



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: February 9, 2022 REPORT NO. HRB-22-009

HEARING DATE: February 24, 2022

SUBJECT: **ITEM #02 - P-37-012581 (CA-SDI-12581/SDM-W-6)**

RESOURCE INFO: California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link

APPLICANT: Alexandria Real Estate Equities, Inc. represented by HELIX Environmental Planning, Inc.

LOCATION: Address Restricted, University Community Plan Area, Council District 1

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the site above as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate P-37-012581 (CA-SDI-12581/SDM-W-6) as a historical resource under HRB Criterion A. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource is a special element of the City's archeological and cultural development. Specifically, P-37-012581 contains deep and intact deposits rich in cultural material with the potential to address important research questions with pockets of the deposit reaching a depth of 160 centimeters. Dr. James Moriarty described the site as one of the largest and richest of the La Jolla period that he had excavated and compared it to the Scripps Estates site (P-37-000525), which yielded a great deal of important research information.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed development project, consistent with San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212. The site, which has previously been excavated, is located on the Torrey Pines Mesa in an area with known archaeological and cultural significance.

ANALYSIS

A cultural resources study was prepared by HELIX Environmental Planning, Inc. (HELIX), which concludes that the resource P-37-012581 (CA-SDI-12581/SDM-W-6) is significant under HRB Criterion

A and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - *Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.*

Archaeological site P-37-012581 was initially recorded by Malcolm Rogers of the San Diego Museum of Man (now Museum of Us) in the 1920s as SDM-W-6; it is one of a series of archaeological sites recorded on the Torrey Pines Mesa. The site has been the subject of several excavations since that time. Rogers described the site as a highland shell midden covering four acres; he apparently excavated at least two 6-foot-by-6-foot test units there. The site record for SDM-W-6 notes "usual cobble hearths" and indicates one "house pit is cut into the bottom level"; he also noted one "Canalino [Channel Islands] chalcedony broken blade". The site record notes that no burials were found.

In 1961, Dr. James Moriarty and a group of students from University of California, San Diego conducted an excavation at SDM-W-6. Moriarty recalled that as many as 30 units were hand-excavated on a grid system, but no map of the excavation units was found, nor were any field notes. Dr. Moriarty noted that SDM-W-6 was similar to the Scripps Estates site (P-37-000525 [CA-SDI-525]), which yielded a significant amount of important archaeological data. According to Moriarty, six burials were uncovered and recorded during his excavations at SDM-W-6 and were left in place. Moriarty recalled them as being flexed burials.

Information regarding Moriarty's excavation was collected by Richard Carrico, who led an excavation conducted by WESTEC Services, Inc. (WESTEC) at a portion of SDM-W-6 in 1977. In describing SDM-W-6, Carrico wrote:

In summary, the data collected for this study coupled with the earlier excavation of W-6 (Moriarty 1976: Personal Communication) establish the repeatedly-occupied, intensive-use nature of the site. Cultural debris indicative of a major activity (campsite) area included human burials, beads, stone tools, shell refuse, grinding equipment, and an extensive midden [Carrico 1977b:44].

The 1992 RECON report (Eighmey and Cheever 1992) documents testing conducted at P-37-012581 in 1991, consisting of 27 one-meter-by-one-meter test units and 28 shovel test pits. Surface cultural material collected includes flaked lithic tools, cores, debitage, ground stone, and shell. Midden soils were noted in some areas, but much of the site had undergone extensive disturbance from agriculture, grading associated with the agricultural research station, roads, construction, and landscaping. Despite the disturbances, however, the site was noted as retaining areas of intact deposits and possessing important research potential. The site was assessed as a significant resource under CEQA and City guidelines, and an area of archaeological constraints was developed; the Balit-CBC project was redesigned to avoid impacts to the constrained area, which includes what is now the biological open space and the parking area immediately west of it.

As previously noted, several excavations have identified intact cultural deposits at P-37-012581, and Dr. James Moriarty considered the site to be similar to the highly significant Scripps Estates site. Few

similar sites have been excavated in the Torrey Pines Mesa area, and this area is now highly developed; thus, P-37-012581 has the potential to address research questions regarding settlement and subsistence patterns and chronology for a deeper understanding of the prehistoric use of this area of the coast. Analyses such as protein residue analysis were not in use at the time of prior excavations at the site but can now be utilized to provide important information to address these research avenues. The presence of intact subsurface deposits (even in pockets) cannot be overstated, as so much of the San Diego region has been subject to extensive bioturbation, as well as other post-depositional factors that disturb site stratigraphy.

Due to the developed nature of the site area, with the only exposed ground surface being within the existing open space area, the HELIX study relied on analysis of the past excavation efforts undertaken at P-37-012581 to assess impacts to the resource based on the currently proposed project, as well as assessing the site in relation to HRB criteria.

Significance Statement: In summary, P-37-012581 (CA-SDI-12581/SDM-W-6) was previously assessed as a significant resource under CEQA (Eighmey and Cheever 1992), and the existing open space was designed to protect what was thought to be the most significant portion of the site. Despite extensive past disturbance, the site has been demonstrated to retain an undisturbed stratigraphic component. Based on the quantity and quality of materials, the presence of intact deposits, the potential for Native American burials, and the potential role of this site in understanding regional settlement patterns, SDM-W-6 should be considered an important scientific resource [Eighmey and Cheever 1992:69]. Due to the significant nature of this site, staff recommends designation as a Historical Resource under HRB Criterion A.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the site in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. Because the historical resource does not include any above-ground buildings or structures, this property, should it be designated, would not at this time qualify for the Mills Act Program.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted, it is recommended that P-37-012581 (CA-SDI-12581/SDM-W-6) be designated as a historical resource under HRB Criterion A as a special element of the City's archaeological and cultural development.



Elizabeth Shearer-Nguyen
Senior Planner



Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison
Development Services Department

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Cultural Resource Study (under separate cover)
3. Confidential Appendix to Applicant's Cultural Resources Study (under separate cover)

RESOLUTION NUMBER
ADOPTED ON 2/24/2022

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 2/24/2022, to consider the historical designation of **P-37-012581 (CA-SDI-12581/SDM-W-6)** (owned by Alexandria Real Estate Equities, Inc., 10996 Torreyana Road, Suite 250, San Diego, CA 92121) located at **Not permitted to list, , CA** , APN: **000-000-00-00**, further described as in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. ,** and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of P-37-012581 (CA-SDI-12581/SDM-W-6) on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION A as a special element of the City's archeological and cultural development. Specifically, P-37-012581 contains deep and intact deposits rich in cultural material with the potential to address important research questions with pockets of the deposit reaching a depth of 160 centimeters. Dr. James Moriarty described the site as one of the largest and richest of the La Jolla period that he had excavated and compared it to the Scripps Estates site (P-37-000525), which yielded a great deal of important research information. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. .**

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _____
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
Deputy City Attorney

RECORDING REQUESTED BY
CITY OF SAN DIEGO
DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
ATTN: HRB SECRETARY
1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

RESOLUTION NUMBER

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

Not permitted to list, , CA

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER **000-000-00-00**

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER