



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: January 12, 2023 REPORT NO. HRB-23-004

HEARING DATE: January 26, 2023

SUBJECT: **ITEM #4 – Erby and Mabel Deputy House**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Thoron Saraniero Living Trust 04-16-21; represented by Heritage Architecture & Planning

LOCATION: 4603 56th Street, College Area Community, Council District 9
APN 466-582-0900

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Erby and Mabel Deputy House located at 4603 56th Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Erby and Mabel Deputy House located at 4603 56th Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1936 under HRB Criterion C. The designation includes the garage, the brick site wall, and the brick barbeque, which date to the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Colonial Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1936 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an accentuated front entry with a Georgian-style entablature and pilasters, a cross-gabled roof form, a paneled front door, a single-line of transom lights over the door, bay windows with classical cornice molding, and six-over-nine/six-over-six double hung windows with wood shutters.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource is located on a corner lot in the College Area community containing a two-story single-family residence with a garage.

The historic name of the resource, the Erby and Mabel Deputy House, has been identified as consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Erby C. Deputy and Mabel D. Deputy, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Heritage Architecture & Planning, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but not under HRB Criterion D. This determination is consistent with the [Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria](#), as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource was constructed in 1936 in the Colonial Revival style, specifically with Georgian-style influences. The building features a two-story volume with an attached one-story rear wing and a garage, thus forming an irregular "U"-shaped plan. The courtyard includes a veranda that wraps around portions of the east and south facades. The roof is cross-gabled and covered with composition shingles. Built above street grade, the residence is surrounded by a brick site wall on the west and the south elevations. A vinyl fence screens the south elevation from the public view. The residence's exterior is clad in stucco, typical throughout, except for the ground-floor courtyard elevations that were sided with channel groove wood siding. An original brick barbecue is extant in the brick-paved courtyard.

The primary façade faces west and features an accentuated front entry with paneled pilasters, a classical crown (entablature), and a row of small transom windows below the crown. The windows and doors on this elevation are spaced evenly, although the fenestration is overall asymmetrical; the front door is off-center. Fenestration comprises six-over-nine and six-over-six divided-lite wooden double hung windows and a single deep inset four-lite window. The shallow roof eave overhang reveals rounded rafter tails below. The south elevation of the 2-story structure features a rectilinear bay window with classical cornice molding. The courtyard elevations (south and east) include three French doors, a bay window, and a service entry. Styling on the French doors and service entry is similar, with divided-lite glazing and decorative paneling. A stucco-clad chimney with a simple brick dentil course is also present. A breezeway with an original wooden gate connects the residence with the garage. The garage has a hipped roof, a stucco exterior, and an original birdhouse cupola.

Modifications to the subject building include the 1998 addition of a vinyl fence, 2018 solar panels, and 2020 site improvements (driveway repave, fence replacement, brick wall repair and reconfiguration). Undated alterations include the front door light fixture replacement, roof replacement from wood shingle to composition shingles, in-kind veranda porch support replacement, and the north elevation A/C unit installation. Overall, these modifications do not significantly impair the integrity of design, materials, workmanship, or feeling as it relates to HRB Criterion C.

Following the Centennial Exposition of 1876 America experienced a rebirth of interest in its colonial past. Primarily popular from 1880 to 1955, Colonial Revival buildings reference the early English and Dutch homes of the Atlantic seaboard, particularly the Georgian and Federal styles. As with their prototypes, Colonial Revival structures generally have a symmetrical front façade with the principal areas of elaboration being entrances, windows and cornices. Roofs can be hipped, gable or gambrel and some variations feature a center gable projecting slightly from the primary façade. One-story

side wings with flat roofs are common. Windows are typically double-hung sash with multi-pane glazing in one or both sashes and are commonly found in pairs, triples, or bay windows. Front-facing gambrel roofs were most common in earlier revival houses while side gambrels became popular in the 1920s and '30s.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Colonial Revival style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including an accentuated front entry with a Georgian-style entablature and pilasters, cross-gabled roof form, paneled front door, a single-line of transom lights over the door, bay windows with classical cornice molding, and six-over-nine/six-over-six double hung windows with wood shutters. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Kenneth S. Wing is being proposed as a Master Architect. The subject property is being proposed as a notable work of a Master. Within the historical context of San Diego, the information provided in the nomination does not sufficiently demonstrate Wing's eligibility as a Master Architect.

Born in Colorado, Kenneth S. Wing Sr. FAIA moved to Long Beach, California in 1918. By 1925, he had obtained a degree in architecture from the University of California and worked for Meyer and Holler, a local architectural firm. In 1930, Wing opened his own architectural firm. Wing was established as a Master Architect in the City of Long Beach, where over a 60-year career, he designed various residential, commercial, and institutional buildings for that city. Several of his works are in Palm Springs, Lake Arrowhead, and Orange County. The subject property, located at 4603 56th Street, is one of two of his known works in the City of San Diego; the other building is the College Avenue Baptist Church, constructed in the 1950s. Wing has designed buildings in various styles, including Colonial Revival, Ranch, Minimal Traditional, Contemporary, and International. In 1953, he was awarded an AIA fellowship.

Due to the lack of information that speaks to the significance of the subject property within the context of San Diego, the scarcity of Wing's projects within the City, and the lack of supporting information, including publications, press, and awards that elevates the subject building as a work of a Master, staff does not recommend designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion D.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Erby and Mabel Deputy House located at 4603 56th Street be designated with a period of significance of 1936 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Colonial Revival style. The designation includes the garage, the brick site wall, and the brick barbeque, which date to the period of significance.



Alvin Lin
Assistant Planner



Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison
Development Services Department

al/SS

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 1/26/2023

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/26/2023, to consider the historical designation of the **Erby and Mabel Deputy House** (owned by Thoron Saraniero Living Trust 04-16-21, 4603 56th Street, San Diego, CA 92115) located at **4603 56th Street, San Diego, CA 92115**, APN: **466-582-09-00**, further described as BLK D LOT 9 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the **Erby and Mabel Deputy House** on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Colonial Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an accentuated front entry with a Georgian-style entablature and pilasters, a cross-gabled roof form, a paneled front door, a single-line of transom lights over the door, bay windows with classical cornice molding, and six-over-nine/six-over-six double hung windows with wood shutters. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall include the garage, the brick site wall, and the brick barbecue, which date to the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _____
TIM HUTTER, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
Deputy City Attorney

RECORDING REQUESTED BY
CITY OF SAN DIEGO
DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
ATTN: HRB SECRETARY
1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

RESOLUTION NUMBER **N/A**

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

4603 56th Street, San Diego, CA 92115

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER **466-582-09-00**

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER **0**