

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 28, 2023
HYBRID HEARING**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

Chairperson Tim Hutter called the meeting to order at 1:08 p.m. Vice-Chairperson Kristi Byers adjourned the meeting at 5:20 p.m.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING:

Chairperson Tim Hutter – present - *Left at 2:55pm*
Vice-Chairperson Kristi Byers – present
2nd Vice-Chairperson Michael Taylor – present
Boardmember Ann Woods – present
Boardmember Bruce Abrams – present – *Left at 4:35pm*
Boardmember Carla Farley – present
Boardmember Courtney Ann Coyle – present
Boardmember David McCullough – absent
Boardmember Dr. Li-Rong Lilly Cheng – present
Boardmember Mathew Winter – present
Boardmember Rammy Cortez – present

City Staff

Jeanne MacKinnon, Deputy City Attorney – present
Kelley Stanco, Planning Department – present
Suzanne Segur, Development Services Department – present
Shannon Anthony, Development Services Department – present
Alvin Lin, Development Services Department – present
Megan Walker, Development Services Department – present
Caroline Garcia, Legislative Recorder – present

Note: All decision makers attended the meeting in person. Staff and members of the public attended both in person and virtually.

ANNOUNCEMENTS/PUBLIC COMMENT

None

BOARDMEMBERS COMMENT

Boardmember Coyle wanted to note that she attended the dedication of a plaque in honor of the Kumeyaay at the eastern end of Coast Walk in La Jolla. In attendance were three generations of the Kumeyaay who are now feeling more welcome back along the coast. There is a QR Code where you can get more information. She recommends it when you're in La Jolla to check it out.

Boardmember Coyle wanted to share the untimely passing of Abel Silvas, a former HRB boardmember. He was a warrior for history with a great sense of humor, he also served on the County Historical Sites Board. We will be missing Abel.

Chair Hutter echoed boardmember Coyle's comment about Mr. Silvas. Even after his service on the HRB, he was a frequent contributor, participant, speaker, and an advocate, especially for the Presidio. We want to honor his memory.

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Boardmember Hutter will be recused from Item 1 – 820 Fort Stockton Drive due to financial conflict.

Boardmember Hutter disclosed that for Item 4 – 485 San Gorgonio Street, that Jan Driscoll was a colleague of his at Allen Atkins for several years, however, that will not influence his decision.

EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FOR AUGUST 24, 2023

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER FARLEY TO APPROVE THE MINUTES. Seconded by Vice-Chair Byers. The motion passed by a vote of 9-0-1 with Boardmembers Byers, Taylor, Abrams, Cortez, Coyle, Farley, Winter, Woods, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmember Cheng abstaining, and with and with Boardmember McCullough absent.

STAFF REPORT

Kelley Stanco, Deputy Director from the Planning Department just wanted to note there were some public comments and some interest from the Board in hearing more information about the report from the Independent Budget Analyst (IBA) on historic preservation program, and they will be attending the October HRB meeting to provide an informational item to kind of go over the results of their report with the Board and the Public. Also, she shared that in the next month or two, a fresh look at the historical preservation program, updating the historical preservation element, some of the regulations, and a comprehensive historical preservation plan as well as the website. More information to follow.

Suzanne Segur, Senior Planner from the Development Services Department reported that the next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, October 9th at 3pm. For information regarding the Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee, please visit the Development Services website.

Shannon Anthony, Senior Planner from the Development Services Department reported that the next Design Assistant Subcommittee (DAS) will be held on Wednesday, October 4th at 4pm, Conference Room 5C on the 5th Floor Development Services Building.

REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE CONTINUED AND/OR WITHDRAWN

None

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Item 2 – Robert and Marion Hill House located at 3104 Lytton Street was pulled from the Consent Agenda and was heard as the first discussion item.

Item 3 – Benjamin F. Dillingham III House located at 4494 Tivoli Street was pulled from the Consent Agenda and was heard as the second discussion item.

Item 4 – Lucile Hamilton/Robert Mosher House located at 485 San Gorgonio Street was pulled from the Consent Agenda and was heard as the third discussion item.

Item 5 – 3675 8th Avenue was heard as the fourth discussion item.

Item 1 – 820 Fort Stockton Drive was heard last as the discussion item.

BOARD ACTION: MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER FARLEY TO HEAR ITEMS 2 THROUGH 5 IN ORDER, AND ITEM 1 LAST. Seconded by Boardmember Coyle. The motion passed by a vote of 9-0-1 with Boardmembers Byers, Taylor, Abrams, Cheng, Cortez, Coyle, Farley, Winter, and Woods voting yea, and with Chair Hutter abstaining, and with McCullough absent.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

ITEM-1

820 FORT STOCKTON DRIVE

City Council District: 3

Plan Area: Uptown

Staff: Suzanne Segur

Public testimony in support received from Jennifer Ayala, Nicole Fletcher, Edward Kaen, James Kaen, Carolyn Toottey, Frank Falcon, Daniel Pegh, Jeffery Chime, James Gates, Tiffany Knox, Justin La Frantz, Scott Nelson, Robert Devlin Jr., Sharon Gehl, Mike Gehl, Gail Friedt, Pat Van Sloun, Hector Padilla, Karla Martinez, and Gail Friedt

Public testimony received in opposition received from Ione R. Stiegler, Barry Hager, Bill Makinson, Jane Ligon, Janet Cooper, Betty Hauck, Susan Dean, Carole Robert Self, Sharon Lieder, Robert Self, Carole Self, Stephen Shushan, Tobi de Frates, Lauren Carter, Kenneth Perilli, Gwen Aldridge, Celeste Williams, Sheila Cushman, Gini Pedersen, Chris Weaver, Lora Driscoll, Ron de Frates, Kirk Burgamy, Tracy Baker, Karen Ebner, Betty Schmucker, Lisa Mortensen, Pamela Molohon, Welton Jones, Jasoda Silva, Kate Callen, Anna DiMartino, James Chase, Penelope Perryman, Cheryl DeCorso, Kirsten Worley, Sandy Burgamy, Scott Johnston, Mary Brown, Stuart McGraw, George Franck, Ronald V. May, Peter Kempson, Julie Hyde, David Goldberg, Louise Rehling, Bruce Coons, Nancy Wilkins-Diehr, Janet O'Dea, Patricia Fillet, Patty Ducey-Brooks, Krista Bartlett, and Jennifer M.

Speaker slips in favor received on this item from Adam Ozarski, Amanda Vesco, Andrea Pegg, Andrew Jackson, Andrew Canter, Anne Farrell, Arpitha Shreedhara, Aura Finegold Fechter, Barkha Agarwalla, Brandon Landow, Brian Cording, Camille Despenas, Carolyn Toohey, Chad Harris, Chris Roberson,

Chris Carter, Clint Daniels, Colin Walsh, Cynthia Morgan-Reed, Dan Martorana, Daniel Fefferman, David Gatzke, David Iwashita, Dennis Larson, Dominique Sequeira, Edward Kaen, Frank Falcon, Garrick Oliver, George Blackwood, Grace Perkins, Gregory Mueller, Hinal Patel, Hooshang Kaen, James Kaen, James Hixson, Jamie Lumos, Jennifer Ayala, Jimmy Parker, Joan Knox, John Oconnor, Jon Ossie, Juan Martinez, Justin La Frantz, Karla Martinez, Katie Magnuson, Kevin Davies, Kevin Breedlove, Leah Yari, Leo Divinsky, Lexi Boskovich, Lizette Salazar, Marc Posthumus, Marie Burke Lia, Mark Zagami, Markus Levin, Matthew Cook, Maxwell Guinn, Meredith Kaplan, Michael Mulrooney, Michael Donovan, Michelle Surya, Mona Bisadi, Nicole Zappala, Pasquale Loele, Patrick Van Sloun, Peter Murray, Pisuttisuk Kittipongdaja, Pooja Masand, Richard Kettlewell, Ronald Harris, Sam Bellomio, Sarah Shinkle, Saum Vahdat, Scott Nelson, Shaun Shadgou, Sherry Kaen, Sheryl Kaplan, Stephen Knox, and Tiffany Knox.

Speaker slips received in opposition on this item from Aileen Teague, Alex Lazur, Allen Hazard, Amy Klecan, Andrea Bauer, Angeline Labrucherie, Ann Campbell, Anna Sorensen, Ashley Goldman, Bill Makinson, Bjorn Palenius, Bruce McLucas, Carin Howard, Carmela Simoncini, Celeste Williams, Charles Sykes, Cheryl DeCorso, Chris Lieder, Chris Weaver, Christian Farfan, Christina Ivany, Christina Woods, Christopher Carter, Cindy Yurkovich, Claudia Schwartz, Cole Ferguson, Dan Soderberg, Dave Nieman, David Wachtel, David Barron, David Goldberg, Davidde Burkhardt, Dean Glass, Deborah Quillin, Dorothy Patterson, Doug Law, Douglas Scott, Douglas Poole, Ed Chapman, Eric Jacobson, Gail Friedt, George Machian, Greg Donnelly, Gwen Aldridge, Helen Hodges, James Chase, James Mazzola, Jane Ligon, Janet O'Dea, Jean Hoeger, Jeana Preston, Jennifer Machian, John O'Connor, Jon Woods, Jose Letayf, Judith Machian, Karen Ebner, Karla Martinez, Kathryn Harris, Kay Dean, Kenneth Perilli, Kesler Randall, Kirk Burgamy, Kirsten Worley, Kristin Harms, Lauren Carter, Laurie Brindle, Laxmi DeLeo, Lilia Valeeva, Linda Lahmann, Linda Korb, Lisa Mortensen, Lora Driscoll, Malissa McGee, Margaret Day, Mark Chapman, Mary Donnelly, Mary Brown, Mary Koto, Mary Lyons, Mary Burgamy, Mary Anne Brown, Matt Stewart, Michelle Youngers, Nancy Wilkins-Diehr, Nicole Yoakum, Niels Hauff, Nil Emre, Patricia Paylor, Paul Englert, Penelope Perryman, Peter Kempson, Priscilla Ann Berge, Randy Magdaluyo, Rebecca Nieman, Richard Bellows, Robert Krimsky, Robert Bowen, Robin Greene, Ron De Frates, Rosemary Hansen, Sandy Burgamy, Sarah Layne, Sheila Cushman, Shelly Petersen, Sherri Schottlaender, Susan White, Susan Stocker, Susan Dean, Susan McIntosh, Susan Johnston, Susan Justin, Susanne Friedrich, Suzanne Temple, Timothy Driscoll, Tina Valle, Tobi De Frates, Tony Generas, Tracy Baker, Vincent Ripol, Welton Jones, William Dietrich, and Zach Thompson.

BREAK: 5:02 p.m. – 5:11 p.m.

BOARD ACTION:

Motion 1:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CORTEZ TO MOVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO NOT DESIGNATE THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 820 FORT STOCKTON DRIVE. Second by Boardmember Taylor. The motion failed by a vote of 3-5-0 with Boardmembers Taylor, Cortez, and Vice-Chair Byers voting yea; Boardmembers Cheng, Winter, Coyle, Farley, Woods voting no; Chair Hutter recusing, and Boardmembers McCullough and Abrams absent.

Motion by Boardmembers Coyle to extend the HRB meeting to 5:30 pm. Second by Boardmember Cortez. The motion passed by a vote 6-2-0 with Boardmembers Winter, Coyle, Farley, Woods, Cortez, and Vice-Chair Byers voting yea; Boardmembers Cheng and Taylor voting no; Chair Hutter recusing, and Boardmembers McCullough and Abrams absent.

Motion 2:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO DESIGNATE 820 FORT STOCKTON DRIVE UNDER CRITERION D AS A RESOURCE THAT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF A NOTABLE WORK OF MASTER ARCHITECT WILLIAM H. WHEELER AS NOTED IN EVIDENCE BEFORE OUR BOARD INCLUDING THE MAY 22, 1912, EVENING TRIBUNE ARTICLE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1912. SPECIFICALLY, THE RESOURCE DESIGNED BY WHEELER IS A RARE, ONE-STORY CRAFTSMAN DUPLEX ON A VERY VISIBLE CORNER WITH TWO ENTRANCES, TWO FRONT PORCHES, TWO CHIMNEYS, IN ACCORDANCE WITH OUR GUIDELINES UNDER CRITERION D, THE PROPERTY RETAINS THE MAJORITY OF THE FEATURES THAT ILLUSTRATE THE CRAFTSMAN STYLE RELATIVE TO MASSING, SPATIAL RELATIONSHIPS, PATTERN OF WINDOWS, PROPORTION, PATTERN OF DOORS AND TEXTURE OF MATERIALS. Second by Boardmember Woods. The motion failed by a vote of 5-3-0 with Boardmembers Woods, Farley, Coyle, Winter, and Cheng voting yea, and with Boardmembers Cortez, Taylor, and Vice-Chair Byers voting no; Chair Hutter recusing, and Boardmembers McCullough and Abrams absent.

Note: This item was heard as the last discussion item.

ITEM-2

ROBERT AND MARION HILL HOUSE

City Council District: 2

Plan Area: Peninsula

Staff: Megan Walker

Public testimony in support received from Ron May, Pamela Molohon, and Bruce Coons.

Public testimony received in opposition from Clint Daniels and Ricardo Flores.

No speaker slips received in support of this item.

Speaker slips received in opposition on this item from Clint Daniels and Ricardo Flores.

BOARD ACTION:

CONSENT MOTION BY CHAIR HUTTER TO DESIGNATE THE DESIGNATE THE ROBERT AND MARION HILL HOUSE LOCATED AT 3104 LYTTON STREET AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1929 UNDER HRB CRITERION C. THIS DESIGNATION EXCLUDES THE 2021 LAUNDRY ROOM ADDITION CONSTRUCTED OUTSIDE OF THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. THE DESIGNATION INCLUDES THE ORIGINAL COURTYARD WALL AND PORTICO. Seconded by Boardmember Byers. The motion passed by a vote of 10-0-0 with Boardmembers Byers, Taylor, Abrams, Cheng, Cortez, Coyle, Farley, Winter, Woods, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmember McCullough absent.

Note: This item was pulled from the Consent Agenda and was heard as the first discussion item.

ITEM-3

BENJAMIN F. DILLINGHAM III HOUSE

City Council District: 2

Plan Area: Peninsula

Staff: Alvin Lin

Public testimony in support of the designation received from Charles Kaminski, Kiley Wallace, and Bruce Coons.

No public testimony received in opposition on this item.

Speaker slips in favor received on this item from Charles Kaminski, Kiley Wallace, Alexandra Wallace, Kathy Hailey, and Rob Hailey.

Speaker slips received in opposition on this item from Ricardo Flores.

BOARD ACTION:

CONSENT MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER ABRAMS TO DESIGNATE THE BENJAMIN F. DILLINGHAM III HOUSE LOCATED AT 4494 TIVOLI STREET AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1983 TO 2017 UNDER HRB CRITERION B. THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES THE REAR YARD POOL AND COVERED TERRACE STRUCTURE, WHICH WERE CONSTRUCTED OUTSIDE THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. Seconded by Boardmember Coyle. The motion passed by a vote of 10-0-0 with Boardmembers Cortez, Woods, Farley, Taylor, Byers, Abrams, Coyle, Winter, Cheng, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmember McCullough absent.

Note: This item was pulled from the Consent Agenda and was heard as the second discussion item.

ITEM-4

LUCILE HAMILTON/ROBERT MOSHER HOUSE

City Council District: 2

Plan Area: Peninsula

Staff: Alvin Lin

Public testimony in support of the designation received from Jennifer Ayala and James Gates.

No public testimony received in opposition on this item.

Speaker slips in favor received on this item from Jan and John Driscoll and Jennifer Ayala.

Speaker slips received in opposition on this item from Clint Daniels and Ricardo Flores.

BOARD ACTION:

CONSENT MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WINTER TO DESIGNATE THE LUCILE HAMILTON/ROBERT MOSHER HOUSE LOCATED AT 485 SAN GORGONIO STREET AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1967-2015 UNDER HRB CRITERIA C AND D WITH ORGANIC GEOMETRIC FEATURES INCLUDE A SITE-SPECIFIC DESIGN, TAKING ADVANTAGE OF VIEWS AND OTHER SITE FEATURES. Seconded by Boardmember Cheng. The motion passed by a vote of 10-0-0 with Boardmembers Cheng, Winter, Coyle, Abrams, Byers, Taylor, Farley, Woods, Cortez, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmember McCullough absent.

Note: This item was pulled from the Consent Agenda and was heard as the third discussion item.

ITEM-5

KATHERINE AND RUDOLF BLANKENBURG/WILLIAM STERLING HEBBARD HOUSE

City Council District: 3

Plan Area: Uptown

Staff: Shannon Anthony

No public testimony in support received on this item.

Public testimony received in opposition on this item from John Hyché, Brian Briones and Jeffrey Judd, and Wendy L. Tinsley Becker.

No speaker slips in favor received on this item.

No speaker slips received in opposition on this item.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO DESIGNATE THE KATHERINE AND RUDOLF BLANKENBURG/WILLIAM STERLING HEBBARD HOUSE LOCATED AT 3675 8TH AVENUE UNDER HRB CRITERION D WITH THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1908 AS A NOTABLE EXAMPLE OF MASTER ARCHITECT WILLIAM STERLING HEBBARD, INDIVIDUALLY, DURING HIS YEARS OF A SOLO PRACTICE. THERE IS ONLY ONE CURRENTLY DESIGNATED PROPERTY IN THE CRAFTSMAN STYLE ATTRIBUTED TO HUBBARD ALONE, THEREFORE, THIS CRAFTSMAN BUNGALOW STYLE HOME IS A RARE AND NOTABLE EXAMPLE OF HEBBARD'S WORK AS A SOLO PRACTITIONER IN THE SAN DIEGO AREA USING THIS ARCHITECTURAL STYLE. THE PROPERTY HAS CRAFTSMAN FEATURES BOTH TYPICAL, AS WELL AS SOME UNUSUAL CRAFTSMAN FEATURES INCLUDING THE COCKPIT STYLE OF ORIENTATION. Seconded by Boardmember Byers. The motion passed by a vote of 7-3-0 with Boardmembers Cheng, Winter, Coyle, Byers, Farley, Woods, and Cortez voting yea, and Abrams, Taylor, and Chair Hutter voting no, and with Boardmember McCullough absent.

Note: This item was heard as the fourth discussion item.

BREAK: 2:55 p.m. – 3:14 p.m.