

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JUNE 22, 2023
HYBRID HEARING**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

Chairperson Tim Hutter called the meeting to order at 1:03 p.m. Chairperson Tim Hutter adjourned the meeting at 3:42 p.m.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING:

Chairperson Tim Hutter – present
Vice-Chairperson Kristi Byers – present
2nd Vice-Chairperson Michael Taylor – present
Boardmember Ann Woods – present
Boardmember Bruce Abrams – absent
Boardmember Carla Farley – present
Boardmember Courtney Ann Coyle – present
Boardmember David McCullough – absent
Boardmember Dr. Li-Rong Lilly Cheng – absent
Boardmember Mathew Winter – present
Boardmember Rammy Cortez – present

City Staff

Lindsey Sebastian, Deputy City Attorney – present
Raynard Abalos, Development Services Department – present
Elizabeth Shearer-Nguyen, Development Services Department – present
Suzanne Segur, Development Services Department – present
Shannon Anthony, Development Services Department – present
Alvin Lin, Development Services Department – present
Megan Walker, Development Services Department – present
Caroline Garcia, Legislative Recorder – present

Note: All decision makers attended the meeting in person. Staff and members of the public attended both in person and virtually.

ANNOUNCEMENTS/PUBLIC COMMENT

Boardmember Coyle announced via zoom at a remote location that she will be attending the board meeting today virtually due to just cause related to a family caregiving need that requires her to participate remotely under government code section 54953J2A. Pursuant to the Brown Act I am disclosing that there are no individuals 18 years of age or older present in the room with her. She would update the disclosure if it changed during the board meeting.

Ione Stiegler congratulates staff for having written a brilliant rebuttal to the appeal for the Mission Hills Library. The designation of this board was upheld on the Mission Hills Library. Also, she provided feedback on the timing and process of the designation request and is requesting to rescind the prior policy of limiting just four voluntary designations a month so that more can come before the board.

Chuck Kaminski just wanted to talk about SB10 and the Planning Commissions deferral for its decision making particularly with respect to historic districts and the timeline for historic districts.

Janet O'Dea provided her feedback on saving historic buildings.

BOARDMEMBERS COMMENT

Vice-Chairperson Kristi Byers commented on Ione Stiegler comment about the queue. Is it something that should be addressed at the Policy Subcommittee regarding changing the limit of the four projects being brought forward.

Chair Hutter welcomed new boardmember Rammy Cortez.

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

None

EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FOR APRIL 27, 2023

Chair Hutter made a correction on the minutes. No comments from boardmembers.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WOODS TO APPROVE THE MINUTES WITH CORRECTION FOR APRIL 27, 2023. Seconded by Boardmember Winter. The motion passed by a vote of 7-0-1 with Boardmembers Woods, Winter, Taylor, Farley, Coyle, Byers, Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmember Cortez abstaining, and with Boardmembers Abrams, Cheng, and McCullough absent.

STAFF REPORT

Raynard Abalos, Deputy Director, Development Services Department Congratulated the re-appointments of Boardmembers Abrams, McCullough, Taylor, and Winter, and introduced new Boardmember Rammy Cortez. Mr. Cortez is a small-scale urban infill developer and builder of more than 60,000 square-feet of transit-oriented missing middle-income housing in San Diego. He has served as a Young Leaders Group Board Member, former Co-Chair and current Advocacy Co-Chair of the Small-Scale Infill Development Product Council, a member of Circulate San Diego's

Policy Committee, and a member of LAI (Lambda Alpha International). He has a master's degree in Real Estate from the University of San Diego's Burnham-Moore's Center for Real Estate and is a CA Licensed General Contractor.

Lastly, with the FY24 budget restructuring he announced the Historical Resources Board will be leaving the Development Services Department to be moved to the renamed Historic Preservation Cultural Heritage Section, this will all be under the Environmental Policy and Public Spaces Division which is managed by Ms. Kelley Stanco in the Planning Department.

Elizabeth Shearer-Nguyen, Program Manager, Development Services Department also expressed her sincere gratitude to the historic staff for their encouragement guidance and patience with her this past year and a half, as she was one of the newest members to the team. She also thanked the HRB Boardmembers.

Suzanne Segur, Senior Planner from the Development Services Department reported that appeals were filed after the April 27th HRB meeting for the designation of the Donald and Gladys Clitsome/Lloyd Ruocco House located at 2228 33rd Street, the Fred Rohr/Ralph L. Frank House located at 555 San Fernando Street, and the Mamie and Oliver Evans/William Templeton Johnson House located at 4388 Ampudia Street. Staff are actively working on bringing these properties forward to the city council for resolution. The appeal of the historic designation of the Mission Hills Branch Library HRB 1384, located at 925 W. Washington Street was heard by the City Council on June 20th. The City Council voted to deny the appeal with a vote of 5-3 and the property remains historically designated.

A meeting of the Policy Subcommittee was held on May 8th and a discussion was had regarding potential changes to the board's adopted naming policy. We encourage people to check agendas and participate if they feel that they would like to. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, July 10th at 3pm. For information regarding the Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee, please visit the Development Services website.

Shannon Anthony, Senior Planner from the Development Services Department reported that the Design Assistance Subcommittee (DAS) met on June 7th and reviewed and provided comments on the proposed design of the new construction and restoration of the historic structure as part of the site development project of the HRB site number 1482 the Edward Newman Building located at 2906-2912 University Avenue. The Subcommittee requested the applicants restore the second story windows on Kansas Street back to the original Arch openings. The next Design Assistant Subcommittee (DAS) will be held on Wednesday, July 5th at 4pm, Conference Room 3B on the 3rd Floor Development Services Building.

REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE CONTINUED AND/OR WITHDRAWN

Item-2 - 1570 Virginia Way - CONTINUED TO JULY 27, 2023

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Item 8 - Ocean Beach Pier located at the western terminus of Niagara Avenue west of Ocean Front Way was pulled from the consent Agenda and was heard as the first discussion item.

Item 1 - Jerome and Joyce Shaw /Lloyd Ruocco House located at 7245 Rue de Roark was pulled from the consent Agenda and was heard as the second discussion item.

Item 2 - Helmhurst Cottage located at 1570 Virginia Way will be continued to the July 27, 2023 hearing.

Item 3 - George and Martha Saunders House located at 3120 Sterne Street was pulled from the consent Agenda and was heard as the third discussion item.

Item 4 – Torrey Apartments located at 4260 Campus Avenue was pulled from the consent Agenda and was heard as the fourth discussion item.

Item 5 – Frederic and Vida Rhodes/Alexander Schreiber House located at 3022 30th Street was pulled from the consent Agenda and was heard as the fifth discussion item.

Item 6 – Earnest Hausen and James Hutchins Spec House #1 located at 4240 Trias Street was pulled from the consent Agenda and was heard as the sixth discussion item.

Item 7 – T. Claude Ryan House #2 located at 2275 Evergreen Street was pulled from the consent Agenda and was heard as the last discussion item.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR HUTTER TO HEAR ITEMS ON THE AGENDA IN NUMERICAL ORDER, AFTER ITEM 8 IS HEARD FIRST. Seconded by Boardmember Byers. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Byers, Cortez, Coyle, Farley, Taylor, Winter, Woods, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmembers Abrams, Cheng, and McCullough absent.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

ITEM-1 JEROME AND JOYCE SHAW /LLOYD RUOCCO HOUSE (Trailed from May 2023)

City Council District: 1

Plan Area: La Jolla

Staff: Megan Walker

Public testimony in support received from Charles Kaminski.

No public testimony received in opposition.

Speaker slips in favor received on this item from Alexandra Wallace, Kiley Wallace, Dr. Ann Amukele, and Dr. Samuel Amukele.

Speaker slips in opposition received on this item from Ricardo Flores and Clint Daniels.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION 1:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO DESIGNATE THE JEROME AND JOYCE SHAW /LLOYD RUOCCO HOUSE LOCATED AT 7245 RUE DE ROARK AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1966 UNDER HRB CRITERIA C AND D. Seconded by Boardmember Farley. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Byers, Cortez, Coyle, Farley, Taylor, Winter, Woods, and Chair Hutter voting yea, with Boardmembers Abrams, Cheng, and McCullough absent.

MOTION 2:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO DESIGNATE THE RESOURCE UNDER CRITERION D WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1966 AS REPRESENTATIVE OF A NOTEABLE WORK OF MASTER LANDSCAPE ARCHITECT JOSEPH YAMADAS SPECIFICALLY THE RESOURCES IS A GOOD EXAMPLE OF YAMADAS CUSTOM RESIDENTIAL DESIGN WORK. PARTNERING WITH MASTER ARCHITECT LLOYD RUOKO AND THE OWNERS AT THE TIME OF CONSTRUCTION. ADDITIONALLY THE LANDSCAPE

DESIGN ALSO EXEMPLIFIES YAMADAS SIGNATURE DESIGN AESTHETICS INCLUDING USING A MEANDERING FRONT CONCRETE ENTRY ROLE OF THE NORTHWEST AND SOUTH FAÇADE LANDSCAPE PLANTINGS AND PLANT PALETTE INCLUDING WEEPING PAPER BARK TREES CHINESE FLAME TREE AND JAPANESE CHEESE WOOD SHRUBS. Seconded by Boardmember Winter. The motion failed by a vote of 5-2-1 with Boardmembers Byers, Cortez, Coyle, Winter, Woods voting yea, and with Boardmember Taylor and Chair Hutter voting no, and with Boardmember Farley abstaining, and with Boardmembers Abrams, Cheng, and McCullough absent.

Note: This item was heard as the second discussion item.

ITEM-2

HELMHURST COTTAGE

City Council District: 1

Plan Area: La Jolla

Staff: Suzanne Segur

No public testimony in support of the designation received.

No public testimony in opposition of the designation received.

Speaker slips in favor received on this item from Dennis Larson.

Speaker slips in opposition received on this item from Ricardo Flores and Clint Daniels.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR BYERS TO CONTINUE ITEM 2 TO THE JULY 27, 2023 HEARING. Seconded by Boardmember Coyle. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Byers, Cortez, Coyle, Farley, Taylor, Winter, Woods, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmembers Abrams, Cheng, and McCullough absent.

BREAK:

2:25 p.m. – 2:33 p.m.

ITEM-3

GEORGE AND MARTHA SAUNDERS HOUSE

City Council District: 2

Plan Area: Peninsula

Staff: Alvin Lin

No public testimony in support.

No public testimony received in opposition.

Speaker slips in favor received on this item from Wendy Tinsley Becker.

Speaker slips in opposition received on this item from Ricardo Flores and Clint Daniels.

BOARD ACTION:**MOTION 1:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER TAYLOR TO DESIGNATE THE GEORGE AND MARTHA SAUNDERS HOUSE LOCATED AT 3120 STERNE STREET AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1951-1955 UNDER HRB CRITERION C. THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES THE 1977 NORTH ELEVATION DINING ROOM ADDITION, THE 1996 SOUTH ELEVATION TWO-STORY ADDITION, AND THE 1996 EAST ELEVATION DECK. Seconded by Boardmember Byers. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Woods, Winter, Taylor, Farley, Coyle, Cortez, Byers, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmembers Abrams, Cheng, and McCullough absent.

MOTION 2:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO ESTABLISH GEORGE R. SAUNDERS AS A MASTER STRUCTURAL ENGINEER BASED ON HIS TECHNICAL ACHIEVEMENTS IN A VARIETY OF PUBLIC CIVIC AND INDUSTRIAL PROJECTS AND HIS AESTHETIC ACHIEVEMENTS USING CONCRETE AS A MATERIAL AND HIS ACKNOWLEDGEMENT BY DESIGN PEERS AND FORMAL AWARDS. FURTHER THE RESOURCE IS REPRESENTATIVE OF A NOTABLE WORK BY GEORGE R. SAUNDERS DESIGNING AND BUILDING AN EARLY PIONEERING MODERN ORGANIC GEOMETIRC HOME ON A CHALLENGING STEEPLY SLOPED LOT USING CONCRETE MASONRY WALLS STEEL POSTS AND CANTILEVERING WITH COMMANDING VIEWS OF SAN DIEGO BAY. ALSO, UNDER CRITERION D WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1951-1955. Seconded by Boardmember Byers. The motion failed by a vote of 5-3-0 with Boardmembers Woods, Winter, Coyle, Byers, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmembers Taylor, Farley, and Cortez voting no, and with Boardmembers Abrams, Cheng, and McCullough absent.

ITEM-4**TORREY APARTMENTS**

City Council District: 3

Plan Area: Uptown

Staff: Shannon Anthony

No public testimony in support.

No public testimony in opposition of the designation.

Speaker slips in favor received on this item from Eileen Magno and David Marshall.

Speaker slips in opposition received on this item from Ricardo Flores and Clint Daniels.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WINTER APPROVING STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE THE TORREY APARTMENTS LOCATED AT 4260 CAMPUS AVENUE AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1924-1926 UNDER HRB CRITERION A. Seconded by Boardmember Woods. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Byers, Cortez, Coyle, Farley, Taylor, Winter, Woods, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmembers Abrams, Cheng, and McCullough absent.

ITEM-5 VIDA RHODES/ALEXANDER SCHREIBER HOUSE

City Council District: 3

Plan Area: North Park

Staff: Alvin Lin

No public testimony in support.

No public testimony received in opposition.

Speaker slips in favor received on this item from Teresa Vessels

Speaker slips in opposition received on this item from Ricardo Flores and Clint Daniels.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER TAYLOR APPROVING STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE THE VIDA RHODES/ALEXANDER SCHREIBER HOUSE LOCATED AT 3022 30TH STREET AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1920 UNDER HRB CRITERION C AND CRITERION D. THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES THE DETACHED GARAGE, DETACHED 2007 SHED, DETACHED 2014 SHED, AND THE 2019 REAR ADDITION, ALL CONSTRUCTED OUTSIDE THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. Seconded by Boardmember Byers. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Woods, Winter, Taylor, Farley, Coyle, Cortez, Byers, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmembers Abrams, Cheng, and McCullough absent.

ITEM-6 EARNEST HAUSEN AND JAMES HUTCHINS SPEC HOUSE #1

City Council District: 3

Plan Area: Uptown

Staff: Megan Walker

Public testimony in support received from Ron May.

No public testimony received in opposition.

Speaker slips in favor received on this item from Donna McLoughlin, Ron May, and Pamela Molohon.

Speaker slips in opposition received on this item from Ricardo Flores and Clint Daniels.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WINTER APPROVING STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE THE EARNEST HAUSEN AND JAMES HUTCHINS SPEC HOUSE #1 LOCATED AT 4240 TRIAS STREET AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1925 UNDER HRB CRITERION C. THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES THE 1997 REAR ADDITION AND DECK CONSTRUCTED OUTSIDE THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. Seconded by Boardmember Farley. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Woods, Winter, Taylor, Farley, Coyle, Cortez, Byers, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmembers Abrams, Cheng, and McCullough absent.

ITEM-7

T. CLAUDE RYAN HOUSE #2

City Council District: 2

Plan Area: Peninsula

Staff: Suzanne Segur

No public testimony in support.

No public testimony received in opposition.

Speaker slips in favor received on this item from Wendy Tinsley Becker.

Speaker slips in opposition received on this item from Ricardo Flores and Clint Daniels.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR BYERS APPROVING STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE THE T. CLAUDE RYAN HOUSE #2 LOCATED AT 2275 EVERGREEN STREET AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE UNDER HRB CRITERION B WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1937-1962 AND UNDER HRB CRITERION C WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1937-1945. THIS DESIGNATION EXCLUDES THE REAR BASEMENT ADDITION CONSTRUCTED IN 2006. THE DESIGNATION INCLUDES THE GARAGE AND SECOND STORY ADDITION CONSTRUCTED IN 1945. Seconded by Boardmember Farley. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Byers, Cortez, Coyle, Farley, Taylor, Winter, Woods, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmembers Abrams, Cheng, and McCullough absent.

ITEM-8

OCEAN BEACH PIER

City Council District: 2

Plan Area: Ocean Beach

Staff: Suzanne Segur

Public testimony in support received from Bruce Coons.

No public testimony received in opposition.

Speaker slips in favor received on this item from Eileen Magno and David Marshall.

Speaker slips in opposition received on this item from Ricardo Flores and Cint Daniels.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WINTER APPROVING STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE THE OCEAN BEACH PIER LOCATED AT THE WESTERN TERMINUS OF NIAGARA AVENUE WEST OF OCEAN FRONT WAY AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE UNDER HRB CRITERION A WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1966-1977 AND UNDER HRB CRITERION C WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1966-1968. THE DESIGNATION INCLUDES THE RESTAURANT STRUCTURE AND LIFEGUARD WATCH TOWER. Seconded by Boardmember Byers. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Woods, Winter, Byers, Cortez, Farley, Taylor, Coyle, and Chair Hutter voting yea, with Boardmembers Abrams, Cheng, and McCullough absent.

Note: This item was heard as the first discussion item.