quorum met with five members initially in attendance. Julia Brown called the meeting to order at 10:05AM.

1. Introductions of Board Members, City Staff and Public Participants

**MEMBERS PRESENT:**

Jason Anderson – Business Community

Julia Brown (Chair) – At Large Member

Kendall Helm – SDG&E

Sean Karafin – At Large Member

Douglas Kot (Vice Chair) – U.S. Green Building Council

Andrew McKercher – Labor Organization

Jay Powell – Environmental Advocate

Eddie Price – At Large Member Alternate 1

Eric Scheidlinger – At Large Member Alternate 2

# CITY STAFF PRESENT:

Cody Hooven – Sustainability Department

Jenny Kunna – Sustainability Department

Aaron Lu – Sustainability Department

Bryan Olson – Sustainability Department

Shannon Sales – Sustainability Department

Michael Salyer – Sustainability Department

Public Introductions.

1. Approval of Agenda and Minutes (Chair)

 1. Approval of Minutes (taken out of order)

\*MOTION\* Jay Powell made motion to *approve minutes from SEAB meeting #147 as amended and posted*. Eddie Price seconded. Motion passed 4-0-1 with Kendall Helm abstaining due to not attending.

Jason Anderson joined the meeting.

2. Approval of Agenda (taken out of order)

\*MOTION\* Julia Brown made motion to *approve agenda for SEAB meeting #148 with the amendment to move item # VI to after item #VII 2*. *Item #VII 1 was postponed to December’s meeting.* Jay Powell seconded. Motion passed unanimously. No abstentions.

1. Announcements

Aaron Lu attending an event held in Los Angeles.

1. Non-agenda Public Comment

Zack Franklin from Grid Alternatives made a public comment regarding their interest and programs to bring electric vehicles to communities of concern.

1. Action Items/Discussion – delayed until after *VII. 2. CCA Business Plan*.
2. Informational Items/Discussion (Taken out of order).
	1. Socioeconomic Equity Presentation #1 (Roman Partida-Lopez, The Greenlining Institute) – postponed until December meeting.

Douglas Kot joined the meeting.

* 1. CCA Business Plan (Cody Hooven)

Cody Hooven provided an overview and introduction of the CCA Business Plan (<https://www.sandiego.gov/sustainability/clean-and-renewable-energy>) and staff’s recommendation memorandum on formation of a CCA for the City of San Diego. She introduced Mark Fulmer from MRW whom provided an in-depth explanation of the CCA Business Plan remotely over-the-phone with a supplemental Power Point presentation. Further information and explanation was provided by Cody Hooven.

Mark Fuller and Cody Hooven answered questions and concerns.

Public comment followed.

* *Taylor Falso* from Sullivan Solar Power commented.
* *Sandra Robinson* from Port Resolution Specialists Consulting and member of San Diego Community Choice Alliance commented.
1. Letter to the Mayor to support moving ahead with a CCA program and recommend approval by (City) Council. Action Item taken out of order.

Chair Julia Brown moved the agenda forward to the Action Item on CCA support. After considerable discussion by the Board of areas of concern, Jay Powell indicated that he was prepared to make a motion to support the staff recommendation with the proviso of expressing the following concerns noted by SEAB:

A. demonstrating the risk and benefits of the JPA versus the City stand-alone CCA

B. that the accountability for the public participation aspect be strong,

C. about the equity aspect being represented more explicitly in the implementation plan,

D. the issue of local energy and the local economic multiplier being more specifically expressed in the implementation plan.

It was clarified that his motion was to support the staff recommendation with the SEAB concerns listed in a bullet point format for further examination through the implementation plan and he was open to amendments to incorporate other concerns that were expressed but not included in this list.

Asked for a restatement of the concerns, the following was provided:

* Expression of concern about the JPA versus the City enterprise (model) by resolving what the risk and benefits would be;
* Concern regarding equity and that the implementation plan should provide more specificity about how communities of concern will benefit from the CCA;
* The issue of how distributed energy—what is referred to as local energy—will be addressed within the CCA JPA implementation plan; and adding we should include
* Concern that the City budget, that funds be adequately provided for the staff recommendations and implementation

The motion as restated by Jay Powell was seconded by Eddie Price.

There was discussion regarding the need for a letter and taking action at this meeting in order to provide a recommendation for City Council consideration.

In answer to a clarifying question regarding JPA versus City addressing the financial risk associated with a fire wall, Jay Powell responded that was one aspect but also how the CCA is going to operate with accountability and the other factors identified in the Business Plan chart such as moving faster (with City only model) versus having less risk (with JPA model).

It was noted by Sean Karafin that SEAB is on record recommending Guiding Principles and Minimum Performance Criteria in the areas of finance, economics and environment and that we now have one option that could play out in many different ways. It was noted by Eddie Price that we will not get to those considerations unless we approve moving forward to address these concerns, since they are not going to be addressed now because there has been no approval to address them. Jay Powell stated that in essence we want to support the staff’s recommendation to move forward with these concerns and provisos as listed being looked at more closely.

A revised statement of a substitute motion was proposed by Douglas Kot and seconded by Eddie Price. Amendments proposed by Jason Anderson to include the “staff memo” in addition to the business plan because those two items are linked together and by Eddie Price to add “equity in communities of concern” because that term is sometimes glossed over were accepted. Doug Kot clarified the reference to JPA as being acknowledged by not accepting that as the only way forward.

It was expressed that the maker of the motion was transcribing the motion and that the meeting recording could be referred to for confirmation. Sean Karafin moved to call the question, Jay Powell seconded. Chair moved to hold the vote.

SUBSTITUTE MOTION (with Amendment and clarifications):

SEAB supports acceptance of the Business Plan (for the Formation of the Community Choice Aggregation Program) and the Staff Recommendation Memorandum (dated October 24, 2018) developed by the City of San Diego to achieve the 100% Renewable Energy goal. We acknowledge staff’s recommendation for a JPA, while not accepting that as the only way forward. We would ask City Council to base its decision on clearly stated General Fund protections, clearly stated investment in equity in communities of concern and the enumeration of the local economic impacts (Doug Kot/Eddie Price PASSED 6-0-1 Kendall Helm, SDGE Representative abstaining).

1. Staff Updates
	1. CAP Update (Cody Hooven)

This item was not taken.

* 1. Regulatory Update (Aaron Lu)

In Aaron Lu’s absence, this item was not taken.

1. New Business

None.

1. Suggested Items for Future Meetings

This item was not discussed.

1. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 11:57AM.

Note: An audio recording of this meeting is available upon request.